
How Pakistan is progressing towards Achieving Universal Quality Primary Education?

How Pakistan is progressing towards Achieving Universal Quality Primary Education?

Ministry of Federal Education and Professional Training
Government of Pakistan
Islamabad
September 2015
Team Members

Core Team
Mr. Muhammad Khan Khichi, Director General AEPAM
Mr. Nasir Amin, Incharge NEMIS, AEPAM
Mr. Yasir Irfan, Sr. Programmer, NEMIS, AEPAM
Mr. Bilal Kakli, Programmer, NEMIS, AEPAM
Mr. Zubair Farooq, Assistant Programmer, NEMIS, AEPAM

Authors
Mr. Yasir Irfan, Sr. Programmer, NEMIS, AEPAM
Mr. Arshad Saeed Khan, Consultant

Support Team
Mr. Adeel Zia, Assistant Programmer, NEMIS, AEPAM
Mr. Muhammad Tariq, DEO, NEMIS, AEPAM

Design and Layout
Mr. Yasir Irfan, Sr. Programmer

Editing
Mr. Zubair Farooq, Assistant Programmer

Cataloging in Publication Data

Main entry under title
Annual Progress Report (2013-14)
On Implementation of National Plan of Action to
Accelerate Education-Related MDGs (2013-16) by NEMIS-AEPAM
(AEPAM Publication No. 273)
1. Education Indicators 2. National Plan of Action – Pakistan
ISBN: 978-969-444-100-9
# Table of Contents

**Foreword** ................................................................................................................................. 1

**Acknowledgements** ..................................................................................................................... 3

**Executive Summary** .................................................................................................................... 4

**National Scenario** ......................................................................................................................... 6

1. Context ............................................................................................................................................ 6

2. Education-Related MDGs: Goal, Target, and Indicators ................................................................. 6

3. Status of MDG 2 in Pakistan during 2011-12 .................................................................................. 7


   4.1. Targets of NPA to Accelerate Education-Related MDGs in Pakistan (2013-16): ..................... 8

   4.2. Strategies of NPA: .................................................................................................................... 8

   4.3. Financial, Human, and Material Requirements for NPA: ......................................................... 9

5. Aim and Objectives of Measuring Progress of NPA ..................................................................... 10

6. Overall Approach and Methodology for Measuring Progress of NPA during 2013-14 in Pakistan ......................................................................................................................... 10

   6.1. Overall Approach for Measuring Progress: ............................................................................ 10

   6.2. Methodology and Sources of Data for Measuring Progress: ................................................. 11

7. Progress of Implementation of NPA: Achievements and Shortfalls 2013-14 ............................... 11

   7.1. Education Indicators: Achievements and Shortfalls .............................................................. 11

   7.2. Implementation of NPA Strategies: Achievements and Shortfalls: ....................................... 14

   7.3. Measuring Progress with respect to Budget and Expenditure on Education: ....................... 17

8. Summary of Conclusions ............................................................................................................... 18

   8.1. Overall Progress ..................................................................................................................... 18

   8.2. Problems, Bottlenecks, and Challenges ................................................................................. 19

   8.3. New Initiatives and Rays of Hope .......................................................................................... 19

9. Learning from Others: Good Practices and Success Stories ......................................................... 21

   9.1. Complete Free Education....................................................................................................... 21

   9.2. School Feeding Programmes (Mid-Day Meals or School Lunch) ........................................... 22

   9.3. Monetary Incentives: Payment of Stipend or Conditional Cash Transfers (CCT) ............... 22

   9.4. Political Will and Leadership for Education .......................................................................... 23

   9.5. Constitutional Responsibility of the State: Supporting Provinces and Areas ....................... 24

10. Way Forward: Recommendations ............................................................................................... 24

**Punjab** ............................................................................................................................................ 27

**School Participation** ..................................................................................................................... 27
How close is Punjab to NPA Targets? ............................................................................................... 27
How Punjab Has Taken-up NPA? ........................................................................................................ 29
Strategy wise details of implementation of National Plan of Action................................................. 31
Strategy a: Enrolment of new students in existing schools (under-utilized/closed schools) (70% of all new enrolment) .................................................................................................................... 31
Strategy b: Enrolment of new students in formal schools through provision of an additional classroom (10% of existing schools) .................................................................................................................................................................................. 33
Strategy c: Enrolment of children in new schools (20% of all new enrolments) .......................... 34
Strategy d: Targeted Incentives for access and retention for disadvantaged groups and girls (15% of all enrolments) ................................................................................................................. 35
Conclusion and Recommendations .................................................................................................. 35

Sindh ..................................................................................................................................................... 37
School Participation .......................................................................................................................... 37
How close is Sindh to NPA Targets? .................................................................................................. 37
How Sindh Has Taken-up NPA? ........................................................................................................ 39
Strategy wise details of implementation of National Plan of Action in Sindh .................................. 41
Strategy a: Enrolment of new students in existing schools (under-utilized/closed schools) (50% of all new enrolment) .................................................................................................................... 41
Strategy b: Enrolment of new students in formal schools through provision of an additional classroom (10% of existing schools) .................................................................................................................................................................................. 43
Strategy c: Enrolment of children in new schools (40% of all new enrolments) .......................... 44
Strategy d: Targeted Incentives for access and retention for disadvantaged groups and girls (15% of all enrolments) ................................................................................................................. 45
Conclusion and Recommendations .................................................................................................. 45

Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KP) ................................................................................................................... 47
School Participation .......................................................................................................................... 47
How close is KP to NPA Targets? ...................................................................................................... 47
How KP Has Taken-up NPA? ............................................................................................................ 50
Strategy wise details of implementation of National Plan of Action................................................. 51
Strategy a: Enrolment of new students in existing schools (under-utilized/closed schools) (50% of all new enrolment) .................................................................................................................... 51
Strategy b: Enrolment of new students in formal schools through provision of an additional classroom (10% of existing schools) .................................................................................................................................................................................. 53
Strategy c: Enrolment of children in new schools (40% of all new enrolments) .......................... 54
Strategy d: Targeted Incentives for access and retention for disadvantaged groups and girls (15% of all enrolments) ................................................................................................................. 55
Conclusion and Recommendations .................................................................................................. 56

Balochistan ...................................................................................................................................... 58

School Participation ............................................................................................................................ 58

How close is Balochistan to NPA Targets? ......................................................................................... 58

Strategy wise details of implementation of National Plan of Action ................................................ 62

  Strategy a: Enrolment of new students in existing schools (under-utilized/closed schools) ......... 62
  Strategy b: Enrolment of new students in formal schools through provision of an additional classroom ................................................................. 64
  Strategy c: Enrolment of children in new schools (50% of all new enrolments) ......................... 65
  Strategy d: Targeted Incentives for access and retention for disadvantaged groups and girls (15% of all enrolments) ................................................................................. 67

Conclusion and Recommendations .................................................................................................. 67

Azad Jammu & Kashmir (AJ&K) ........................................................................................................... 69

School Participation ............................................................................................................................ 69

How close is AJK to NPA Targets? ..................................................................................................... 69

How AJ&K Has Taken-up NPA? ......................................................................................................... 72

Strategy wise details of implementation of National Plan of Action ................................................ 73

  Strategy a: Enrolment of new students in existing schools (under-utilized/closed schools) ......... 73
  Strategy b: Enrolment of new students in formal schools through provision of an additional classroom ................................................................. 75
  Strategy c: Enrolment of children in new schools (20% of all new enrolments) ......................... 76
  Strategy d: Targeted Incentives for access and retention for disadvantaged groups and girls (15% of all enrolments) ................................................................................. 78

Conclusion and Recommendations .................................................................................................. 78

Gilgit-Baltistan ...................................................................................................................................... 80

School Participation ............................................................................................................................ 80

How close is Gilgit-Baltistan to NPA Targets? .................................................................................. 80

How Gilgit-Baltistan Has Taken-up the NPA? .................................................................................. 82

Strategy wise details of implementation of National Plan of Action ................................................ 83

  Strategy a: Enrolment of new students in existing schools (under-utilized/closed schools) (70% of new enrolment) ................................................................. 83
  Strategy b: Enrolment of new students in formal schools through provision of an additional classroom (in 10% of existing schools) ................................................................. 85
  Strategy c: Enrolment of children in new schools (20% of all new enrolments) ......................... 86
  Strategy d: Targeted Incentives for access and retention for disadvantaged groups and girls (15% of all enrolments) ................................................................................. 87
Federally Administered Tribal Areas (FATA)

School Participation

How close is FATA to Targets of NPA?

How FATA Has Taken-up NPA?

Strategy wise details of implementation of National Plan of Action

Strategy a: Enrolment of new students in existing schools (under-utilized/closed schools)

Strategy b: Enrolment of new students in formal schools through provision of an additional classroom

Strategy c: Enrolment of children in new schools (20% of all new enrolments)

Strategy d: Targeted Incentives for access and retention for disadvantaged groups and girls (15% of all enrolments)

Conclusion and Recommendations

Islamabad Capital Territory (ICT)

School Participation

How close is ICT to NPA Targets?

How ICT Has Taken-up the NPA?

Strategy wise details of implementation of National Plan of Action

Strategy a: Enrolment of new students in existing schools (under-utilized/closed schools) (50% to 60% of new enrolment)

Strategy b: Enrolment of new students in formal schools through provision of an additional classroom (in 15% of existing schools)

Strategy c: Enrolment of children in new schools (35-40% of all new enrolments)

Strategy d: Targeted Incentives for access and retention for disadvantaged groups and girls (15% of all enrolments)

Conclusion and Recommendations
Foreword

The National Plan of Action to Accelerate Education-Related MDGs 2013-16 (NPA) was developed in 2013 in consultation with provincial/regional Education Departments. Each Province/Region developed its own plan of action to be included in the NPA. The purpose of National Plan of Action was to accelerate the progress towards the achievement of Education-Related MDGs by the year 2015. New targets were set for the year 2015 by each province and region with the implementation plan formulated in line with the four strategies adopted as per plan. The National Plan of Action envisaged that 91% of children of age group 5-9 would be in schools and only 9% of children of age group 5-9 would still remain out-of-school by the year 2015.

Since the development of NPA, no comprehensive study was carried out in order to review the progress made towards the achievement of set targets. The Ministry of Federal Education and Professional Training initiated the process to monitor the progress made by the Provinces/Regions in the light of NPA. The responsibility was entrusted to the National Education Management Information System (NEMIS) to conduct Annual Progress Review Meetings to evaluate implementation progress/status of NPA in each province/region and prepare a report to reflect 1) current situation of each province/region regarding Out-of-School Children based on recent data; 2) steps taken by provinces/regions on implementation of NPA; 3) challenges faced by provinces/regions in implementation of NPA; and 4) future plans to achieve the targets.

Annual Progress Review Meetings on Implementation of NPA were carried out in all provinces/regions with the Education Managers and other stakeholders at each provincial/regional headquarter. These meetings were jointly organized by the Ministry of Federal Education and Professional Training and Provincial/Regional Education Departments.

It has transpired that although a substantial progress across the country has made since last two years, but not enough to achieve the NPA’s targets. Despite all the efforts by the Provincial and Regional Education Departments and the civil society the country has not been able to achieve the targets of NPA. About 23% of targeted children are still out-of-school. On the positive side, the number of out-of-school children has fallen as a result of faster progress since the development of NPA. About 0.6 million more children attended schools as a result of implementation of NPA. Completion of primary schooling remains a major concern, survival rate to grade-V is low and grade repetition is higher. However, during last two years the survival rate to grade-V remains the same on 67% and the drop-out rate continues to be very high i.e. 33%.

In almost all the Provinces and Regions the recommended budgets are not allocated for implementation of NPA and no proper communication mechanism was established for
effective coordination among the different departments. A stronger commitment on financing across the board and proper communication mechanism must be adopted as proposed in the NPA.

This report draws a picture of what efforts have been made by the provinces and regions for implementation of the plan and what challenges they faced during the implementation? This report makes focused recommendations for filling the gaps between achievements and targets. This report will support provinces and regions by providing assessment and analysis to facilitate decision-making.

Mohammad Khan Khichi
Director General
Academy of Educational Planning and Management
Ministry of Federal Education and Professional Training
Government of Pakistan
Acknowledgements

The NEMIS team in AEPAM is very thankful and would like to acknowledge the services of several individuals who contributed in many ways in the preparation of this report. This report would not have been possible without their contributions and support.

Invaluable input has been provided by provincial and regional education departments, civil society and donor organizations during Annual Progress Review Meetings on Implementation of National Plan of Action for the preparation of this report. We wish to acknowledge their support and services.

The NEMIS team in AEPAM also takes this opportunity to gratefully acknowledge the in time support provided by UNICEF during the development of this document and also expect similar cooperation in future.

A valuable support was extended by provincial and regional Education Management Information System (EMIS) departments by providing up-to-date educational data. The NEMIS team would like to appreciate their countless services.

The NEMIS team in AEPAM would like to record its thankfulness to Engineer Muhammad Baligh-ur-Rehman, Minister of State and Mr. Hassan Iqbal, Secretary, Ministry of Federal Education and Professional Training for their continuous support and guidance. Sincere gratitude goes to Dr. Allah Bakhsh Malik, Additional Secretary, Ministry of Federal Education and Professional Training and the former Director General AEPAM, who participated in the initial development of this report.

This document would have not have taken its shape without guidance and supervision provided by Mr. Muhammad Khan Khichi, Director General AEPAM, therefore his effort is deeply acknowledged.
Executive Summary

Enrolment is the basic element and first step towards participation of children in learning. Enrolment is the most easily measurable indicator of progress towards the achievement of Universal Primary Education (UPE) and the targets set in National Plan of Action to Accelerate Education-Related MDGs (NPA) 2013-16. Two different rates are usually used to measure the school participation i.e. Gross Enrolment Rate (GER) and Net Enrolment Rate (NER). GER measures the overall capacity of school system in purely quantitative terms, whereas NER narrows down its focus to the enrolment of official age group children in the schools. Hence, it takes into account only those enrolled children who belong to the official age range of 5-9 year. As a measure of the coverage of children in the age range officially associated with a given level of education, the NER comes closer to being an indicator of school quality.

In order to achieve UPE (Goal 2 of MDGs), all children of primary-school age (5-9 years) must participate in the school system and complete primary level education. Since Pakistan is among the countries which are not likely to achieve UPE by 2015, therefore, the NPA was developed to accelerate the progress towards achievement of MDGs and to set new targets for the year 2015. According to the NPA, by accelerating the progress, Pakistan will achieve 91% NER by the year 2015.

This Report provides an account of the progress towards the education related MDGs based on the most recent education data – for the school year 2013-14 – with particular attention to access indicators like GER and NER. The provincial and regional chapters of the report are based on the annual progress review meetings regarding implementation of NPA with the stakeholders of their respective provinces and regions. The report explores whether provinces and regions achieved targets of NPA and whether they upheld their commitments or not.

As a whole, the number of out-of-school children is falling in the country, having dropped from 6.7 million in 2012-13 to 6.1 million by 2013-14 – a rate that appears insufficient to achieve NPA targets by 2015. While progress has been made nationwide over the last two years, in the line of National Plan of Action (NPA), in bringing more children into schools, the pace remains too slow to achieve NPA targets by 2015. If past trend continues the Net Enrolment Ratio (NER) will be about 76% in 2014-15 and 80% in 2015-16. Completion of primary schooling remains a major challenge, Survival Rate to grade V is low and grade repetition is high.

Although all the Provinces and Areas made some special efforts in reducing out of school children and to enhance the access of the education system, however, FATA is the only region across the country where the targets of NPA have been achieved for the year 2013-14. The provinces of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa and Balochistan were very close to the targets and are likely to uphold their commitments in coming years as well.
As on 2013-14, almost 6.1 million children of primary school age were out of school, down from 6.7 million in 2012-13. Just below half of them live in Punjab, as it is the most populous province of the country, 47% of total out of school children belongs to Punjab. Being the smallest administrative unit, ICT contains only 1% of total out of school children. The overall enrolment of primary age group in the country has increased from 14.6 million in 2012-13 to 15.5 million in 2013-14. The number of primary schools in public sector has decreased from 155,276 in 2012-13 to 153,941 in 2013-14 throughout the country as a result of policy of rationalization of location of schools, natural disasters, and on-going armed conflict in certain parts of the country. In general, the number of classrooms in primary schools has increased by 2%. A huge decline has also been observed in Non-formal Basic Education Community Schools (BECs) and Feeder schools all over the country. Private sector performed well throughout the country. In most of the provinces, the private sector achieved its targets. Deeni Madaris also succeeded to achieve their targets in most of the provinces and regions as envisaged in the NPA.

With respect to Net Enrolment Rate (NER), wide disparities exist among the provinces and regions, ranging from the lowest NER of 53% in Balochistan to the highest of 85% in KP. Both Balochistan and KP are just one percent in point behind the targets of NPA. Most likely, both provinces may achieve targets of the plan. The NER in Punjab has increased from 71% in 2012-13 to 73% in 2013-14, while it should be at 81% as envisioned in the NPA. Projecting NER with the same rate for 2015, Punjab will reach at 77% which is far behind the 100%, the target of the Plan. Sindh is also lagging behind the target; the NER has increased from 61% in 2012-13 to 65% in 2013-14 against the target of 70%. If this pace will remain constant during next two years, Sindh will reach at 73% NER against the target of 80%. Gilgit-Baltistan is the only region in the country where NER has decreased. In 2012-13, NER in G.B was 69% while in 2013-14 it was 68%. The target for 2013-14 was 68%. AJ&K has also failed to achieve the targets; however NER has increased from 54% in 2012-13 to 60% in 2013-14 while target was 65%. With the same pace AJ&K can achieve the targets set for the 2015. FATA is only region which has not only achieved the target but exceeded the target before time. NER has increased from 63% to 74% during the year 2013-14. ICT has also not been able to achieve the NPA targets. Although NER has increased from 71% in 2012-13 to 74% in 2013-14, however this increase was not enough to achieve the target of 80%. With the same course, ICT will not able to achieve NPA targets by 2015.

The main reasons behind the dismal performance of most of the provinces and regions have been the paucity of financial resources and non-existence of proper coordination mechanisms within education departments and with other stakeholders.
National Scenario

1. Context

Before the advent of 21st Century, Pakistan has committed to achieve enrolment and completion of primary level education by 100% children in the country. On 28th April 2000, Pakistan was among 164 countries of the world that signed Dakar Framework of Action on Education For All in the city of Dakar, Senegal (Africa), and committed to achieve Six Goals by 2015. One of these six Education For All (EFA) Goals included provision of free and compulsory primary education to all children. During the same year, Pakistan joined 192 countries and signed United Nations Millennium Declaration on 8th September 2000 in New York; USA. This Declaration envisaged achieving 8 Goals, called Millennium Development Goals or MDGs. Two of the MDGs (MDG 2& 3) relate to education of boys and girls. By signing this Millennium Declaration and MDGs, Pakistan pledged to ensure that by 2015 all children in the country will be completing full course of primary education.

Abiding by the international commitments referred above, Pakistan took a number of steps and launched numerous initiatives, but it lagged behind the targets due to various reasons. Organizers and conveners of these two global declarations have regularly been monitoring progress of the countries to the achievement of these goals. During 2010, United Nations launched a special initiative called MDG Acceleration Framework (MAF) to support countries lagging behind the targets in stepping up their progress. UNDP highlights features of MAF in following words:

“...The MAF is a flexible, yet systematic process of identifying and analyzing bottlenecks and possible high-impact solutions to achieving a country’s MDG priorities. It leads to a concrete plan of action, with coordinated roles for the government and all other development stakeholders.”

(UNDP 2011, MDGs Acceleration Framework, New York, USA)

Since Pakistan was among the countries that were lagging behind, it opted to join MAF initiative and prepared a National Plan of Action (NPA) during 2012-2013 for expediting its progress during remaining 3 years (2013-16) of the timeframe set for the achievement of MDGs by all countries. This Report aims to assess progress of Pakistan towards achievement of new targets and implementation of innovative strategies envisaged in the National Plan of Action to Accelerate Education-Related MDGs (2013-16).

2. Education-Related MDGs: Goal, Target, and Indicators

As mentioned above, MDG 2 aims to promote primary education in the world. Exact wordings of this Goal, Target, and Indicators are given below:

**Goal:** Achieve Universal Primary Education
**Target**: “Ensure that, by 2015, children everywhere, boys and girls alike, will be able to complete a full course of primary schooling”

**Indicators**: The MDG 2 has following three indicators for monitoring progress.

i. NER: Net Enrolment Rate (NER) in primary education,

ii. Proportion of pupils starting grade 1 who reach last grade of primary i.e. Survival Rate, and

iii. Literacy Rate of 15-24 year-old, women and men.

**MDG 3** also relates to education.

**Goal**: Eliminate gender disparity in primary and secondary education, preferably by 2005, and in all levels of education no later than 2015

**Indicators**: MDG 3 also has 3 indicators, and one of these relate to education.

i. Ratios of girls to boys in primary, secondary and tertiary education

ii. Share of women in wage employment in the non-agricultural sector

iii. Proportion of seats held by women in national parliament

3. Status of MDG 2 in Pakistan during 2011-12

The following table portrays status of MDG 2 in Pakistan during 2011-12 with respect to three indicators mentioned above:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S. No</th>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Both Sexes</th>
<th>Boys</th>
<th>Girls</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Net Enrolment Rate (NER) at Primary level</td>
<td>68%</td>
<td>73%</td>
<td>63%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Survival Rate from Grade 1 to V</td>
<td>70%</td>
<td>71%</td>
<td>68%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Youth Literacy Rate (15-24 years)</td>
<td>70%</td>
<td>79%</td>
<td>62%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

It is evident from the above Table that Pakistan has been significantly lagging behind the targets of all the three indicators of MDG 2. During 2001-02, Pakistan’s NER was 57%. During 2001 to 2011, it has grown up to 68% with net increase of 1% point per annum only. Based on its pace during first ten year (2001-2011), it was anticipated that Pakistan will miss the target of achieving enrolment, retention and completion of primary level education by 100% children, unless and until special efforts are made.


The Government of Pakistan (Ministry of Federal Education and Professional Training) and United Nations jointly selected education related MDG 2 & 3 for MDG Acceleration Framework (MAF). During 2012, Pakistan prepared an analytical report on the status of MDG 2 (Universal Primary Education) in the country, along with analysis of the bottlenecks and resources needed for catching up the missed targets. This Report was presented in the relevant international forum followed by development of National Plan of Action to Accelerate Education-Related MDGs (2013-16) by Pakistan. The National Plan of Action or
NPA was prepared through a participatory process. Although, preparation of NPA was led and facilitated by the Ministry of Federal Education and Professional Training, all stakeholders, including provincial and Area Departments of Education were fully involved in setting the revised targets, devising strategies, and working out cost estimates and time schedule. A series of meetings were held at provincial, area and national level to develop, refine, and finalize various components of NPA. Each province and area was allowed to select strategies and targets for their plans keeping in view their local context and needs. International development partners, especially UNESCO and UNICEF extended support for the whole process. UNDP also participated in the process. Important strategies and targets of NPA are summarized below:

4.1. Targets of NPA to Accelerate Education-Related MDGs in Pakistan (2013-16): The National Plan of Action to Accelerate Education-Related MDGs (2013-16) set following targets for the next three years.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S. No</th>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>2011-12</th>
<th>Benchmark 2012-13</th>
<th>Target for 2015-16</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Out of School Children (OOSC)</td>
<td>6.7 Million</td>
<td>6.4 Million</td>
<td>2.0 Million</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Planned additional enrolment of OOSC in Schools</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>5.0 Million</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Net Enrolment Rate (NER) at Primary level</td>
<td>68%</td>
<td>70%</td>
<td>91%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Details of yearly targets for each component or indicator can be found in the NPA. More elaborated information on the targets as well as progress is also available in this Report in the exclusive sections on each province and area.

4.2. Strategies of NPA: Based on the situation analysis of education development in Pakistan and keeping in view the processes recommended by the MDGs Acceleration Framework, Provincial and Area Departments of Education and Ministry of Federal Education agreed to select following key strategies for the achievement of accelerated targets under NPA:

i. **Enrolment of new students** in existing schools (formal, Non-formal, private sector, Deeni Madaris)

ii. **Provision of additional classrooms** in existing formal government schools to accommodate additional number of out of school children

iii. **Establishment of new public sector formal and Non-formal schools** to accommodate additional number of out of school children.

iv. **Incentives** (in the form of stipend, food-for-education, uniform etc.) to attract poor and disadvantaged children for enrolment in primary schools, and improve their attendance and retention.
NPA envisaged above listed multi-pronged approach keeping in view the findings of number of research studies that diagnosed in-school and out of school factors hindering enrolment of children in the schools and their completion of primary level education. Provinces, Areas, and stakeholders, including international development partners have endorsed these strategies for achievement of targets of MDG 2 and 3.

4.3. Financial, Human, and Material Requirements for NPA: All development initiatives and plans require additional human, financial, and material resources for the implementation of their reform strategies and achievement of objectives. NPA was conceived and planned on the assumption that federal, provincial, and area governments will mobilize additional resources needed for successful execution of NPA. Cost estimates for each of the four strategies were worked out carefully, trends of existing spending on education by the Provinces/Areas were analyzed, and annual per annum increase required in the budget was also projected. The following table presents summary of financial, human and material resources needed for the NPA.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S. No</th>
<th>Inputs</th>
<th>Average per annum addition</th>
<th>Total Requirement up to 2013-16</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Material Resources</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>New Formal Schools</td>
<td>1,901</td>
<td>5,703</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>New Non-formal Schools</td>
<td>5,630</td>
<td>16,891</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>New Feeder Schools</td>
<td>5,620</td>
<td>16,861</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>New Classrooms in formal schools</td>
<td>7,001</td>
<td>21,004</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Human Resources</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>New Formal school Teachers</td>
<td>13,617</td>
<td>40,850</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>New Non-formal school Teachers</td>
<td>16,116</td>
<td>48,347</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Financial Requirements</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Additional Budgetary Requirements for NPA interventions</td>
<td>Rs. 62.978 Billion</td>
<td>Rs. 188.93 Billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Existing Actual Primary education expenditure</td>
<td>Rs. 198.32 Billion</td>
<td>Rs. 594.96 Billion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Total Primary Education Expenditure</td>
<td>Rs. 261.29 Billion</td>
<td>Rs. 783.87 Billion</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

This Report attempts to review the progress made during first year of the NPA i.e. 2013-14, based on quantitative data about enrolment, teachers, and schools. In addition, an effort has been made to also assess progress with respect to development expenditure by the provinces, areas and Federal Government for primary education.
5. Aim and Objectives of Measuring Progress of NPA

In accordance with the Constitution of Pakistan (Article 3, Article 32 and Article 57, Federal Legislative List Part I), the Federal Government has the mandate with respect to external affairs, international treaties and agreements, including educational and cultural pacts, and also dealing with inquiries and statistics. During 2012-13, Federal Government took the initiative to prepare a three year National Plan of Action to Accelerate Education-Related MDGs in Pakistan (2013-16). This NPA was prepared with active participation and endorsement of Provincial and Area Departments of Education. After development, approval, and launching of NPA during 2013, till now, no study has been carried out to measure national and Provincial/ Area level progress towards achieving targets of NPA. Therefore, Ministry of Federal Education and Professional Training planned to measure progress of NPA to achieve following aim and objectives:

5.1. Aim: To accelerate the process of achieving universal primary education through implementation of National Plan of Action, jointly developed by all Provinces, Area, and Federal Government.

5.2. Objectives: The progress of Pakistan towards targets of NPA has been assessed to achieve following objectives:

i. To take stock of the status of education related MDGs in Pakistan with respect to the targets set and strategies envisaged in the National Plan of Action for MDG 2 (2013-16).

ii. To diagnose problems, bottlenecks, and shortfalls that may have impeded efforts of provinces, areas, and federal government in achieving the targets of NPA.

iii. To collect and disseminate quantitative data and qualitative information about education indicators in the country for policy makers, planners, and researchers.

iv. To evolve recommendations for corrective measures to overcome bottlenecks and innovative interventions for providing impetus to the provision of universal primary education to all children in the country.

It is hoped that data on the enrolment, analysis of trends, findings and recommendations of this assessment will inform the stakeholders about status of MDG 2 in the country, and contribute towards strengthening realization among the decision makers and planners to reinvigorate efforts for bringing all children into schools.

6. Overall Approach and Methodology for Measuring Progress of NPA during 2013-14 in Pakistan

In this section, indicators of progress to be assessed, sources of data for these indicators and methodology for collection of data and information needed for this purpose, have been discussed.

6.1. Overall Approach for Measuring Progress: Progress of Pakistan towards achievement of targets of its National Plan of Action for MAF for the first year (2013-14) will be assessed from following four dimensions:
• **Educational Statistics**: Achievement of quantitative educational targets envisaged in the NPA

• **Strategies**: Extent of Implementation of major strategies of the NPA.

• **Education Budget**: Level of allocation of development funds and education expenditure on primary level during the year

• **Other Policy initiatives**: Programmes launched to supplement education-related MDGs and for creating an enabling environment to expand access and improve quality of education.

For the national or macro level progress, data will be reviewed and presented with respect to above listed four dimensions. Whereas in the case of sections on the progress of provinces and areas, for the sake of brevity comparative analysis will be restricted in this section to the achievement of quantitative targets and implementation of NPA strategies only. Nevertheless, detailed information about progress made by the Provinces and Areas has been provided in subsequent sections of this Report.

6.2. Methodology and Sources of Data for Measuring Progress: Data for above listed four aspects or sets of indicators has been taken from the following sources:

- NEMIS annual reports titled ‘Pakistan Education Statistics’ for the years 2012-13 and 2013-14
- Series of Progress Review Meetings with representatives of all Provincial and Area Departments of Education and Literacy, NCHD, BECS, and NEF convened by NEMIS-Academy of Educational Planning and Management for endorsement of data about progress, and inviting proposals and recommendations for future course of action.
- Data and qualitative information gleaned from various national and international documents on the subject.

Based on the methodologies and sources of data listed above, no better mechanism for measuring progress of first year of NPA could have been available at this point of time.

7. Progress of Implementation of NPA: Achievements and Shortfalls 2013-14

Following the overall approach for assessment of progress of Pakistan towards implementation of NPA and achievement of targets of MDG 2, the data and information will be reviewed and analyzed from different dimensions, including education indicators, implementation of strategies, provision of financial resources and policy reforms. This assessment will review and analysis progress from following three dimensions namely; education indicators, implementation of NPA strategies, and development expenditure by provinces on primary education:

7.1. Education Indicators: Achievements and Shortfalls: The NPA aimed to enroll 5 million out of school children in the schools during 3 years and raise overall Net Enrolment Rate to 91% by 2015-16. Target for the year 2013-14 was to enroll an additional 1,665,209 children in the schools and as a result achieve raise in NER up to 77% by the end of 2013-14. The following table compares NPA targets of reduced number of out of school children in the
country, expected increase in the NER, and actual achievement and shortfalls with respect to both indicators.

![Figure N.1: National Targets of NPA and Achievements for 2013-14](image)

The data in the above Table indicates that Pakistan could not achieve targets of NER and reduction in out of school children. Against the NPA target of reducing number of OOSC from 6.4 million to 4.99 million by 2013-14, there were still 6.16 million out of school children in the country at the end of 2013-14. Consequently, due to lesser enrolment of additional children, NER could grow from 68% to 72% only against the target of 75% NER by 2013-14. A shortfall of 3% in the NER and 1.15 million Out of School Children is recorded. Only 31% of the annual target of NER could be achieved during 2013-14.

![Gender disaggregated details of targets and achievements of 2013-14](image)

Gender disaggregated details of targets and achievements of 2013-14 are given in the below graph:
An important indicator of MDG 2 is Survival Rate to Grade V. NPA aimed to enhance Survival Rate also. The following Figure offers gender wise details of this indicator during 2012-13 and 2013-14.

Above figure indicates no significant improvement in the Survival Rate in 2013-14, compared with situation in 2012-13.

There is a need to also measure progress with respect to the target of additional children to be enrolled in schools under NPA for 2013-14.
Table N. 5 : National Targets and Achievements of Additional Enrolment 2013-14

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S. No</th>
<th>Type of School</th>
<th>Target for additional enrolment for 2013-14</th>
<th>Actual additional enrolment during 2013-14</th>
<th>% of Achievement</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Govt. Formal Schools</td>
<td>866,718</td>
<td>78,855</td>
<td>9 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>*Non-Formal &amp; Feeder Schools</td>
<td>471,310</td>
<td>122,525</td>
<td>26 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Private Schools</td>
<td>166,126</td>
<td>240,193</td>
<td>145 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Deeni Madaris</td>
<td>161,055</td>
<td>70,659</td>
<td>44 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>1,665,209</td>
<td>512,232</td>
<td>31 %</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Non-Formal schools include BECS and Provincial/Regional Non-Formal schools and feeder schools managed by NCHD

The above table also presents a depressing situation of the progress towards implementation of NPA at the national level. Only 9% of the target of additional enrolment in government schools could be achieved. Whereas, in case of public sector Non-formal schools (BECS, Feeder Schools and non-formal schools run by provincial/regional governments), enrolment has increased by 26%. Only private sector has flourished and exceeded the annual target. Overall increase in the enrolment during the year 2013-14 (including private sector and Deeni Madaris) is only 31% of the yearly target.

7.2. Implementation of NPA Strategies: Achievements and Shortfalls:

The federal, provincial, and area governments have partially implemented three out of the four strategies, including increasing enrolment in existing schools, construction of additional rooms in the existing schools to widen access, and opening of new schools in public sector. Whereas none of the governments has invested on offering incentives to children from poor and disadvantaged groups for primary education, which was an important innovative strategy of the NPA for attracting more children in schools and improving their attendance and retention. The following sections and data tables present a macro level picture of quantitative targets of NPA with respect to four strategies, actual achievements and shortfalls.

7.2.1. Strategy a: Increasing Enrolment in Existing Schools:

This strategy aimed to maximize use of intake capacity in the existing educational institutions (public formal schools, public NFE, private sector and Deeni Madaris). This strategy was based on the premise that schools and community will facilitate in bringing out of school children into schools. The following Table presents information on results or progress under this strategy, as indicated through official reports of educational statistics.

Table N. 6 : National Targets and Achievement of Strategy a (2013-14)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>NPA Strategy</th>
<th>Target 2013-14</th>
<th>Achievements 2013-14</th>
<th>% of Achievements 2013-14</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Increased enrolment in existing public formal schools</td>
<td>597,332</td>
<td>53,674</td>
<td>9%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Increased enrolment in existing **public NFE** (BECs and provincial/regional non-formal schools) and **Feeder Schools**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Target 2013-14</th>
<th>Achievements 2013-14</th>
<th>% of Achievements 2013-14</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Increased enrolment in existing <strong>private</strong> schools</td>
<td>166,126</td>
<td>240,193</td>
<td>145%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Increased enrolment in Deeni Madaris</td>
<td>161,055</td>
<td>70,659</td>
<td>44%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Target of enrolment under Strategy a and Achievements or Shortfalls</td>
<td>1,062,807</td>
<td>418,309</td>
<td>39%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Above statistics indicate that although a marginal progress has been made in the case of formal public schools, enrolment in Non-formal Basic Education Community Schools (BECs) Feeder Schools and Non-Formal Schools run by the provincial/area governments has increased by 39%. On the other side, enrolment in private schools exceeded the target. Private sector achieved 145% target of the additional enrolment. Whereas enrolment in Deeni Madaris also increased by 44%.

Although the enrolment in NFE schools has increased but the enrolment of BECS and Feeder Schools sponsored by the Federal Government has decreased. The main reason for decline in the enrolment of NFE schools is reduction in their numbers, as many NFE schools were closed down. Apparently, Federal Government has reduced funding for this programme. It is evident that implementation of this strategy has not produced desired results. Marginal increase of 9% in the enrolment of public sector formal schools seems routine and does not appear to be result of any ‘accelerated’ effort under the NPA.

7.2.2. **Strategy b: Increasing Enrolment in Existing Schools through Provision of Additional Classrooms**: Strategy b focused on the provision of additional classrooms in the existing public sector schools with the expectation that availability of additional space will lead to expanding access and possible increase in the enrolment of out of school children in respective areas. The following Table offers national level consolidated picture on the implementation of this strategy in the country:

**Table N. 7 : National Targets and Achievements of Strategy b, Provision of Additional Classrooms in Existing School in Pakistan (2013-14)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>NPA Strategy</th>
<th>Target 2013-14</th>
<th>Achievements 2013-14</th>
<th>% of Achievements 2013-14</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Additional Classrooms in existing public schools</td>
<td>6,893</td>
<td>(1,785)</td>
<td>-26%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Additional enrolment in new Classrooms in existing public schools</td>
<td>168,008</td>
<td>18,911</td>
<td>11%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Some of the Provinces and Areas have constructed additional classrooms in the existing schools. These included Punjab, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Azad Jammu and Kashmir (AJ&K), and Gilgit-Baltistan (G.B). On the other side, number of classrooms decreased in Sindh and Balochistan, reportedly due to floods and other natural calamities. No new classrooms were built in these provinces, as per data available.

It is clear from the above table that most of the provinces and areas have not been able to properly implement this strategy and progress in terms of number of new classrooms has been negative (-26%), whereas negligible achievement (11% of the target) in enrolment has been observed.

7.2.3 : Strategy c : Increasing Enrolment by Opening New Schools: It is a fact that non-availability of school in the vicinity or distant location of school hamper the enrolment of boys and girls living in far flung areas or in hamlets. Strategy c aimed to establish new schools in localities where there are no formal government primary schools, Basic Education Community Schools or Feeder Schools. Strategy aimed to establish 1,844 new formal government schools, 5,550 BECS and an equal number of Feeder Schools. Objective was to expand access and reach out the unreached children. The following Table provides details on the targets and achievements.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>NPA Strategy</th>
<th>Target 2013-14</th>
<th>Achievements 2013-14</th>
<th>% of Achievements 2013-14</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>New formal Public sector schools</td>
<td>1844</td>
<td>(1819)</td>
<td>-99%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New enrolment in new public sector formal schools</td>
<td>101,378</td>
<td>6,270</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New BECS and Non-formal community schools</td>
<td>5,550</td>
<td>(1,071)</td>
<td>-19%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Enrolment in new BECS and NFE</td>
<td>166,508</td>
<td>68,742</td>
<td>41%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Feeder School</td>
<td>5,550</td>
<td>(5,243)</td>
<td>-94%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enrolment in new Feeder Schools</td>
<td>166,508</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

An analysis of information in the above table indicates that provinces are not inclined to open new schools. In most of the provinces, numbers of government primary schools have actually declined (e.g. in Punjab, Sindh, and KP), either due to their policy of rationalizing and merging schools located in close juxtaposition or closing down non-functional ghost schools. Only Balochistan, AJ&K and G.B have opened more schools. The overall progress of the country with respect to this strategy is negative, as achievement of the annual target is -99%. As mentioned above, numbers of BECS and Feeder Schools have also dropped, and consequently enrolment in these institutions has also shrunk.
In the nutshell, progress of the country in this important strategy is also below the target and unsatisfactory.

7.2.4. Strategy d: Incentives to Poor and Disadvantaged Students for Improving their Attendance and Retention in Schools: One of the four strategies of MDG Acceleration Framework (MAF) is to scale up ‘High-Impact Solutions’ that can remove bottlenecks hindering enrolment of children in the schools and completion of primary level education. In Pakistan, poverty of parents is an important factor that compel them not to send their children to school and instead engage them in household chores, family occupation, or various forms of child labour. A number of pilot projects and studies in Pakistan and in other developing countries have demonstrated that children from poor and disadvantaged groups can be attracted to and retained in the schools by offering them or their parents some incentives in the form of stipend or food-for-education etc. Hence, offering incentives to poor and disadvantaged children was an important strategy that may have changed the scenario, if implemented in letter and spirit. Unfortunately, this could not happen.

None of the provinces or Areas took any step for implementation of this important strategy. For the last 10 years, most of the provinces have been paying monetary incentives in the form of stipend to girl students of Middle classes (Grades VI to VIII) in under developed districts or areas. This approach has produced excellent results to enhance attendance of girls in schools and improving their learning achievement or quality of education. World Food Programme (WFP) has been implementing Food-for-Education programme in a number of under developed districts. This Food-for-Education programme has been most successful and has contributed significantly in the enrolment and attendance of millions of girls in selected districts. It is strange that while provincial and area departments of education opt to offer incentives to students of Middle classes, those who have already completed primary level education, but ignore primary level, the first stage of school education, which is most crucial for cognitive, social, emotional, and mental development of the children.

7.3. Measuring Progress with respect to Budget and Expenditure on Education: The NPA was planned on the expectation that provincial and Area governments will mobilize and allocate an additional (‘Development’) budget of Rs. 188.93 Billion, over a period of 3 years, for bringing 5 million out of school children into primary schools. In the previous sections, progress with respect to various indicators and strategy wise implementation have been measured. Now let us assess progress with respect to the financial inputs needed for the NPA i.e. provision of financial resources required for its implementation. For the purpose of this report, reliance is on budgetary expenditure by four provinces and Federal Government only, as data about education expenditure by FATA, Gilgit-Baltistan, and AJ&K is not available. Since provinces have major share of total population of out of school children, therefore, an analysis of their progress will be representative for the whole country. The following Table offers a comparative analysis of NPA targets of financial requirements for additional enrolment at primary level, Education Development Budget, and percentage achievements in financial terms. Development expenditure of education departments, have been taken as reference. Whereas financial targets have been taken from the NPA document.
Table N. 9: Financial Targets of NPA and Achievements by Provinces (2013-14)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S. No</th>
<th>Province or Area</th>
<th>NPA Target for 2013-14 (Rs. Millions)</th>
<th>Development Expenditure on Primary Education (2013-14)</th>
<th>% Achievement</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Punjab</td>
<td>18,327.0</td>
<td>794.85</td>
<td>4.33 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Sindh</td>
<td>9,902.0</td>
<td>668.06</td>
<td>6.74 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Khyber Pakhtunkhwa</td>
<td>5,043.0</td>
<td>5,981.60</td>
<td>118.61 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Balochistan</td>
<td>2,226.0</td>
<td>382.20</td>
<td>17.16 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Islamabad Capital Territory</td>
<td>343.0</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>0 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>35,841.0</td>
<td>7826.71</td>
<td>21.83 %</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


The above Table identifies main obstacle that has impeded implementation of NPA strategies which is financial constraints. Provincial and Area Departments of Education were not provided required financial resources needed for the implementation of NPA strategies. Resultantly, in the absence of required financial resources, most of the strategies could not be implemented with required vigor and thus NPA targets remained unaccomplished.

8. Summary of Conclusions

Detailed analysis of progress and reasons for shortfalls relating to various Provinces and Areas have been given in their respective sections in later part of this report. In this section, only major trends and findings will be discussed.

8.1. Overall Progress

8.1.1. Low progress: Although all the Provinces and Areas made some special efforts in reducing out of school children and to enhance the access of the education system, however, the pace remains very slow to achieve the targets envisioned in NPA. The NER in overall country has increased from 68% in 2012-13 to 72% in 2013-14.

8.1.2. Gradual Improvement: Combined increase in school enrolment by public and private sectors of education, NFE and Deeni Madaris comes to 31% during 2013-14. This means; country is slowly moving towards achievement of goals of Education For All, Right to Education, and Universal Primary Education (MDG 2). Pace is slow, yet direction has been set and journey has begun.

8.1.3. Education Budget: Provincial and Area governments have started raising share of development budget for education, which is a positive trend.

8.1.4. Reduction in NFE Programme: Closing down of thousands of Basic Education Community Schools and Feeder Schools in the provinces (by National Commission for Human
Development and National Education Foundation) is a matter of great concern and a disappointing trend. Supreme Court of Pakistan has declared that Article 25-A is a shared responsibility of federal, provincial and local governments, and directed the Federal Government to continue supporting these NFE schools. Millions of out of school children living in far flung areas or engaged in child labour can best be reached out and offered learning opportunities by using NFE approach only.

8.2. Problems, Bottlenecks, and Challenges
During the Progress Review Meetings with Provincial and Area Departments of Education, officials and representatives were invited to identify factors that have hindered achievement of NPA targets. Each province and area came up with its own set of problems. The most common problems identified by the Provinces and Areas are summarized below:

- **Financial constraints**, adequate funds needed for implementation of NPA were not made available
- **Poverty** of parents and practice of child labour
- **Lack of public awareness** about need and significance of school education for their children
- **Centralization of authority** and inadequate devolution of powers to district and local level
- **Terrorism and poor law and order** situation in various parts of the country
- **Gender disparity** due to low status of women in the society
- **Poor capacity of and insufficient trainings** for teachers, school heads, and education managers.
- **Disasters and Armed Conflict**, damaging of school buildings due to floods and by extremists through explosions.
- **Poor conditions of learning** in the schools due to missing facilities.
- **Distant location of schools**, scattered population and inability of children living in small hamlets to attend school at distant locations.

Respective sections on each province and area may be studies for problems specifically faced by different provinces and areas.

8.3. New Initiatives and Rays of Hope
Representatives of provincial and Area Departments of Education reported number of initiatives launched by their respective governments for widening access of children to primary education and improving quality of learning in schools in their respective regions. Initiatives commonly launched or introduced by most of the provinces and Areas are enlisted in the beginning, under section below titled ‘Common Initiatives’ whereas development schemes or good practices specifically initiated by different provinces/areas have been mentioned separately and exclusively.

**Common Initiatives by Provinces/Areas**

i. Development of Education Sector Plans
ii. Annual campaigns for enrolment of out of school children
iii. Capacity building of teachers and education managers
iv. Provision of missing facilities to schools
v. Merit based appointment of teachers, improving process for selection and appointment of teachers through entry tests by independent organizations or Third Party.

**Punjab**
- Issuance of Punjab Free and Compulsory Education Ordinance, May 2014
- Establishment of Early Childhood Education (ECE) Rooms or Centres in selected schools
- Strengthening of assessment system
- Induction training for newly recruited teachers.
- Real time School Monitoring Information system
- School performance information system

**Sindh**
- Introduction of Early Childhood Education (ECE) in selected schools
- Introduction of Management cadre for improving efficiency of the education managers
- Introduction of School Specific Budget (including non-salary budget based on enrolment and other indicators)

**Khyber Pakhtunkhwa**
- Independent Monitoring Unit (IMU) to regularly monitor various aspects of the education system in the province.
- Tameer-e-school Programme
- School based recruitment of teachers

**Balochistan**
- Promulgation of Balochistan Compulsory Education Act 2014 (please note, it is NOT Free, but Compulsory Education Act)
- Established Alternative Learning Paths (ALPs) Centres in 8 districts (UNICEF focused districts)
- Established Gender Free zone in Primary schools with 2 Female teachers in each school

**AJ&K**
- Curriculum Implementation Framework (CIF) and Continuous Professional Development (CPD) framework developed
- Rationalization of teaching staff in schools

**Gilgit-Baltistan (G.B)**
- Offered incentives to the needy students
- Strengthened EMIS in G.B to collect and update data

**FATA**
- Rationalization of Budgetary Pyramid 60-40 (Female-Male)
- Introduction of Non-Formal Education
- Conversion to English Medium of Instruction, and Introduction of English Textbooks for various subjects

**Islamabad Capital Territory (ICT)**

- Survey of Out of School Children (OOSC) in ICT during 2014
- New Admission Policy, with important feature of No admission Refusal
- Promulgation of Free and Compulsory Education Act 2012

The long list of initiatives above indicates commitments of the governments to accord priority to education and their continuous efforts for reaching out to maximum number of out of school children. These are rays of hope and may pave the way for accelerated action on achievement of targets of Education-Related MDGs

**9. Learning from Others: Good Practices and Success Stories**

A number of countries have either already achieved universal primary education or accelerated their journey towards MDG 2 and 3 by adopting innovative strategies and models. Pakistan can learn from the successful experiences and good practices of other countries for meeting learning needs of its millions of children who are presently out of school. In this section, information about strategies adopted by various countries for successfully achieving universal primary education or considerably enhancing enrolment of children will be presented.

**9.1. Complete Free Education**

Direct and in-direct costs of schooling prevent poor and illiterate parents to send their children to primary school. Most of the developed countries achieved UPE through introduction of free and compulsory basic education. Abolition of school fees and provision of free textbooks is not enough. In many countries, notebooks or stationary, school bags, and uniform are also being provided to school children free of cost in state sponsored educational institutions. In South Asia, Sri Lanka has followed this approach and successfully achieved Net Enrolment Rate (NER) and Literacy Rate of over 90%.

Nepal started its first Free and Compulsory Education Programme during 1963 in its selected districts, and later on gradually expanded this initiative to most parts of the country (Tribhuvan University Research Centre for Educational Innovation and Development, 2004, *Free and Compulsory Primary Education in the Context of Education for All*, Kathmandu, Nepal, page 5). Its NER at the Primary level during 1995 was 67.5%, which has now exceeded 90%. Whereas; Primary level NER in Pakistan during 1997-98 was 49.2% only.

In Uganda, when school fees were abolished in 1997, enrolment of girls increased from 63% to 87% by 1999, i.e. within two year. A similar trend was observed in Tanzania when school fees were abolished during 2000-2002. In Cuba, Sri Lanka, school lunch and uniform are

During 2002, Indian parliament amended its constitution (added Article 21-A), and declared free and compulsory education a fundamental right of all children of six to fourteen years age. In 2009, it promulgated ‘The Right of Children to Free and Compulsory Education (RTE) Act’ which defined free education in clearer terms. As per this Act (Chapter II, Article 2) no child shall be liable to pay any kind of fee or charges or expenses which may prevent him or her from pursuing and completing elementary education. In compliance with this Act, central and state governments provided transport facility to students living in far flung areas, school lunch to millions of students, and uniform to most of the students in elementary schools.

9.2. School Feeding Programmes (Mid-Day Meals or School Lunch)
Most of the out-of-school children in developing countries belong to poor families or disadvantaged groups. Poverty of the parents is the main stumbling block hindering enrolment of their children in the school. Statistics indicate that more than one third children in developing countries are born under-weight and/or face stunting in their physical growth. In Pakistan, 21% children of age under 5 are reported to be underweight and 43% face stunting in their growth (Govt. of Pakistan, 2011, National Nutrition Survey 2011, Planning and Development Division, Islamabad). Most of the developed countries and a good number of developing countries offer meals to attract and retain children in the schools and compensate for their nutritional deficiency.

In 1995, India launched Mid-Day Meal programme. At present, over 100 million children are daily provided cooked meals in the government schools. This Mid-Day Meal consists of food grains, pulses, vegetables, oil and fat etc. With a view to institutionalize this programme, India has sanctioned additional posts of cooks or helper cooks and construction of an additional room as kitchen in all government schools. Central Government of India bears 75% cost on Mid-Day Meals, whereas 25% or lesser share is to be contributed by the States or provincial governments. Similar projects are also being implemented in Bangladesh, Nepal, and Sri Lanka for children living in under developed areas or in selected districts.

In Pakistan, Tawana Pakistan Project (TPP) was implemented during 2002-2005 with a budget of Rs. 3.6 billion. Fresh meal, multi-micronutrient supplements, and de-worming medicine were to be provided to school children in 29 poverty districts. Unfortunately, this project could not be implemented properly and was discontinued due to corruption and inefficiency.

9.3. Monetary Incentives: Payment of Stipend or Conditional Cash Transfers (CCT)
As referred above, poverty of parents is an important factor that blocks enrolment of children in the schools. Due to opportunity cost, poor and illiterate parents prefer to engage their children in house chores or family occupations (especially in case of girls), or send them to earn money by carrying out manual work in workshops, restaurants, or take up jobs of
domestic servants or unskilled labourers. Like food-for-education, monetary incentives when offered in lieu of attendance in schools, also motivate many poor parents to enroll their children for primary education. In Pakistan, it has been established through empirical evidence that payment of stipend to girls enhance their enrolment, attendance, retention and learning achievements. At present, stipend is offered to girls enrolled at middle level only. Provision of monetary incentives to poor students of primary level has yet not come under the consideration of policy makers. Although, conditional cash transfer or education vouchers are being offered to the children enrolled in low fee private sector schools, but these mostly help low income families who can already afford to send their children to private schools, mostly located in urban areas. Thus benefits do not reach to the families living below poverty line in rural areas.

In 1997, Mexico launched a programme of monetary incentives or Conditional Cash Transfer called PROGRESA. Objectives included to improve education, health, and nutrition of children. Part of this grant was given to the families of children starting third grade, provided their attendance is at least 85% or above.

In Bangladesh, 7.8 million girls and boys at the primary level have received stipends in 2013 (UNESCO, *EFA Review Report of Bangladesh*, Bangkok, page 63). Many other countries are paying monetary incentives to students from disadvantaged families with a view to supplement their schooling cost. Recently, during 2014, Indonesia launched Smart Indonesia Card (KIP) to provide subsidy to poor children of age 6 to 21 years in their primary, elementary, secondary, and higher education. Each card holder student receives about US$ 18 per semester for education related expenditure. Indonesia has planned to extend this programme to over 20 million children during 2015.

9.4. Political Will and Leadership for Education

In modern times, reforms and development are conceived and guided through strategic planning, and implemented through political support and patronage. Political decision makers in democratic developing countries accord priority to the urgent basic needs (not the fundamental rights) and short term projects that can generate quick results. Whereas education is a long term investment and its fruits or impact is visible after a longer period of time. Political will and leadership can expedite the process of educational development in a country. Political patronage for education plays a catalytic role towards mobilization of financial resources and administrative support required for attaining national goals.

In China, Cuba, Tanzania, Indonesia, Nigeria, Brazil, India and Bangladesh, the politicians, particularly the parliamentarians and chief executives of the country were instrumental in launching and successfully implementing large scale education campaigns. In India, it was a joint partnership of parliamentarians and civil society that resulted in the passage of a comprehensive Act on the Right to Free and Compulsory Education. In Indonesia, it was President Suharto who personally led literacy movement.
Article 25-A in the Constitution of Pakistan was added on the recommendations of a joint Parliamentary Commission, consisting of representatives from all political parties. After 18th Amendment, the first high level summit on Right to Education (Article 25-A) was held on 16th Sept 2011, chaired by the then Prime Minister of Pakistan and attended by Chief Ministers and Provincial Education Ministers. A Joint Declaration signed by the P. M and provincial representatives was issued. Right to Education cannot be enforced in Pakistan without political will and patronage of national and provincial leaders and support of political parties. Public representatives need to unite for the noble cause of education on the lines of their joint stance against terrorism.

9.5. Constitutional Responsibility of the State: Supporting Provinces and Areas

Article 25-A of the Constitution makes the state of Pakistan responsible for the provision of free and compulsory education to all children of age 5 to 16 years. As per the Constitution, State consists of Federal, Provincial, and local governments. This means, Federal Government also has a role and constitutional responsibility to contribute for the provision of this fundamental right to all children in the country. After 2011, Federal Government has withdrawn its financial support to the Provinces for literacy and basic education, although it has doubled its budget for tertiary education i.e. grants to the universities in the provinces through Higher Education Commission (HEC). In India, USA, and in many other federal countries, central government provides financial support to the federating units for key developmental areas like education and health. India’s’ programme of Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan -SSA (The Education for All Movement) is jointly sponsored by the central and state governments. In USA, The National School Lunch Program is a federally assisted initiative operating in public and nonprofit private schools. It provides nutritionally balanced, low-cost or free lunches to children each school day.

Achievement of Education-Related MDGs cannot be accelerated by the Provinces and Areas alone. Federal Government ought to come forward to provide impetus and required thrust to Education For All and education related MDGs throughout the country.

10. Way Forward: Recommendations

Representatives of Provincial and Area Departments of Education, during a series of Progress Review Meetings, presented number of recommendations for expediting implementation of NPA. Out of these, key recommendations have been listed below:

10.1. Constitutional Right to Free and Compulsory

- Implementation of Article 25-A of the Constitution by all provinces and Area, including by the Federal Government, in letter and spirit.
- Governments should ensure complete free opportunities of education to all children of aged 5 to 16 years in their respective administrative areas.
- Immediate enforcement of Acts or Laws framed for enforcement of Article 25-A
- Allocation of additional resources required by Education Departments for enrolment of about 25 million out of school children of age 5 to 16 years.
10.2. Incentives for enrolment and retention of poor out of school children

1. Incentives to attract the poor and disadvantaged children to primary schools in the form of stipend, free uniform, school lunch, free transport, and health care or school health programmes.
2. Incentives for teachers demonstrating excellent performance may also be introduced.

10.3. Increasing Education Budget

- Raising budget for education, particularly under development head for primary education.
- Increasing education budget up to 4% of GDP and a minimum of 20% development budget for education by the provincial and Area governments.
- Timely release of funds to districts and schools.

10.4. Monitoring and Accountability

- Robust monitoring system involving Information and Communication Technologies (ICTs) and innovative approaches.
- An independent data collection and monitoring system.
- Third Party Validation for cross checking of data and monitoring of progress.
- Strengthening of EMIS. For the provision of timely and reliable data for educational planning and management; the EMIS Cells should be strengthened on provincial/area as well as at district levels.

10.5. Improving Educational Governance

- Eliminating political interference in appointments, postings, and transfer of education personnel.
- Merit based recruitment as a strategy for quality improvement that will ultimately lead to enhancing students enrolment in the schools.

10.6. Awareness Raising and Enrolment Campaigns

- Massive awareness campaigns for enrollment and retention.
- Effective utilization of print and electronic media for promotion of education.
- Political figures (e.g. parliamentarians, Ministers, Chief Ministers) should lead motivational drives or school enrolment campaigns in far flung and under developed areas where participation level is low.
- Community representatives should be involved and inspired to practically contribute for bringing out of school children into the schools.

10.7. Opening of New Schools

- Govt. should directly purchase the land for new schools, instead of depending upon and waiting for the land to be donated by the community, especially in urban areas.
- Provision of required financial resources for opening of new classrooms.

11.8. Scaling-up Non-Formal Education programmes
- Establishment of more NFBE Schools proportionate to the number of out of school and dropped out children.
- Develop a comprehensive policy for NFE and Adult Literacy (AL) supplemented with provision of required budget on a regular basis
- Use innovative, technology based approaches for NFE with the help of private sector

10.9. **Improving School Environment, Curriculum, and Textbooks**

- Use of mother tongue at primary level as a medium of instruction
- Minimum Standards of school environment should be developed, finalized, approved, and implemented.
- Curriculum reforms to produce child-centered and interactive learning materials and provision to schools
- Ensuring Curriculum and Textbooks adequately address the issue of Social Cohesion

10.10. **Community Participation**

- Increase transparency and involvement of public in decision making about schools.
- Enhance community participation and ownership, and strengthen school-community linkages

10.11. **Coordination**

- For effective implementation, Plan Coordination Units (PCUs) should be established by all provinces and Areas with the representation of all concerned departments, including Finance and Planning departments.
- Proper coordination mechanism should be established among different tiers and organs of Education Departments to periodically review progress of education projects and recommend corrective measures.
- Mechanisms should be put in place for Inter-provincial coordination

Actions proposed by the provinces/areas, listed above, are strategic in nature, and will play a catalytic role in improving the situation and achievement of targets of NPA. Their implementation in letter and spirit is highly desirable, if we aim to make Pakistan a learning society and meet learning needs of millions of its out of school children, most of whom belong to poor strata and disadvantaged segments of the society.
Punjab

Punjab is the most populous province of Pakistan, covering an area of 205,345 Square Kilometer. Estimated population of age group 5-9 children in Punjab province is about 11 million, of these about 2.91 million are out-of-school in 2013-14.

In the National Plan of Action to Accelerate Education-Related MDGs (NPA), Punjab is the only province which has committed to achieve 100% Net Enrolment Rate by the year 2015-16. This section aims to present information about the progress of the province towards the achievement of targets of NPA.

School Participation

The overall enrolment of age group 5-9 has increased from 7,691,483 in 2012-13 to 8,052,418 in 2013-14. This increase is essentially due to special efforts made by the School Education Department. The highest relative increase in public sector primary enrolment has been recorded in district Nankana Sahib where enrolment increased from 61,641 in 2012-13 to 82,907 in 2013-14. On the other hand, the overall enrolment in district Rajanpur decreased from 90,748 in 2012-13 to 78,270 in 2013-14.

![Comparison of Enrolment Rates in Punjab](image)

How close is Punjab to NPA Targets?

The number of out-of-school children is falling in Punjab, having declined from 3.2 million (29% of 5-9 age-group of population) in 2012-13 to 2.9 million (27% of 5-9 age-group of population) in 2013-14. While progress has been made over the last two years, in the line of National Plan of Action (NPA), in bringing more children into the schools, the pace remains too slow during 2013-14 to achieve NPA targets. The shortfall between targets and achievements is eight percent in points – in other words 877,383 targeted out-of-school children are still deprived of their right to education. If past trend continues, the Net Enrolment Ratio (NER) will be about 75% in 2014-15 and 77% in 2015-16. By keeping the same
pace, it will not be possible to achieve the set target of 100% NER by the year 2015. Figure 2 shows the targets envisaged in NPA versus the actual achievements based on the data.

**Figure P.2: Year and Gender wise Targets and Achievements of Punjab**

Completion of primary level education by all children enrolled in schools remains a major concern. Survival Rate to grade V is low and grade repetition is high. The Survival Rate to grade V slightly increased from 70% to 74% during one year. The drop-out rate has decreased from 30% in 2012-13 to 26% in 2013-14. Gender wise comparison of Survival Rate to grade V for the years 2012-13 and 2013-14 is presented in the Figure 3. Survival Rate not only provides information on the efficiency of the school system, this is also an in-direct indicator of quality of education. Therefore current progress shows that the quality of the education system in Punjab is not as good as it should be. In addition to allocating resources to attract out-of-school children, the government should also enhance budget to maintain minimum level of quality of education in the province.

**Figure P.3 : Gender and Year wise Survival Rate to Grade V in Punjab**

The enrolment in Basic Education Community Schools (BECs) has increased from 224,590 in 2012-13 to 249,573 in 2013-14 – rise by 11 percent in points in during the year. On the other
hand; a huge decrease of about 43% in the enrolment of feeder schools, managed by NCHD, has been observed during the year. The BECS and NCHD schools are being managed under the umbrella of Federal Government. In Punjab, a separate department for Literacy and Non-Formal Basic Education has been established by the Government of Punjab. Different projects are being implemented under Literacy and NFBE Department to address the problem of dropouts at the primary level and to meet the emerging demand for Non-Formal Basic Education along with functional Literacy and livelihood skills.

The overall number of enrolment in public primary schools has increased from 5.0 million in 2012-13 to 5.1 million in 2013-14. The number of primary schools in Punjab has decreased from 39,347 in 2012-13 to 38,427 as a result of up-gradation of schools and rationalization policy, the underutilized schools were closed. About 2,100 new classrooms were constructed in primary schools, out of these 156 rooms were built by providing buildings to 26 existing shelter-less schools. About 167 one classroom and 1,819 two classroom schools were given more classrooms to enhance their intake capacity.

The targets envisaged in NPA for 2012-13 and 2013-14 versus actual achievements during the same years are reflected in the following table. It can be clearly concluded that the enrolment rate is gradually increasing from 2012-13 to 2013-14. The gender parity index is almost the same i.e. 0.9. By reducing the gap between enrolment of boys and girls, the targets can be achieved within next two years.

**Table P.1: Targets of NPA and Achievements by Punjab for the years 2012-13 and 2013-14**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>NER</th>
<th>Actual</th>
<th>NER</th>
<th>Actual</th>
<th>Missing Targets</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>NPA</td>
<td></td>
<td>NPA</td>
<td></td>
<td>NER</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012-13</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>75%</td>
<td>73%</td>
<td>1,417,975</td>
<td>1,520,811</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>69%</td>
<td>69%</td>
<td>1,620,046</td>
<td>1,647,955</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>72%</td>
<td>71%</td>
<td>3,038,021</td>
<td>3,168,766</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013-14</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>83%</td>
<td>76%</td>
<td>978,551</td>
<td>1,368,539</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>80%</td>
<td>71%</td>
<td>1,051,349</td>
<td>1,538,744</td>
<td>9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>81%</td>
<td>73%</td>
<td>2,029,900</td>
<td>2,907,282</td>
<td>8%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

How Punjab Has Taken-up NPA?

The Annual Progress Review Meeting on Implementation of National Plan of Action to Accelerate Education-Related MDGs with education managers and policy makers of the Department of Education, Punjab, was held on 21-22 March, 2015 in Lahore. It was stated in the meeting that in the follow up of NPA the following initiatives have been taken during 2012-13 and 2013-14:

- Approval of Punjab Free and Compulsory Education Act 2014 by Punjab Provincial Assembly
- Provision of free text books to students of all public sector schools (since 2003)
- Establishment child friendly schools
• Establishment of Early Childhood Education (ECE) Rooms or Centres in schools
• Campaigns for new admissions for Universal Primary Education (UPE) & Universal Secondary Education (USE)
• Stakeholders meetings and conferences
• Provision of stipend to disadvantaged students and missing facilities in schools
• Improvement in teachers’ presence in schools
• Strengthening of assessment system
• Awareness campaign as part of enrolment drive
• Chief Minister’s School Reform Road Map
• Strengthening of School Councils
• Provision of stipend to 659 schools in 6 Districts
• Teachers training by DSD (Induction Training of newly recruited teachers and In-Service Training of teachers)
• Real time EMIS system
• Recruitment through National Testing Service (NTS), Merit based transfer policy, and rationalization of staff
• School performance information system

Key Challenges

The department of education faced the following key challenges during the implementation of NPA.

• Unwillingness of parents to enroll their children in schools, due to poverty and ignorance.
• Absence of a motivational drive for the community
• Non coordination of stakeholders in education sector
• Inadequacy of budgetary resources for education
• Funds are not released on time
• Poor coordination among various implementation Units
• Lack of knowledge of planners about field realities
• Establishment of District Education Authorities
• Implementation of legislation on 18th amendment
• Retention of students through provision of improved physical facilities and improved quality related interventions.
• Proper Standing Operating Procedures (SOPs) for procurements by School Councils

Steps required for accelerating the progress towards the achievement of NPA targets

According to the evidence, Punjab is behind the set targets of NPA. Nevertheless, these targets are still achievable if the following steps are taken on emergency basis as recommended during Annual Progress Review Meeting.

• Govt. should empower the head teachers and build trust of education managers and teachers
• Assignment of non-educational work to teachers should be discouraged
In house monitoring & supervision system be improved.
The targets should be reset on the basis of ground realities and security situation.
A dedicated office staffed by trained professionals to oversee and push the implementation of NPA in letter and spirit.
Take on-board civil society organizations and private sector under public-private-partnership arrangements
Increase in Education budget up to 7% of GDP
Enforcement of Legislation on 18thAmendment (i.e. Implementation of Article 25-A and Punjab Free and Compulsory Education Act 2015)
Counseling of dropped out students.
Establishment of Community Learning Centers (CLCs)

Strategy wise details of implementation of National Plan of Action
Strategy a: Enrolment of new students in existing schools (under-utilized/closed schools) (70% of all new enrolment)

According to the targets of NPA, a total of 2.34 million out-of-school children will be enrolled in Punjab under this strategy during 2013-16. Of these, 40% will be enrolled in public formal and 10% in public non formal schools, and 10% in Deeni Madaris and other schools. Private schools are estimated to absorb another 10% students.

For the year 2013-14, 775,301 out-of-school children were planned to be enrolled in the existing schools under ‘Strategy a’ of the plan. The sector wise distribution of these children is shown in the following table:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sector</th>
<th>Target of OOS Children to be enrolled during 2013-14</th>
<th>Actual Achievements: OOS Children enrolled (2013-14)</th>
<th>Actual Achievements of OOSC Target in % during 2013-14</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Public sector formal schools @40%</td>
<td>443,030</td>
<td>100,391</td>
<td>23 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public sector Non- formal and feeder schools @10%</td>
<td>110,757</td>
<td>24,983</td>
<td>23 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Private Sector Schools @10%</td>
<td>110,757</td>
<td>137,739</td>
<td>124 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deeni Madaris &amp; Others @10%</td>
<td>110,757</td>
<td>23,019</td>
<td>21 %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total Children</strong></td>
<td><strong>775,301</strong></td>
<td><strong>286,132</strong></td>
<td><strong>37 %</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Against the target of 443,030 out-of-school children, 100,391 have been enrolled in existing public sector formal schools

– only 23% of the target has been achieved by the public sector. The enrolment in public sector non-formal (BECS) schools has increased by 11% during the year, however a huge decline of about 43% has been observed in the non-formal feeder schools (NCHD). Overall, 24,983 new children were enrolled in non-formal education system including BECS, NCHD and
non-formal schools running under Literacy and Non-formal Basic Education Department. On the other hand, 137,739 new children were enrolled in private schools as compared to 110,757 target children. Private sector is performing overwhelmingly and contributing its share in reducing out-of-school children in the province. During the year, 23,019 children were enrolled in Deeni Madaris, whereas the target was 74,646. All the sectors except private sector failed to achieve targets set in the NPA. Overall, 286,132 new students were enrolled in the existing institutions working under different sub sectors of education in Punjab – only 37% of targets set under this strategy could be achieved.

Considering the current progress towards ‘Strategy a’ of the plan, the targets for the remaining two years of the plan should be revised (i.e. raised) by equally dividing the shortfall of current year and adding into next two years as shown in following table.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>2013-14 (Actual Achievement)</th>
<th>2014-15</th>
<th>2015-16</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Formal Public Schools</td>
<td>100,391</td>
<td>622,735</td>
<td>611,945</td>
<td>1,335,071</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-Formal Public and Feeder Schools</td>
<td>24,983</td>
<td>155,741</td>
<td>153,044</td>
<td>333,768</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Private Schools</td>
<td>137,739</td>
<td>99,363</td>
<td>96,666</td>
<td>333,768</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deeni Madaris</td>
<td>23,019</td>
<td>156,723</td>
<td>154,026</td>
<td>333,768</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>286,132</td>
<td>1,034,563</td>
<td>1,015,680</td>
<td>2,336,375</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Way Forward**

During the Annual Progress Review Meeting regarding Implementation of NPA, the following actions were recommended in order to achieve 100% targets of this strategy:

- Incentives for teachers should be introduced
- Proper functioning of Punjab Teachers Foundation
- Award and penalty phenomenon (accountability)
- Incentives for parents should be introduced
- Massive awareness campaigns across the province for enrollment and retention
- Robust monitoring system involving ICT and innovative interventions.
- Direct allocation and transfer of funds to the districts.
- Development and implementation of Policies and SOPs about School Councils.
- Start of second shift in public schools in collaboration with private sector
- Increase in Education Budget
- Capacity building of all cadres
- Awareness campaigns to mobilize local communities
- Comprehensive Household survey that should cover all areas (out of school) of Punjab.
- No political interference
- Retention of students in schools up to completion of Primary level education
Strategy b: Enrolment of new students in formal schools through provision of an additional classroom (10% of existing schools)

This strategy of the Plan is based on the provision of an additional classroom with a teacher in existing public institutions. Under this strategy, Punjab has committed to provide one additional classroom in 3,692 formal public schools to accommodate 110,757 out of school children during 2013-14. However, evidence or data shows that only 2,100 new class rooms were constructed in primary schools, of these, 156 were constructed in 26 new buildings provided to the shelter-less schools. Rest of the classrooms were constructed in 1,944 existing schools. Under this strategy, only 11,155 out-of-school children were accommodated in formal public sector schools. The following Table offers information on NPA Targets of Strategy b, actual achievements by Punjab and shortfall:

Table P.4: Targets and Achievement of Strategy b in Punjab during 2013-14: Number of New Class Rooms and Out of School Children to be enrolled

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>components</th>
<th>Target for 2013-14</th>
<th>Actual Achievements During 2013-14</th>
<th>Shortfalls Number and %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Number of New Class Rooms to be constructed in formal schools</td>
<td>3692</td>
<td>1944</td>
<td>1748</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>53%</td>
<td>47%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New OOS Children to be enrolled</td>
<td>110,757</td>
<td>11,155</td>
<td>99,602</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>90%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Under the current circumstances the plan for the years 2014-15 and 2015-16 should be revised. The shortfall of the year 2013-14 should be divided and added in the targets of next two years to ensure achievement of 100% of total target by 2015-16:

Table P.5: Revised targets of Punjab for the years 2014-15 and 2015-16

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>2013-14 Actual Achievements</th>
<th>2014-15</th>
<th>2015-16</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total Children</td>
<td>11,155</td>
<td>162,655</td>
<td>159,958</td>
<td>333,768</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of formal schools to be provided with additional classroom</td>
<td>1,944</td>
<td>4,636</td>
<td>4,546</td>
<td>11,126</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Way forward

During the Annual Progress Review Meeting regarding Implementation of NPA the following actions were recommended to expedite the achievement of 100% targets of this strategy:

- Minimum standards of school environment should be developed and finalized.
- Effective Public-Private Partnership may be strengthened
- Community mobilization i.e. through activation of School Councils and Awareness Campaigns
- Child Centered Learning Materials to be provided in schools
- Household survey at large scale to cover the whole province
- Rationalization of funds for School Councils
Strategy c: Enrolment of children in new schools (20% of all new enrolments)

It is the most expensive strategy of the Plan under which 20% of total out-of-school children will be enrolled by constructing new formal and/or non-formal/feeder schools. Under this strategy, the plan envisioned to enroll 110,757 out-of-school children by opening 3,692 new non-formal and new feeder schools during 2013-14.

According to 2013-14 statistics, the numbers of non-formal and feeder schools running under BECS and NCHD have actually decreased. However, 372 new institutions were opened by Literacy and Non-Formal Basic Education Department to accommodate 63,641 children.

During the Annual Progress Review Meeting regarding Implementation of NPA with education managers of Punjab, it was also pointed out that a proper coordination mechanism does not exist in the province for implementation of this strategy.

In the light of current status, the targets for the next two years of the plan should be revised by equally dividing the 2013-14 deficits into next two years according to the following pattern:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Components of strategy C</th>
<th>2013-14 Actual Achievements</th>
<th>2014-15</th>
<th>2015-16</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Children to be enrolled in new formal schools</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of new formal schools to be opened</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Children to be enrolled in new Non-Formal schools</td>
<td>63,641</td>
<td>136,412</td>
<td>133,715</td>
<td>333,768</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of new Non-Formal schools to be opened</td>
<td>372</td>
<td>3,948</td>
<td>3,858</td>
<td>7,805</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Children to be enrolled in new Feeder schools</td>
<td>-69,568</td>
<td>203,017</td>
<td>200,319</td>
<td>333,768</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of new Feeder schools to be opened</td>
<td>3,948</td>
<td>3,858</td>
<td>7,805</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Way forward

During the Annual Progress Review Meeting regarding Implementation of NPA the following recommendations were made to achieve 100% targets of this strategy:

- Govt. should directly purchase the land for new schools instead of depending upon and waiting for the land to be donated by the community, especially in urban area
- ICT based innovated campaigns are required to implement the NPA
- Effective utilization of media must be ensured
- Enhanced involvement of civil society in implementation of NPA
- Free & compulsory education to all children
- Establishment of more NFBE Schools proportionate to the number of out of school children and dropped out children.
- Mainstreaming of NFE students after grade-III and V
- Retention of students for survival up to Grade V
Strategy d: Targeted Incentives for access and retention of students from disadvantaged groups (15% of all enrolments)

It is stated in Punjab chapter of NPA under strategy d that “Of all primary enrolments (old and new), 15% of the students will be provided incentives for access and retention in primary schools. In Punjab, 5.6 million children will be targeted in 3 years and provided incentives (equivalent to Rs. 3,000 per child) at a cost of Rs. 16.9 billion” (page 152).

Under this strategy, it was envisaged that 1.7 million students will be provided incentives, equivalent to Rs. 5,023 million, during school year 2013-14. Currently, the Government of Punjab is providing free textbooks to students and no fees are charged. However stationary and transport cost continue to be borne by the parents. The strategy is not fully implemented in the province due to lack of financial resources and lack of proper monitoring and coordination mechanism.

The following provisions have been made in the Chief Ministers’ School Reforms Roadmap:

- Stipend for girls students in 15 districts
- Special cash prizes for position holders
- Foreign visits for top position holders
- Scholarships for brilliant students through Pakistan Education Endowment Fund (PEEF)

Way forward

During the Annual Progress Review Meeting regarding Implementation of NPA the following actions were recommended in order to achieve 100% targets of this strategy:

- Attractive classroom environment
- Significant interactive material in the classroom
- Special package (diet, refreshment, uniform, health care and security)
- Need assessment is required
- District ranking/District criteria revisit
- Inclusion of disable children in the normal schools to make them useful citizens

Conclusion and Recommendations

Evidence reviewed in this part of the report demonstrates progress towards four innovative strategies adopted in NPA 2013-16. It is clearly evident and established that Punjab has not achieved the targets envisaged in NPA for the year 2013-14. Still a long way to go to achieve these targets.

The weakest area identified during the progress review process was public sector of education in the province. Although the government has taken some initiatives to increase the enrolment in public sector, but still the system is not fully utilized and geared up to fulfill
constitutional obligations of Right to Education (Article 25-A) and challenges of MDG 2. To attract the children in public sector schools, the government will have to enhance the quality of education.

The main reason identified during the process was lack of financial resources for the implementation of four strategies of the Plan. Another reason is lack or non-existence of monitoring, coordination and communication mechanisms within the education department and among the other concerned departments including finance and planning departments.

Although an enrolment campaign was launched to enroll new children, however to make this campaign successful a need assessment survey should have also been conducted. These need assessment surveys may help identify the exact geographical areas where schools have capacity to enroll more students and there is enough population of 5-9 age group children in the area who are out of school.

It is also apparent that we will only be able to achieve the goal of quality education for all through pro-equity programs and bridging the gaps in education to reach vulnerable and excluded children. This will be possible only if we identify and reach out to that group.

The EMIS Cell in Punjab should be strengthened by providing all the required resources (human, financial and material resources i.e. staff, funds, and equipment), to cater to all the data needs for educational planning and policy making. The district level EMIS cells should also be made functional by providing at-least two staff members and one computer in each district. The EMIS should not only maintain the educational statistics but also tabulate finance and population related data. The decision regarding opening of new schools, construction of classrooms, provision of physical facilities, hiring of new teachers should be supported by EMIS database. The data related to all educational institutions working in the province (public, private, Deeni Madaris, Non-formal etc.) should be maintained under one umbrella i.e. EMIS (Education Management Information System).

By developing Early Childhood Care and Education (ECCE) programmes, the efficiency of primary schools can be enhanced through more timely entry of young children into school system and less grade repetition, thus allowing additional enrolment.
Sindh

Sindh is one of the four provinces of Pakistan, covers an area of 140,914 Square Kilometer. The province has a total of 5.2 million population of 5-9 age group children, of these about 1.81 million were out-of-school in 2013-14.

In the National Plan of Action to Accelerate Education-Related MDGs (NPA), the province of Sindh has committed to achieve 80% Net Enrolment Rate (NER) by the year 2015-16. This chapter will present summary of the progress of Sindh province towards the achievement of NPA targets.

School Participation

The overall enrolment of age group 5-9 has slightly increased from 3.32 million in 2012-13 to 3.34 in 2013-14. This increase is not significant enough to achieve the targets for the year. A decreasing trend has been observed in almost all the districts except few. The highest relative increase in public sector primary enrolment occurred in district Nawab Shah where enrolment increased from 108,396 in 2012-13 to 114,151 in 2013-14.

![Figure S.1 Comparison of Enrolment Rates of Sindh](image)

**How close is Sindh to NPA Targets?**

The number of out-of-school children is falling in Sindh. Numbers decreased from 2 million (39% of 5-9 age-group of population) in 2012-13 to 1.8 million (35% of 5-9 age-group of population) by 2013-14. While progress has been made over the last two years, in the line of National Plan of Action (NPA), in bringing more children into schools, the pace remains too slow to achieve annual targets of NPA during 2013-14. The gap between targets and achievements is five percent in points – in other words 272,644 targeted out-of-school children are still deprived of their constitutional right to free school education. If past trend continues the Net Enrolment Ratio (NER) will be about 69% by 2014-15 and 73% by 2015-16. Figure 2 shows the targets envisaged in the NPA, compared with the actual achievements based on the data.
Completion of primary schooling by all enrolled students remains a major challenge, survival rate to grade V is low and grade repetition is higher. The survival rate to grade V has slightly improved from 51% to 55% during one year. The drop-out rate has decreased from 49% in 2012-13 to 45% in 2013-14. Gender wise comparison of survival rate to grade V for the years 2012-13 and 2013-14 is presented in Figure 6. Survival Rate not only provides information on the efficiency of the education system, this is also an in-direct indicator of quality of education in schools. Hence, the current progress shows that the quality of school education in Sindh is low. This dismal situation necessitates that Government of Sindh should invest additional financial resources for improving quality of teaching and learning in the schools.

The enrolment in Basic Education Community Schools (BECs) increased from 69,773 in 2012-13 to 81,098 in 2013-14, 16 percent increase during the year. The enrolment in Feeder Schools running under NCHD also increased from 148,400 to 168,074 during the year 2013-14. The BECS and NCHD schools are running under the umbrella of Federal Government. The Directorate of Literacy and Non-Formal Education is part of Education and Literacy
Department, Govt. of Sindh, and is responsible for programmes on literacy and non-formal education in the province. Directorate of Literacy and NFE has recently developed the Sindh Literacy Plan 2010-15 (as part of Sindh Education Sector Plan), with a vision of ‘Literate, educated and prosperous Sindh’. This plan aims to establish 2,000 new NFBE Centres by 2015. However, Directorate has not been provided required financial and human resources to achieve this target. Resultantly, it has limited professional and management capacity to implement literacy and non-formal basic education programmes effectively.

As has been observed that the quality of education in public sector institutions is not up-to the mark, therefore the overall number of enrolment in public primary schools has decreased from 2.5 million in 2012-13 to 2.4 million in 2013-14. The number of primary schools in Sindh has decreased from 42,900 in 2012-13 to 42,342 during 2013-14. The Sindh Education Sector Plan 2014-18 also provides guidelines for rationalization of schools and teachers. The number of classrooms in primary schools has also fallen from 79,317 in 2012-13 to 75,651 in 2013-14 as the number of schools with building has also decreased from 35,180 to 35,109. The main reason of this decline is floods of 2013, which affected three hundred villages of Naushero Feroze, Ghotki, Dadu, Nawabshah and Jamshoro districts of the province.

The targets envisaged in the NPA for 2012-13 and 2013-14 are compared with actual achievements during same years in the following table. It is clear from the statistics given in the below Table that the enrolment rate (NER) has gradually been increasing from 2012-13 to 2013-14. The gender parity index has declined from 0.82 in 2012-13 to 0.79 in 2013-14. By reducing the gap between boys and girls, the targets can be achieved more quickly within next two years.

**Table S.1---: Targets of NPA and Achievements by Sindh for the years 2012-13 and 2013-14**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>NER</th>
<th>OOSC</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>NPA</td>
<td>Actual</td>
<td>NPA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>NER</td>
<td>OOSC</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012-13</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>71%</td>
<td>67%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>59%</td>
<td>55%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>65%</td>
<td>61%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013-14</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>76%</td>
<td>72%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>64%</td>
<td>57%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>70%</td>
<td>65%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**How Sindh Has Taken-up NPA?**

During the Annual Progress Review Meeting on Implementation of National Plan of Action to Accelerate Education-Related MDGs with education managers and policy makers of the Education and Literacy Department, Sindh, it was pointed out that as a follow up of NPA, the following initiatives were taken during 2012-13 and 2013-14:

- Sindh Education Sector Plan (2014-18) has been developed.
• Development of District Education Plans is in progress.
• Early Childhood Education (ECE) has been introduced in schools
• Management cadre has been introduced.

**Key Challenges**

The Education and Literacy Department of Sindh has faced the following key challenges during the implementation of NPA.

- Adequate funds were not made available
- Rationalization of schools, funds, and teachers are missing and needed on urgent basis.
- Ethnic conflicts and some cultural values hinder education development
- Child Labor and Poverty

**Steps required for accelerating progress towards achievement of NPA targets in Sindh**

According to the evidence, Sindh is behind the set targets of NPA but these targets are still achievable if the following steps are taken on emergency basis as recommended during the annual progress review meeting.

- Develop a comprehensive policy for NFE and Adult Literacy (AL) supplemented with provision of required budget on a regular basis.
- Improve access to literacy and non-formal education, especially for girls in rural areas
- Improve quality and relevance of learning through curriculum reforms and provision of improved learning material.
- Build capacity of literacy and NFE teachers for improved student learning outcomes on a continuous basis
- Use innovative, technology based approaches for NFE with the help of private sector
- Strengthen management capacity of Directorate of L&NFBE in developing, implementing, monitoring, and evaluating standards for processes and outcomes
- Ensure that the Curriculum and Textbooks adequately address the issue of Social Cohesion
- Enhance community participation and ownership, and strengthen school-community linkages
- Understand and assess the capacity of the system to take a decision regarding mainstreaming children with special needs in education
- Increase transparency and involvement of public in decision making about school
- Increase effectiveness of School Management Committees
- Institutionalize research and development
- Develop / establish an independent data collection and monitoring system
- Prepare District Wise School Infrastructure Development Plans
- Ensure provision of Safe Learning Environment and Education for All
- Develop ECE policy and minimum standards
- Review and improve the ECE curriculum
- Ensure regular and sufficient supply of ECE teaching material to all schools.
• Create a separate cadre of ECE Teachers who have received specialized training in participatory and activity based teaching of young children

Strategy wise details of implementation of National Plan of Action in Sindh

Strategy a: Enrolment of new students in existing schools (under-utilized/closed schools) (50% of all new enrolment)

According to NPA total 448,970 out-of-school children will be enrolled under this strategy during 2013-16. Of these, 25% will be enrolled in public formal and 5% in public non formal schools and 10% in Deeni Madaris and other schools. Private schools are estimated to absorb another 10% students.

For the year 2013-14, 149,002 out-of-school children were planned to be enrolled in existing schools under ‘strategy a’ of the plan. The sector wise distribution of these children is shown in following table:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sector</th>
<th>203-14 Target for enrollment of OOS Children</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Public sector formal schools @25%</td>
<td>74,502</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public sector Non-formal and feeder schools @5%</td>
<td>14,900</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Private Sector Schools @10%</td>
<td>29,800</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deeni Madaris &amp; Others @10%</td>
<td>29,800</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total Children</strong></td>
<td><strong>149,002</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Unfortunately the data shows a disappointing picture as far as public sector is concerned. Instead of increasing the enrolment in public sector institutions, numbers of enrolled children has decreased from 2.55 million in 2012-13 to 2.44 million in 2013-14. However, 1,684 new children were enrolled in other public sector of education. The main reason behind this decrease is floods of 2013, which badly affected schools in most of the districts of the province. In public sector non-formal (BECS) schools, 11,325 new children were enrolled, which is about 11% of existing enrolment. The Feeder Schools running under NCHD enrolled 19,674 new children into the system. Overall, 30,999 new children were enrolled in non-formal education system, whereas the target was 14,900 out-of-school children. On the other hand, 59,096 new children were enrolled in private schools as compared to the target of 29,800 children. Private sector is performing overwhelmingly and contributing its share in reducing out-of-school children in the province. During the year, 20,444 new children were enrolled in Deeni Madaris whereas the target was 29,800. All the sectors except public sector performed well to reduce out-of-school children in the province. As a whole, 3,602 new students were enrolled in the existing institutions working under different education sectors in Sindh – only 2.4% of the target set under this strategy could be achieved. The Table below presents detailed information of targets and achievements of Sindh under Strategy a.
Table S. 3: Targets of OOSC children to be enrolled in existing schools and Actual Achievements by Sindh

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sector</th>
<th>Target of OOS Children to be enrolled during 2013-14</th>
<th>Actual Achievements: OOS Children enrolled (2013-14)</th>
<th>Actual Achievement of OOSC Target in % during 2013-14</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Public sector formal schools @25%</td>
<td>74,502</td>
<td>(106,937)</td>
<td>- 41%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public sector Non-formal and feeder schools @5%</td>
<td>14,900</td>
<td>30,999</td>
<td>208%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Private Sector Schools @10%</td>
<td>29,800</td>
<td>59,096</td>
<td>198%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deeni Madaris &amp; Others @10%</td>
<td>29,800</td>
<td>20,444</td>
<td>69%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Children</td>
<td>149,002</td>
<td>3,602</td>
<td>2.4%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Considering the current progress towards ‘Strategy a’ of the NPA, the targets for the remaining two years of the plan should be revised by equally dividing and adding the shortfall of current year into next two years. Details shown in following table.

Table S. 4--: Revised targets of Sindh with respect to Strategy a for the years 2014-15 and 2015-16

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sector</th>
<th>2013-14 (Actual Achievement)</th>
<th>2014-15</th>
<th>2015-16</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Formal Public Schools</td>
<td>(106,937)</td>
<td>165,398</td>
<td>166,024</td>
<td>224,485</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public sector Non-Formal and Feeder Schools</td>
<td>30,999</td>
<td>6,886</td>
<td>7,012</td>
<td>44,897</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Private Schools</td>
<td>59,096</td>
<td>15,224</td>
<td>15,474</td>
<td>89,794</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deeni Madaris</td>
<td>18,760</td>
<td>35,392</td>
<td>35,642</td>
<td>89,794</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>3,602</td>
<td>222,900</td>
<td>224,152</td>
<td>448,970</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Way Forward**

During the Annual Progress Review Meeting regarding Implementation of NPA, the following recommendations were made in order to achieve 100% targets of this strategy:

- Increase transparency and involvement of public in decision making
- Increase effectiveness of School Management Committees
- Institutionalize research and development
- Develop / establish an independent data collection and monitoring system
- Understand and assess the capacity of the system to take a decision regarding mainstreaming children with special needs in education
- Prepare District Wise School Infrastructure Development Plans
- Develop ECE policy and minimum standards
- Review the ECE curriculum
- Ensure regular and sufficient supply of ECE teaching material
- Create an ECE teaching cadre
Strategy b: Enrolment of new students in formal schools through provision of an additional classroom (10% of existing schools)

This strategy of the NPA is based on the provision of an additional classroom with a teacher in existing public institutions. Under this strategy, the province of Sindh had committed to provide one additional classroom in 993 formal public schools to accommodate 29,800 out-of-school children during 2013-14. However, educational statistics show that the number of classrooms in primary schools has decreased from 79,317 in 2012-13 to 75,651 in 2013-14. Progress is presented in the following Table:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>components</th>
<th>Target for 2013-14</th>
<th>Actual Achievements During 2013-14</th>
<th>Shortfalls Number and %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Number of New Class Rooms to be constructed in formal schools</td>
<td>993</td>
<td>(3,666)</td>
<td>4,659 (-369%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New OOS Children to be enrolled</td>
<td>29,800</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Under the current circumstances; the plan for the years 2014-15 and 2015-16 should be revised. The shortfall of the year 2013-14 should be divided and added in the next two years to achieve the targets by 2015-16:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>2013-14 Actual Achievements</th>
<th>2014-15</th>
<th>2015-16</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total OOS Children to be enrolled under strategy b</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>44,772</td>
<td>45,022</td>
<td>89,794</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of additional classrooms to be provided to formal public schools</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1,492</td>
<td>1,501</td>
<td>2,993</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Way forward

During the Annual Progress Review Meeting regarding Implementation of NPA, the following recommendations were agreed upon in order to achieve 100% targets of this strategy:

- Expedite and expand operation and maintenance of schools.
- Understand and assess the capacity of the system to take a decision regarding mainstreaming children with special needs in education
- Provision of required financial resources for opening of new classrooms
- Proper monitoring and communication mechanism should be established among different tiers and organs of Education and Literacy Department to implement this strategy of the plan.
Strategy c: Enrolment of children in new schools (40% of all new enrolments)

It is the most expensive strategy of the Plan under which 40% of total out-of-school children will be enrolled by constructing new formal and/or non-formal/feeder schools. Under this strategy, the plan envisioned to enroll 59,601 out-of-school children by opening 993 new formal schools, 29,800 children by opening 993 non-formal schools and 29,800 children by opening 993 new feeder schools during 2013-14. However, according to 2013-14 statistics the numbers of public sector formal, non-formal and feeder schools have actually decreased in Sindh. Total enrolment in Sindh at Primary level (combined enrolment of public, other public and private schools) was 3,821,191 during 2012-13, which declined to 3,775,034, and net decrease of 46,157 students. This reduction in enrolment can be attributed to the fact that number of public sector formal primary school decreased from 42,900 during 2012-13 to 42,342 only, a net reduction of 468 schools. It appears that Sindh Education and Literacy Department has closed down 468 ghost or non-functional schools during the year, and resultanty children enrolled on papers in such schools have also been removed from the official data base (Tables 2.2 and 1.3 of Pakistan Education Statistics 2012-13 and 2013-14). On the other side, number of NFE Schools (BECS and Feeder Schools by NCHD) also decreased from 5,978 during 2012-13 to only 5,074 in 2013-14, a net reduction of 904 schools. Nonetheless, an increase of 30,999 in the enrolment in these NFE schools has been observed.

During the Annual Progress Review Meeting regarding Implementation of NPA with education managers of Sindh it was pointed out that a proper monitoring and coordination mechanism does not exist in the province for implementation of this strategy.

Under the light of current status the targets for the next two years of the plan should be revised by equally dividing and adding the shortfall of the year 2013-14 into targets of next two years as per details given below:

```
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>2014-15</th>
<th>2015-16</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Children to be enrolled in new formal schools</td>
<td>89,543</td>
<td>90,045</td>
<td>179,588</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of new formal schools to be opened</td>
<td>1,492</td>
<td>1,501</td>
<td>2,993</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Children to be enrolled in new Non-Formal schools</td>
<td>44,772</td>
<td>45,022</td>
<td>89,794</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of new Non-Formal schools to be opened</td>
<td>1,492</td>
<td>1,501</td>
<td>2,993</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Children to be enrolled in new Feeder schools</td>
<td>44,772</td>
<td>45,022</td>
<td>89,794</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of new Feeder schools to be opened</td>
<td>1,492</td>
<td>1,501</td>
<td>2,993</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
```

Way forward

During the Annual Progress Review Meeting regarding Implementation of NPA the following recommendations were made by the participants in order to achieve 100% targets of this strategy:

- Prepare District Wise School Infrastructure Development Plans
• Develop a comprehensive policy for NFE and AL followed by provision of budget for these sub sectors on a regular basis.
• Improve access to literacy and non-formal education especially for girls in rural areas
• Use innovative, technology based approaches for NFE with the help of private sector

**Strategy d: Targeted Incentives for access and retention of students from disadvantaged groups (15% of all enrolments)**

It is stated in Sindh chapter of NPA under strategy d “of all primary enrolments (old and new), 15% of the students will be provided incentives for access and retention in primary schools. In Sindh, 2.2 million children will be targeted in 3 years and provided incentives (equivalent to Rs. 3,000 per child per year) at a cost of Rs. 6.6 billion” (page 173).

Under this strategy, 677,749 students were envisaged to be provided incentives equivalent to Rs. 2,033 million during school year 2013-14. Currently, the Government of Sindh is providing free textbooks to students and no fees are charged. However, stationary and transport cost continue to be borne by the parents. The strategy is not fully implemented in the province due to lack of financial resources and lack of proper monitoring and coordination mechanisms in the Department.

**Way forward**

During the Annual Progress Review Meeting regarding Implementation of NPA the following recommendations were made in order to achieve 100% targets of this strategy:

• Conducive environment should be provided in the classrooms
• Incentives for students like stipends for poor and needy students, food or school lunch program etc.
• Effective monitoring system should be introduced
• Financial resources may be provided on time

**Conclusion and Recommendations**

Evidence reviewed in this part of the report demonstrates progress towards four innovative strategies adopted in NPA 2013-16. It is clear from the facts and figures that Sindh has not been able to achieve the targets envisaged in the NPA for the year 2013-14. Sindh needs to multiply its efforts for achieving goals of MDG 2 and Education For All. Sindh was the first province which passed Right of Children to Free and Compulsory Education Act during February 2013. This Act, passed by Sindh Assembly clearly states that it will come into force with immediate effect. Although certain good initiatives for improving educational governance in Sindh has been launched, nonetheless, implementation of this Act has not started yet in practical terms.

The weakest area identified during the progress review process was public sector of education in the province. Although the government has taken some steps to increase the enrolment in the government schools, but still required level of efforts have not been launched by the
province. To attract out of school children in public sector schools, the government needs to enhance the quality of teaching and learning in the government schools.

The main reason identified during the process was lack of financial resources for the implementation of four strategies of the Plan. Another reason is the lack or non-existence of monitoring, coordination and communication mechanisms within the education department and with other relevant departments including Finance and Planning departments.

Enrolment campaigns should be launched all over the province with special focus on the areas where enrolment rate is low.

It is also apparent that Sindh will only be able to achieve the goal of quality education for all through pro-equity programs and bridging the gaps in education to reach vulnerable and excluded children and it is only possible if children of that group in the society are identified and reached out.

The EMIS cell should be strengthened by providing all the required human, financial, and material resources (Man, Money and Machinery) to cater to all the data needs for educational planning and policy making. The district EMIS cells should also be made functional by providing at-least two staff members and one computer in each district. The EMIS should not only maintain the educational statistics but also compile finance and population related data. The decisions regarding opening of new schools, construction of classrooms, provision of physical facilities, hiring of new teachers should be supported by EMIS database. The data related to all educational institutions working in the province (public, private, Deeni Madaris, Non-formal etc.) should be maintained under one umbrella i.e. EMIS.

By developing ECCE programmes, the performance of primary schools can be improved through more timely entry of young children into school system and reduced grade repetition, thus allowing additional enrolment.
Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KP)

Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KP) is one of the four provinces of Pakistan covering an area of 74,521 Square Kilometer. The province has total 2.9 million population of 5-9 age group children, of these about 0.43 million were out-of-school during 2013-14.

In the National Plan of Action to Accelerate Education-Related MDGs (NPA), the province of KP had committed to reach at 95% Net Enrolment Rate by the year 2015-16. This chapter will present and analyze information about the progress of the province towards the achievement of targets of NPA.

School Participation

The overall number of primary school children (age group 5-9) has increased from 2,399,442 in 2012-13 to 2,482,529 in 2013-14. This increase is essentially the result of conscious efforts by the Elementary and Secondary Education Department of the province. The highest relative increase in public sector primary enrolment took place in district Peshawar where enrolment increased from 177,401 in 2012-13 to 192,200 in 2013-14. On the other hand, the overall enrolment in district Lower Dir decreased from 158,868 in 2012-13 to 154,587 in 2013-14. Net Enrolment Ratio (NER) also increased slightly from 83% during 2012-13 to 85% by 2013-14.

![Figure K-1 Comparison of Enrolment Rates in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (2012-13 to 2013-14)](image)

How close is KP to NPA Targets?

The number of out-of-school children has fallen in KP. It has decreased, from 482,413 (17% of 5-9 age-group of the population) in 2012-13 to 433,346 (15% of 5-9 age-group of the population) in 2013-14. While some progress has been made over the last two years, in the line of National Plan of Action (NPA), in bringing more children into schools, the pace remains too slow to achieve NPA targets during 2013-14. However, the gap between targets and
achievements is only one percent in points – in other words 34,845 targeted out-of-school children are still deprived of their right to free school education. If past trend continues, the Net Enrolment Ratio (NER) will be about 87% in 2014-15 and 89% by 2015-16. If present pace is not enhanced, it will not be possible to achieve the NPA target of 95% NER by the year 2015. Figure 2 shows the targets envisaged in the NPA compared with the actual achievements based on data.

**Figure K.2: Year and Gender wise Targets and Achievements in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa**

Completion of primary level education by enrolled children is a major challenge. Survival rate to grade V is low and grade repetition is higher in KP. The Survival Rate to Grade V has decreased considerably from 80% to 71% during one year – this situation is disappointing. On the other hand, the drop-out rate has increased from 20% to 29%. Gender wise comparison of Survival Rate to grade V for the years 2012-13 and 2013-14 is given in the Figure 3; Survival Rate provides an in-direct information on the quality of the school system. Hence, current deteriorating trend of Survival Rate and Dropout Rate shows that the quality of education system in KP is poor. There is a need to pay more attention on quality, side by side with the efforts to expand access.
The enrolment in Basic Education Community Schools (BECS) has slightly decreased from 48,714 in 2012-13 to 48,430 in 2013-14 – decline by 1 percent in points during the year. An enormous decrease in the number and enrolment of Feeder Schools running under NCHD has been observed in KP during the year. Number of Feeder Schools in KP decreased from 732 in 2012-13 to only 96 by 2013-14. Accordingly, enrolment in Feeder Schools also decreased from 25,620 in 2012-13 to only 4,879 in 2013-14. The BECS and NCHD schools are running under the umbrella of Federal Government and reduction in their number and enrolment cannot be attributed to the provincial government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. During the Progress Review Meeting regarding NPA it was stated that 1,000 new non-formal and community schools will be opened in the next year.

The overall number of enrolment in public primary schools has increased from 2,157,688 in 2012-13 to 2,187,002 in 2013-14. On the other hand, the number of primary schools in KP has decreased from 23,517 in 2012-13 to 23,291 as a result of process of rationalization. Schools which have been closed down were in fact shelter-less or without any building. Four (4) shelter-less schools were provided new buildings with 24 classrooms, whereas 220 new classrooms were constructed in existing primary schools.

The targets envisaged in NPA for 2012-13 and 2013-14 versus actual achievements during same years can be viewed in the following table. It can be concluded that the enrolment rate is gradually but slowly increasing from 2012-13 to 2013-14 and onwards. The gender parity index is almost the same i.e. 0.7. By reducing the gap between boys and girls, the targets can be achieved more rapidly within next two years.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>NER NPA</th>
<th>NER Actual</th>
<th>OOSC NPA</th>
<th>OOSC Actual</th>
<th>Missing Targets</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2012-13</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>94%</td>
<td>96%</td>
<td>91,805</td>
<td>58,163</td>
<td>2% +33,642</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>70%</td>
<td>69%</td>
<td>415,633</td>
<td>424,250</td>
<td>(1%) 8,617</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>82%</td>
<td>83%</td>
<td>507,438</td>
<td>482,413</td>
<td>1% +25,025</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The enrolment rate and survival rate are shown in the following chart.

Figure K.3 Gender and Year wise Survival Rate to V in KP

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Male</th>
<th>Female</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2012-13</td>
<td>89%</td>
<td>75%</td>
<td>83%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013-14</td>
<td>67%</td>
<td>65%</td>
<td>71%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Above Table shows that although KP has not been able to achieve NPA targets, yet its NER is increasing slowly and number of OOSC is also decreasing gradually over the years. If we compare NER and OOSC figures of 2012-13 and 2013-14 this trend is clearly visible.

**How KP Has Taken-up NPA?**

During Annual Progress Review Meeting on Implementation of National Plan of Action to Accelerate Education-Related MDGs with education managers and policy makers of the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, it was reported that in the follow up of NPA the following initiatives have been taken during 2012-13 and 2013-14:

- Enrollment Campaigns were launched at the start and middle of the academic year
- Establishment and activation of Parent Teacher Councils (PTCs) for enhancing enrollment and provision of basic facilities to the schools
- Independent Monitoring Unit (IMU) has been established in the province to regularly monitor various aspects of the education system in the province.
- Stipend for girl students and incentives for teachers in hard areas (hard area allowance) are being provided.
- Additional classrooms were constructed in existing schools and new buildings were provided to shelter-less schools.
- 1000 non-formal education (community schools) are planned to be opened in the near future.
- Vouchers Scheme is introduced through Public-Private Partnership Programme
- Revamping of education foundation
- Rokhana Pakhtunkhwa Taleemi program
- Corporal Punishment is reduced and complaint cell is established
- Tameer-e-school Programme (additional room basic facility )
- Free textbooks
- Capacity building of teachers in order to enhance the quality of education.
- School based recruitment through NTS test

**Key Challenges**

The Elementary and Secondary Education Department of KP has faced following key challenges during the implementation of NPA.

- Political Interference
- Lack of public awareness about need and significance of school education for children
- Improper utilization of funds
• Centralization of authority and inadequate devolution of powers to district and local level tiers
• Terrorism and poor law and order situation in the province
• Gender disparity due to low status of women in the society
• Gap between policy makers and implementers
• Insufficient trainings for Teachers, Administrators, PTCs and Community

Steps required accelerating the progress towards the achievement of NPA targets

According to the evidence, KP is behind the set targets of NPA but these targets are still achievable if the following steps are taken on emergency basis as recommended during annual progress review meeting.

• ECE class rooms may be established in each school. Young children of below age 5 may be admitted for ECE classes
• Regular campaigns, strict implementation of education policy, reward and punishment mechanisms
• Third Party validation of data
• Mechanisms should be put in place for Inter-provincial and international Level coordination
• Capacity building of education personnel

Strategy wise details of implementation of National Plan of Action
Strategy a: Enrolment of new students in existing schools (under-utilized/closed schools) (50% of all new enrolment)

According to NPA, a total of 224,572 out-of-school children will be enrolled under this strategy during 2013-16. Of these, 25% will be enrolled in public formal and 5% in public Non formal schools and 10% in Deeni Madaris and other schools. Private schools are estimated to absorb another 10% students.

For the year 2013-14, 68,835 out-of-school children were planned to be enrolled in the existing schools under ‘strategy a’ of the plan. The sector wise distribution of these children is shown in following table:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sector</th>
<th>No. of Children</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Public sector formal schools @25%</td>
<td>34,417</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public sector Non- formal and feeder schools @5%</td>
<td>6,883</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Private Sector Schools @10%</td>
<td>13,767</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deeni Madaris &amp; Others @10%</td>
<td>13,767</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total Children</strong></td>
<td><strong>68,835</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Of the target 34,417 out-of-school children, 29,314 children are enrolled in existing public sector formal schools – 85% of NPA target is achieved. This means that public sector is
performing well but not enough to achieve targets. The enrolment in public sector non-formal (BECS) schools has been slightly decreased by 0.58% during the year, however a huge decline of about 81% has been observed in Non-formal Feeder schools (NCHD). On the other hand, 36,690 new children were enrolled in private schools as compared to 13,767 target children. Private sector is performing overwhelmingly and contributing its share in reducing out-of-school children in the province. During the year 8,639 children were enrolled in Deeni Madaris whereas the target was 13,767. Overall 65,393 new students were enrolled in existing institutions working under different education sectors in KP – 95% of targets set under this strategy has been achieved. The only sector which is under performing is non-formal education. There is a need to increase the role of non-formal education in KP. The following Table presents a holistic comparative view of targets and achievements of Strategy a in case of KP province:

Table K.3. : Targets of OOSC children to be enrolled in existing schools and Actual Achievements of Strategy a by KP

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sector</th>
<th>Target of OOS Children to be enrolled during 2013-14</th>
<th>Actual Achievements: OOS Children enrolled (2013-14)</th>
<th>Actual Achievements of OOSC Target in % during 2013-14</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Public sector formal schools @25%</td>
<td>34,417</td>
<td>29,314</td>
<td>85%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public sector Non-formal and feeder schools @5%</td>
<td>6,883</td>
<td>(14,002)</td>
<td>-301%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Private Sector Schools @10%</td>
<td>13,767</td>
<td>36,690</td>
<td>267%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deeni Madaris&amp; Others @10%</td>
<td>13,767</td>
<td>13,391</td>
<td>98%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Children</td>
<td>68,835</td>
<td>65,393</td>
<td>95%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Considering the current progress towards ‘Strategy a’ of the plan the targets for the remaining two years of the plan should be revised by equally dividing the shortfall of current year into next two years as shown in following table:

Table K.4.: Revised targets of KP for the years 2014-15 and 2015-16 for Strategy a

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>2013-14 (Actual Achievement)</th>
<th>2014-15</th>
<th>2015-16</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Formal Public Schools</td>
<td>29,314</td>
<td>41,131</td>
<td>41,841</td>
<td>112,286</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public sector Non-Formal and Feeder Schools</td>
<td>(14,002)</td>
<td>18,158</td>
<td>18,301</td>
<td>22,457</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Private Schools</td>
<td>36,690</td>
<td>4,112</td>
<td>4,112</td>
<td>44,914</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deeni Madaris</td>
<td>13,767</td>
<td>15,432</td>
<td>15,716</td>
<td>44,915</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>65,769</td>
<td>78,833</td>
<td>79,970</td>
<td>224,572</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Way Forward

During the Annual Progress Review Meeting regarding Implementation of NPA, the following recommendations were made in order to achieve 100% targets of this strategy:
• PTCs should be empowered
• Community Participation in schools should be strengthened
• Third Party Validation for cross checking of data and monitoring of progress.

Strategy b: Enrolment of new students in formal schools through provision of an additional classroom (10% of existing schools)

This strategy b of the Plan aims to provide an additional classroom along with a teacher in the existing public sector schools. Under this strategy, KP had committed to provide one additional classroom in 459 formal public schools to accommodate 13,767 out of school children during 2013-14. However, statistics show that only 244 new class rooms were constructed in the primary schools, of these, 24 were constructed in 4 new buildings of shelter-less schools under Tameer-e-School program during the year. Rest of the classrooms were constructed in 220 existing schools. Under this strategy only 6,600 out-of-school were accommodated in formal public sector schools. The Elementary and Secondary Education Department of KP has framed a policy of providing additional classrooms in existing schools to increase access. Under this policy, 800 new classrooms will be constructed by the end of 2013-14 and 3,000 new classrooms are proposed for the year 2014-15. Tameer-e-School program is launched to provide additional classrooms and missing facilities to the existing schools. The following Table presents data about Targets and Achievements in KP during 2013-14 with respect to Strategy b:

**Table K.5. : Targets and Achievement of Strategy b in KP during 2013-14:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Components</th>
<th>Target for 2013-14</th>
<th>Actual Achievements During 2013-14</th>
<th>Shortfalls</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Number of New Class Rooms to be constructed in formal schools</td>
<td>459</td>
<td>220</td>
<td>-52%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New OOS Children to be enrolled</td>
<td>13,767</td>
<td>6,600</td>
<td>-52%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Under the current circumstances, the plan for the years 2014-15 and 2015-16 should be revised. The shortfall of the year 2013-14 should be divided and added in the targets of next two years to achieve the final target of NPA by 2015-16:

**Table K.6 : Revised targets of KP for Strategy b for the years 2014-15 and 2015-16**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Components</th>
<th>2013-14 Actual Achievements</th>
<th>2014-15</th>
<th>2015-16</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total OOS Children to be enrolled under strategy b</td>
<td>6,600</td>
<td>19,014</td>
<td>19,300</td>
<td>44,914</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of additional classrooms to be provided to formal public schools</td>
<td>220</td>
<td>633</td>
<td>644</td>
<td>1,497</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Way forward**

During the Annual Progress Review Meeting regarding Implementation of NPA, the following recommendations were made by the participants for achieving 100% targets of this strategy:
• Need based construction of classrooms in schools. A need based survey may be conducted to find out the schools where there is a need and space is available to construct additional classrooms.
• Empower/capacity building of PTCs
• Media campaign should be launched to motivate community to provide new classrooms in non-formal and Feeder Schools.
• Donors Conference for mobilization of international support for missing facilities in schools.

Strategy c: Enrolment of children in new schools (40% of all new enrolments)
It is the most expensive strategy of the Plan in which 40% of total out-of-school children will be enrolled by constructing new formal and/or non-formal/feeder schools. Under this strategy, the Plan envisioned to enroll 55,068 out-of-school children in 459 new formal, 459 new non-formal, and 459 new feeder schools during 2013-14. The distribution of opening of new schools under different sectors is reflected in following table:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sector</th>
<th>Number of new schools to be opened during 2013-14</th>
<th>Children to be enrolled in new schools during 2013-14</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Formal primary school</td>
<td>459</td>
<td>27,534</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-formal primary schools</td>
<td>459</td>
<td>13,767</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Feed schools (grade I-III)</td>
<td>459</td>
<td>13,767</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>1,377</td>
<td>55,068</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

According to 2013-14 statistics, the numbers of primary schools decreased from 23,517 in 2012-13 to 23,291 in 2013-14. 226 schools closed down during the year were shelter-less having no building of their own. A declining trend has also been observed in the number of non-formal and feeder schools. The following Table compares achievements with NPA targets of KP with respect to Strategy c.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S. No</th>
<th>Type of Schools and Enrolment</th>
<th>Target for 2013-14</th>
<th>Actual Achievements During 2013-14</th>
<th>Shortfall in %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Number New of Schools</td>
<td>OOSC To be enrolled</td>
<td>Actual Number of Schools</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Formal Primary Schools</td>
<td>459</td>
<td>27,534</td>
<td>(226)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>NFE (BECS)</td>
<td>459</td>
<td>13,767</td>
<td>(236)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Feeder Schools (NCHD)</td>
<td>459</td>
<td>13,767</td>
<td>(636)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td>1,377</td>
<td>5,068</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

During the Annual Progress Review Meeting regarding Implementation of NPA with education managers of KP, it was stated that the government has introduced rationalization policy to
close underutilized schools and open new schools on need basis. It was also pointed out that proper monitoring and coordination mechanisms do not exist in the province for implementation of this strategy.

Under the light of current status the targets for the next two years of the plan should be revised by equally dividing the gap and adding into the targets of next two years as per details given in the following Table:

| Table K.8 : Revised Targets of Strategy c for Khyber Pakhtunkhwa |
|------------------|------------------|------------------|
| **2014-15**      | **2015-16**      | **Total**        |
| Children to be enrolled in new formal schools | 44,631 | 45,198 | 89,829 |
| Number of new formal schools to be opened    | 744    | 753    | 1,497  |
| Children to be enrolled in new Non-Formal schools | 22,320 | 22,594 | 44,914 |
| Number of new Non-Formal schools to be opened | 744    | 753    | 1,497  |
| Children to be enrolled in new Feeder schools  | 22,320 | 22,594 | 44,914 |
| Number of new Feeder schools to be opened     | 744    | 753    | 1,497  |

**Way forward**

During the Annual Progress Review Meeting regarding Implementation of NPA the following recommendations were made by the participants to achieve 100% targets of this strategy:

- Schools may be established on merit/need basis. A need assessment survey may be conducted to identify the areas where new schools are really needed
- Allocation of enough funds for purchase of land for construction of schools as per need

**Strategy d: Targeted Incentives for access and retention for disadvantaged groups and girls (15% of all enrolments)**

It is stated in KP chapter of NPA under strategy d that “Of all primary enrolments (old and new), 15% of the students will be provided incentives for access and retention in primary schools. In KP, almost 1.5 million children will be targeted and provided incentives (equivalent to Rs. 3,000 per child per year) at a cost of about Rs. 4.5 billion” (page 131)

Under this strategy, 469,402 students were to be offered incentives equivalent to Rs. 1,408 million during school year 2013-14. Currently, the Government of KP is providing free textbooks to students and no fees are charged. However stationary and transport cost continues to be borne by the parents. The strategy is not fully implemented in the KP province due to lack of financial resources.

School Improvement Program (SIP) is started in the province in order to provide missing facilities to the schools. Rs. 6.2 billion has been approved under this program. The government is also providing stipends to the girls of class 6-10 to retain them in the schools. Hard area allowance for female teachers is also introduced to retain the female teachers in schools of hard areas like districts Kohistan and Torghar.
Way forward

During the Annual Progress Review Meeting regarding Implementation of NPA the following recommendations were supported by the participants to achieve 100% targets of this strategy:

- ECCE in all schools with trained teachers and conducive environment
- Community mobilization through awareness campaigns.
- Sports facilities for primary level
- Primary schools must be established following a planned criteria.
- Stipend may start from K.G to 5th class
- Free uniform
- Teachers training may be arranged during vacations.
- Bio metric system in every school

Conclusion and Recommendations

Evidence reviewed in this part of the report demonstrates progress towards four innovative strategies adopted in NPA 2013-16. It is clear from facts and figures that KP could not achieve the targets envisaged in NPA for the year 2013-14. However, the province is very close to the targets.

The weakest area identified during the progress review process was non-formal education in the province. The government should pay more attention on non-formal education to cater to the learning needs of more out of school children. The community may be involved through motivation campaigns to open new non-formal and community schools where no formal schools exist within the catchment area, especially for the girls.

The main reason identified during the process was lack of financial resources for the implementation of four strategies of the Plan. Another reason is lack or non-existence of coordination, monitoring and communication mechanisms within the education department and among other concerned departments including finance and planning departments.

Although an enrolment campaign is launched every year to enroll new children, however to make this campaign successful a need assessment survey should be conducted. These need assessment surveys should identify the exact areas where schools have capacity to enroll more students and there is enough population of 5-9 age group in the area who are not going to school.

It is also apparent that we will only be able to achieve the goal of quality education for all through pro-equity programs and by bridging the gaps in education to reach vulnerable and excluded children. This will be possible only if we are able to first identify that group.

The EMIS Cell should be strengthened by providing all the required resources (Man, Money and Machinery) to cater to all the data needs for educational planning and policy making. The district EMIS Cells should also be made functional by providing at least two staff members.
and one computer in each district. The EMIS should not only maintain data relating to educational statistics, but also finance and population related information. The decision regarding opening of new schools, construction of classrooms, provision of physical facilities, hiring of new teachers should be supported by EMIS database. The data related to all educational institutions working in the province (public, private, Deeni Madaris, non-formal etc.) should be maintained under one umbrella i.e. EMIS.

By developing ECCE programmes, the functioning of primary schools can be improved through more timely entry of young children into the school system and lesser grade repetition, thus allowing additional enrolment in the same schools.
**Balochistan**

Balochistan is the largest province of Pakistan in terms of area. It covers an area of 347,190 Square Kilometer and constitutes 44% of Pakistan’s total land mass. The province has total 1.1 million population of 5-9 age group children, of these about 0.54 million are out-of-school in 2013-14.

In the National Plan of Action to Accelerate Education-Related MDGs (NPA), the province of Balochistan had committed to reach at 60% Net Enrolment Rate (NER) by the year 2015-16. This chapter will present and analyze information about the progress of the province towards the achievement of NPA targets.

**School Participation**

Total enrolment in primary education increased from 670,143 in 2012-13 to 684,402 in 2013-14, an overall increase of 2.13% in one year. This increase is essentially due to some special efforts made by the Secondary Education Department. The highest relative increase in primary enrolment has been documented in district Barkhan where enrolment increased from 8,995 in 2012-13 to 11,681by 2013-14, that is 30 percent increase in one year. On the other hand, the overall enrolment in district Loralai dropped by 29%, i.e., from 22,442 in 2012-13 to 16,003 in 2013-14. Loralai is one of those districts of Balochistan which were badly affected by August 2013 floods.

**Figure B.1 : Comparison of Enrolment Rates in Balochistan during 2012-13 and 2013-14**

![Graph showing enrolment rates](#)

**How close is Balochistan to NPA Targets?**

The number of out-of-school children is dropping in Balochistan, having fallen from 563,213 (50% of 5-9 age-group of population) in 2012-13 to 536,338 (46% of 5-9 age-group of population) in 2013-14. While progress has been made over the last two years, in the line of National Plan of Action (NPA), in bringing more children into the schools, the pace remains

---

1 Provincial Disaster Management Authority (PDMA)
too slow to achieve NPA targets during 2013-14. However, the gap between targets and achievements is only one percent in points – in other words, 3,392 more out-of-school children should have been in the schools. If past trend continues, the Net Enrolment Ratio (NER) will be about 56% in 2014-15 and 59% by 2015-16. By keeping the same pace of 3% annual reduction in the out-of-school children, it will not be possible to achieve the NPA targets of 60% by the year 2015. In order to achieve the targets by 2015, 1,696 more children should be enrolled in 2014-15 and 2015-16. Figure 2 shows the targets envisaged in NPA as compared with the actual achievements based on the data.

**Figure B.2: Year and Gender wise Targets and Achievements of Balochistan**

Completion of primary education up to Grade 5 by all children enrolled in Grade 1 remains a major concern. Survival rate to grade V is low and grade repetition is higher. Survival Rate to grade V has slightly improved from 49% to 50% during one year, which is not an encouraging situation. The drop-out rate also decreased slightly from 50% to 49%. Gender wise comparison of Survival Rate to grade V for the years 2012-13 and 2013-14 is reflected in figure 3. As Survival Rate provides useful information on quality, therefore, current statistics of low Survival Rate indicate that the quality of school education in Balochistan is not good. There is a need to pay more attention on quality dimension along with expanding access.
The enrolment in Basic Education Community Schools (BECs) decreased from 27,379 in 2012-13 to 21,675 in 2013-14 – a 21% drop in one year. The enrolment in NCHD schools also decreased from 42,140 in 2012-13 to only 18,153 in 2013-14 – a huge decrease of 57% in one year. However, it is worth mentioning here that BECs and NCHD schools are being managed and financed by the Federal Government and this reverse trend cannot be attributed to provincial Education Department. In Balochistan, Directorate of Literacy and NFE under provincial Social Welfare Department and Balochistan Education Foundation (BEF) have been mandated to plan and manage literacy and non-formal basic education programmes. BEF has opened 197 Fellowship schools with the assistance of the private sector and subsidizes another 500 schools that meet its criteria. The BEF has also developed community schools in areas with no schools. Unfortunately, the data of students enrolled in these institutions has not been made available by provincial authorities. However, it has been committed by provincial authorities that next education census of 2014-15 will reflect the complete picture of education in the province, including data on non-formal schools.

The overall number of primary schools has increased from 10,484 in 2012-13 to 10,585 in 2013-14. Nonetheless, the number of shelter-less schools has also risen from 796 to 1,042 during 2013-14. The main reason of increase in shelter-less schools is 2013 floods, which affected the eight districts of Balochistan (Naseerabad, Jaffarabad, Jhal Magsi, Kech, Sibi, Loralai, Quetta, and Khuzdar).

The total number of classrooms in primary schools has also decreased from 18,297 to 17,912 during 2013-14 – a 2% decrease in one year.

A comparison of targets envisaged in the NPA for 2012-13 and 2013-14 against actual achievements during same years can be viewed in the following table. It can be clearly seen that the gender gap has increased during 2013-14. The NER of boys increased from 55% to 54% while the NER of girls increased from 47% to 45%.

2 Balochistan Education Sector Plan 2013-17
3 The News, August 05, 2013
60%, while the target was 58%. Whereas NER of girls increased from 43% to 45% only, while the target was 48%. About 14,152 additional boys were enrolled during 2013-14 as compared to the NPA target, while 17,544 lesser girls could be enrolled. By reducing the gap between boys and girls, the targets of NPA can be achieved more efficiently within next two years.

### Table B.1: Targets and Achievements of Balochistan for the years 2012-13 and 2013-14

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>NER NPA</th>
<th>Actual</th>
<th>NER OOSC</th>
<th>Actual</th>
<th>Missing Targets</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>56%</td>
<td>55%</td>
<td>267,066</td>
<td>267,066</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>44%</td>
<td>43%</td>
<td>296,147</td>
<td>296,147</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012-13</td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>51%</td>
<td>50%</td>
<td>555,880</td>
<td>563,213</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>58%</td>
<td>60%</td>
<td>256,532</td>
<td>242,380</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>48%</td>
<td>45%</td>
<td>276,414</td>
<td>293,958</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013-14</td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>54%</td>
<td>53%</td>
<td>532,946</td>
<td>536,338</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**How Balochistan Has Taken-up NPA?**

During annual progress review meeting on implementation of National Plan of Action to Accelerate Education-Related MDGs with education managers and policy makers of the Balochistan, it was stated that as part of the follow up of NPA, the following initiatives have been taken during 2012-13 and 2013-14:

- Developed Balochistan Education Sector Plan (BESP) 2013-18 and most of the features of NPA strategies have been integrated into this plan. Such as:
  - Establishment of New schools;
  - Enrolment campaigns;
  - Provisions of free text books;
  - Teacher’s professional development; and
  - Provision of missing facilities etc. in the schools
- Induction of 5000 teachers and their selection through NTS (National Testing Service)
- Plans have been developed for providing new classrooms in the existing schools
- Proposals have been prepared for opening of new schools through government and donors funding. Global Partnership for Education (GPE) has given approval for financing the establishment of 2000 new schools
- Established Alternative Learning Paths (ALPs) Centers in 8 district (UNICEF focused districts)
- Established Gender Free zone in Primary schools with 2 Female teachers in each school

**Key Challenges**

The Secondary Education Department of Balochistan faced following key challenges during the implementation of NPA.

- Political interference;
- Improper implementation mechanism;
- Communication gaps within the education department, and lack of coordination with other concerned departments;
- Paucity of financial resources;
Poverty and tribal culture in most parts of the province;
Poor law and order situation;
Lack of awareness of parents about benefits of education for their children;
Education and population related data is not available on time for evidence based planning and decision making
Scattered population of the province

Steps required for accelerating the progress towards the achievement of NPA targets

According to the evidence, Balochistan is still behind the set targets of NPA. Nevertheless; these targets are still achievable if the following steps are taken on emergency basis as recommended during annual progress review meeting.

- Allocation of financial and human resources
- Proper monitoring and evaluation mechanisms should be put in place
- Awareness seminars /workshops for politicians
- Positive role of Media
- Community participation
- Involvement of Private Sector through Public Private Partnership (PPP)
- Proper utilization of available resources
- Use of mother tongue at primary level as medium of instruction
- Award for best students at school/district levels under the Chief Ministers’ Innovative Programme

Strategy wise details of implementation of National Plan of Action

**Strategy a: Enrolment of new students in existing schools (under-utilized/closed schools)**

NPA envisaged that a total of 137,431 out-of-school children will be enrolled in primary education in Balochistan during the period of the plan. Of these, 41,229 (30%) will be enrolled under this strategy by the year 2015-16. Public sector will accommodate 20% of 41,229 children. While rest of 10% target will be assigned as 2%, 3% and 5% to Non-formal and Feeder Schools, private schools, and Deeni Madaris, respectively.

For the year 2013-14, 13,217 out-of-school children were planned to be enrolled in existing schools under ‘strategy a’ of the plan. The sector wise distribution of 13,217 children is shown in the following table:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sector</th>
<th>No. of Children</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Public sector formal schools @20%</td>
<td>8,812</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public sector Non- formal and feeder schools @2%</td>
<td>881</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Private Sector Schools @3%</td>
<td>1,322</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deeni Madaris &amp; Others @5%</td>
<td>2,202</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total Children</strong></td>
<td><strong>13,217</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Of 8,812 out-of-school children to be enrolled during 2013-14, only 5,262 children could be enrolled in the existing public sector formal schools – 60% of NPA target for 2013-14 has been achieved. The enrolment in public sector non-formal and feeder schools has decreased instead of envisaged increase of 2%. It decreased from 69,519 during 2012-13 to only 39,828 in 2013-14. The target set for private sector in NPA has been achieved as the enrolment increased from 93,581 in 2012-13 to 96,388 in 2013-14 – an increase of 3% has been observed during the year. During the same year 3,831 children were enrolled in Deeni Madaris, whereas the target was 2,202. Other public formal schools (APS, OPF etc.) are also playing a significant role in reducing number of out-of-school children in Balochistan. Overall, 12,200 new students were enrolled in existing institutions working under different sub sectors of education in Balochistan – 92% of targets set under ‘Strategy a’ has been achieved. The only sector which is under performing is Non-formal Education (NFE). There is a need to increase the role of Non-formal Education in Balochistan. Since the non-formal education system is running under Social Welfare Department (SWD), a proper mechanism of coordination between SWD and Education Department does not exist in Balochistan. The following Table presents detailed information about progress of Balochistan under Strategy a.

### Table B.3: Targets and Achievements of Balochistan under Strategy a
Number of OOSC children to be enrolled in existing schools of Balochistan (30% of new enrolment)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sector</th>
<th>Target No. of Children</th>
<th>Actual Achievements</th>
<th>% of Achievements</th>
<th>Shortfall</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Public sector formal schools @20%</td>
<td>8,812</td>
<td>5,562</td>
<td>63%</td>
<td>3250</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public sector Non-formal and feeder schools @2%</td>
<td>881</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>881</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Private Sector Schools @3%</td>
<td>1,322</td>
<td>2,807</td>
<td>212%</td>
<td>(1,485)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deeni Madaris &amp; Others @5%</td>
<td>2,202</td>
<td>3,831</td>
<td>174%</td>
<td>(1,629)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Children</td>
<td>13,217</td>
<td>12,200</td>
<td>92%</td>
<td>1,017</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Considering the current progress towards Strategy a of the plan, the targets for the remaining two years of the plan should be revised by equally dividing the shortfall of current year and adding into next two years.

### Table B.4: Revised targets for the years 2014-15 and 2015-16

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>2014-15</th>
<th>2015-16</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Formal Public Schools</td>
<td>10,767</td>
<td>11,158</td>
<td>21,925</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-Formal Public and Feeder Schools</td>
<td>16,200</td>
<td>16,239</td>
<td>32,439</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Private Schools</td>
<td>629</td>
<td>687</td>
<td>1,316</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deeni Madaris</td>
<td>2,371</td>
<td>2,468</td>
<td>4,839</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>29,967</td>
<td>30,552</td>
<td>60,519</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Way Forward

During the Annual Progress Review Meeting regarding Implementation of NPA the following recommendations were put forth in order to achieve 100% targets of this strategy:
• Allocation of resources, particularly human resources or expertise for proper monitoring.
• Awareness seminars/workshops for politicians
• Positive role of Media
• Community Participation

**Strategy b: Enrolment of new students in formal schools through provision of an additional classroom**

This strategy of the Plan is based on the provision of an additional classroom with a teacher in existing public institutions. Under this strategy, Balochistan has committed to provide one additional classroom in 294 existing public schools to accommodate 8,812 new children during school year 2013-14. However, it has been observed from the evidence of data that the numbers of classrooms have decreased from 18,297 in 2012-13 to 17,912 in 2013-14. The main reason behind this decrease is 2013 floods. According to PDMA Balochistan, 13 districts were affected in 2013 floods and approximately 64,270 people were affected. The following Table presents information on targets and achievements of Strategy b.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Components</th>
<th>Target for 2013-14</th>
<th>Actual Achievements During 2013-14</th>
<th>Shortfalls</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Number of New Class Rooms to be constructed in formal schools</td>
<td>294</td>
<td>(385)</td>
<td>- 131%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New OOS Children to be enrolled</td>
<td>8,812</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-8,812</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The Department of Education, Balochistan, has completed a need based survey for the provision of new classrooms in the existing formal schools. According to this Survey, 300 new classrooms will be provided in the existing schools. Hopefully, these new classrooms will be reflected in the data of next education census.

Since targets set for the year 2013-14 are not achieved as envisaged in NPA, therefore the targets for next two years must be revised according to the following table:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Total children</th>
<th>2014-15</th>
<th>2015-16</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Number of formal schools to be provided with additional room, teacher and missing facilities</td>
<td>13,547</td>
<td>13,939</td>
<td>27,486</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The Government of Balochistan had also committed to provide new classrooms in existing schools under Balochistan Education Sector Plan 2013-18. Initially, as a priority, schools with less than two rooms will be upgraded to meet the requisite standards. In the second phase, all the primary schools will be provided with five room buildings.
Way Forward

During the Annual Progress Review Meeting regarding Implementation of NPA the following recommendations were presented in order to achieve 100% targets of this strategy:

- Provisions of additional rooms where necessary
- Provision of sufficient budget for construction of additional class rooms
- Stopping political interference in education governance.
- Progress should be monitored regularly, reported properly, and documented consistently.

**Strategy c: Enrolment of children in new schools (50% of all new enrolments)**

It is the most expensive strategy of the Plan in which 50% of total out-of-school children will be enrolled by constructing new formal and/or non-formal/feeder schools. Under this strategy, the Plan envisioned to enroll 22,029 out-of-school children in 514 new formal, non-formal and feeder schools during 2013-14. The distribution of opening of new schools under different sectors in 2013-14 is reflected in following table:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sector</th>
<th>Number of new schools to be opened</th>
<th>Children to be enrolled in new school</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Formal primary school</td>
<td>220</td>
<td>13,217</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-formal primary schools</td>
<td>147</td>
<td>4,406</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Feed schools (grade I-III)</td>
<td>147</td>
<td>4,406</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>514</td>
<td>22,029</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

According to 2013-14 statistics, 101 new primary schools were opened in Balochistan as compared to the target of 220 schools. These 101 schools have accommodated 6,060 new students. About 46% of annual target has been achieved under this strategy as far as formal education system is concerned. The number of non-formal and feeder schools in the province has fallen down which is not a good sign. The following Table provides detailed information about the progress against targets:

**Table B.8: Target and Achievements of Balochistan with respect to Strategy c (2012-13 to 2013-14)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S. No</th>
<th>Type of Schools and Enrolment</th>
<th>Target for 2013-14</th>
<th>Actual Achievements During 2013-14</th>
<th>Shortfall in %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Number Of New Schools</td>
<td>OOSC To be enrolled</td>
<td>Number Of New Schools</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Formal Primary Schools</td>
<td>220</td>
<td>13,217</td>
<td>101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>NFE Schools</td>
<td>147</td>
<td>4,406</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Feeder Schools</td>
<td>147</td>
<td>4,406</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td>514</td>
<td>22,029</td>
<td>20%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
There is a need to promote non-formal education in the province. Overall, about 28% of target has been achieved under this strategy. The Balochistan Education Sector Plan has committed to provide 4,000 new primary schools and equip those on the community model by June 2018.

During annual progress review meeting with education managers of Balochistan, it was stated that the government has started a new project titled ‘Alternative Learning Pathway (ALP)’ to increase the role of non-formal education. All the participants of the meeting were of the view that the targets visualized in the NPA under this strategy are still achievable if the government provides financial resources as given in the NPA, and also release funds well on time. It was also pointed out that there is no proper mechanism for coordination among the concerned departments for the implementation of this strategy.

In the light of current status, the targets for the next two years of the plan should be revised by equally dividing the 2013-14 deficits and adding into the next two years as per details given below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Achievements or shortfall of 2013-14</th>
<th>2014-15</th>
<th>2015-16</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Children to be enrolled in new formal schools</td>
<td>6,060</td>
<td>17,291</td>
<td>17,878</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of new formal schools to be opened</td>
<td>101</td>
<td>289</td>
<td>297</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Children to be enrolled in new Non-Formal schools</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>6,774</td>
<td>6,969</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of new Non-Formal schools to be opened</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>226</td>
<td>232</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Children to be enrolled in new Feeder schools</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>6,774</td>
<td>6,969</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of new Feeder schools to be opened</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>226</td>
<td>232</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Way Forward**

During the Annual Progress Review Meeting regarding Implementation of NPA, the following recommendations were made in order to achieve 100% targets of this strategy:

- Establishment of ALP (Alternate Learning Pathway) centers in the entire province (Presently there are only 8 districts covered by UNICEF)
Strategy d: Targeted Incentives for access and retention for disadvantaged groups and girls (15% of all enrolments)

It is stated in Balochistan chapter of NPA under strategy d “of all primary enrolments (old and new), 15% of the students will be provided incentives for access and retention in primary schools. In Balochistan, 368,871 children will be targeted and provided incentives (equivalent to Rs. 3,000 per child) at a cost of Rs. 1.1billion” (page 510)

Under this strategy 114,264 students were envisaged to be provided Rs. 343 million during school year 2013-14. Currently, the Government of Balochistan is providing free textbooks to students and no fees are charged. However, stationary and transport costs continue to be borne by the family. The strategy is not fully implemented in the province due to lack of financial resources.

The Balochistan Education Sector Plan (BESP) recommends providing mid-day meal at primary level schools with eventual expansion to middle and higher levels. 30% primary schools are selected to initiate the process of providing one school meal.

Stipend for middle level girls in 10 poorest districts are also recommended in BESP. Rs. 1.8 million has already been allocated for this stipend program and the criteria have also been developed for identifying 10 poorest districts.

Way Forward

During the Annual Progress Review Meeting regarding Implementation of NPA, the following recommendations were made in order to achieve 100% targets of this strategy:

- Introduction of Mother Tongue at primary level as medium of instruction
- Award for best student at schools/districts level by Chief Minister Innovative Programme

Conclusion and Recommendations

Evidence reviewed in this part of the report demonstrates progress towards four innovative strategies adopted in NPA 2013-16. It is clear from the progress reviewed that Balochistan has not achieved the targets envisaged in the NPA for the year 2013-14. However, the province is very close to the targets.

The weakest area identified during the progress review process was non-formal education in the province. The Government of Balochistan should pay more attention to Non-Formal education to cater to the learning needs of more out of school children in the system. The BEPS proposes investing in community schools and to focus on female teachers for girls. Female teachers have been shown to be particularly important for girls’ enrolment in conservative societies. The community schools are also cost effective as compared with building new regular schools.
The main reason identified during the process was lack of financial resources for the implementation of four strategies of the Plan. Another reason is lack or non-existence of coordination and communication mechanisms within the education department and among the other concerned departments, including finance and planning departments.

Although an enrolment campaign is launched every year to enroll new children, however to make this campaign successful a need assessment survey should be conducted. These need assessment surveys should identify the exact areas where schools have the capacity to enroll more students and there is enough population of 5-9 age group children in the area, who are not going to school.

It is also apparent that we will only be able to achieve the goal of quality education for all through pro-equity programs and bridging the gaps in education to reach vulnerable and excluded children, and it is only possible if we identify that group.

The EMIS Cell should be strengthened by providing all the required resources (Man, Money and Machinery) to cater to all the data needs for educational planning and policy making. The district EMIS Cells should also be made functional by providing at-least two staff members and one computer in each district. The EMIS should not only maintain the educational statistics but also finance and population related data. The decision regarding opening of new schools, construction of classrooms, provision of physical facilities, hiring of new teachers should be supported by EMIS database. The data related to all educational institutions working in the province (public, private, Deeni Madaris, non-formal etc.) should be maintained under one umbrella i.e. EMIS.

Balochistan Education Sector Plan is a comprehensive document covering all the issues related to education system and it should be implemented in letter and spirit.

By developing ECCE programmes the functioning of primary schools can be increased through more timely entry into school system and less grade repetition, thus allowing additional enrolment.
Azad Jammu & Kashmir (AJ&K)

Azad Jammu & Kashmir (AJ&K) comprises a total area of 13,297 Square Kilometer. The region has 0.58 million population of age group 5-9 children, of these about 0.23 million were out-of-school in 2013-14.

In the National Plan of Action to Accelerate Education-Related MDGs (NPA), the region of AJ&K has committed to reach at 75% Net Enrolment Rate by the year 2015-16. This chapter will present and analyze information about the progress of the region towards the achievement of NPA targets.

School Participation

Total enrolment in primary education increased from 376,501 in 2012-13 to 381,950 in 2013-14, an overall increase of 1.5% in one year. This increase is essentially due to some special efforts made by the Department of Education. The highest relative increase in primary enrolment occurred in district Bhimber where enrolment increased from 21,446 in 2012-13 to 23,062 in 2013-14, that is an increase of 7.5 percent of points in one year. The share of district Bhimber in total primary enrolment of AJ&K is 6.9%. On the other hand, the overall enrolment in district Haveli decreased by 7.5%, i.e., from 11,823 in 2012-13 to 10,930 in 2013-14. The district Haveli is contributing 3.8% pupils in total primary enrolment of AJ&K. District Haveli is one of the districts which were affected by 2012 and 2013 floods.

How close is AJK to NPA Targets?

The number of out-of-school children has decreased in AJK, it fell down from 231,677 (42% of 5-9 age-group of population) in 2011-12 to 224,129 (39% of 5-9 age-group of population) by 2013-14. While progress has been made over the last two years, in the line of National Plan of Action (NPA), in bringing more children into schools, the pace remains too slow to achieve NPA targets during 2012-13. However, the number of out-of-school children of primary-age dropped by 7 percentage of points from 2012-13 to 2013-14 – a rate that appears sufficient.
to achieve NPA targets by 2015. If past trend continues the Net Enrolment Ratio (NER) will be about 68% in 2014-15 and 75% by 2015-16. By keeping the same pace of 7% decrease in the out-of-school children per year, it is possible to achieve the targets of NPA by 2015. Figure 2 shows the targets envisaged in NPA compared with actual achievements based on the data.

**Figure A.2: Year and Gender wise Targets and Achievements of AJ&K**

Completion of primary education (up to Grade 5) by all children once enrolled in Grade 1 remains a major challenge in AJ&K as well. Survival Rate to Grade V is low and grade repetition is higher. However, an increase of 16 percent of points has been observed in the Survival Rate to Grade V i.e., it increased from 69% to 85% during 2012-13 to 2013-14. Dropout rate at primary level has also decreased from 31% to 21% during the year 2012-13 to 2013-14 which is an encouraging sign. Gender wise comparison of Survival Rate to Grade V for the years 2012-13 and 2013-14 is reflected in Figure 3. Survival Rate is important as it is an indirect or proxy indicator of quality and efficiency of an education system. The following figure provides gender disaggregated information about Survival Rate in AJ&K.
The enrolment in Basic Education Community Schools (BECs) has increased by 5% during 2012-13 to 2013-14. Only 524 new students could be enrolled in BECS during this period. Whereas, according to NPA, 3,598 new students should have been enrolled in non-formal institutions during this one year period. AJ&K is lagging far behind the set targets as far as non-formal education is concerned.

A significant decrease of about 50 percent of points has been observed in shelter-less schools at primary level of education in AJ&K from the year 2012-13 to 2013-14. In 2012-13 there were 1,705 shelters-less schools which have been reduced to 856 according to 2013-14 data. The total number of classrooms in primary schools has also increased from 3,922 to 4,979 i.e. an increase by 27%.

The Department of Education, Government of AJ&K is keen to achieve the set targets of NPA by year 2015-16. However, due to some delay in the implementation of the plan it is lagging behind the targets set for the year 2013-14. The Education Department of AJ&K had planned to bring 35,977 new students in schools from the population of 5-9 years old during school year 2013-14. Unfortunately, it has been able to enroll only 11,307 children into primary schools – which means only 31% of the target has been achieved. The progress during 2013-14 is even far better than the progress made during the school year 2012-13. During the school year 2011-12, the NER was 58% which dropped to 54% during school year 2012-13. The main reason behind this fall was 2012-13 floods. According to State Disaster Management Authority (SDMA) of AJ&K, 887 houses were completely destroyed while 3,009 houses destroyed partially including many schools.

The actual implementation on NPA started during school year 2012-13, the result is reflected in 2013-14 data. A significant increase of 7 percent of points is observed during this year. The targets envisaged in NPA for 2012-13 and 2013-14 are reflected in the Table A.1 below:

![Figure A.3 Gender and Year wise Survival Rate to V in AJ&K](image-url)
Table A.1 : Targets of NPA and Achievements by AJK for the years 2012-13 and 2013-14

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>NER</th>
<th>OOSC</th>
<th>Shortfall or Achievements</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>NPA</td>
<td>Actual</td>
<td>NPA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012-13</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>60%</td>
<td>54%</td>
<td>116,774</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>60%</td>
<td>54%</td>
<td>110,662</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>60%</td>
<td>54%</td>
<td>227,436</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013-14</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>66%</td>
<td>62%</td>
<td>101,243</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>64%</td>
<td>60%</td>
<td>101,588</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>65%</td>
<td>61%</td>
<td>202,830</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

How AJ&K Has Taken-up NPA?
The implementation of NPA was initiated in the State of AJ&K with the following initiatives for tackling the access and quality related issues faced by the education sector.

a) Enrolment campaign was launched in order to increase enrolments;
b) In-service teacher trainings were conducted in order to improve the quality of education
c) Curriculum Implementation Framework (CIF) and Continuous Professional Development (CPD) were developed
d) Non-Functional schools were made functional
e) Rationalization of teaching staff in schools

Key Challenges

The Department of Education faced the following key challenges during the implementation of NPA.

a) Access in remote areas/ difficult Terrain
b) Due to the situation on the Line of Control (LoC), bordering with India, approximately 800 institutions were affected.
c) Lack of resources (in terms of physical and financial resources)
d) Many institutions were affected as a result of floods in 2013-14
e) Due to poverty, many parents are unable to pay fee and purchase books and uniform
f) Lack of coordination among the departments
g) There was no proper monitoring mechanism. No Provincial/Area Coordination Unit (PCU) was established, as envisaged in the NPA

Steps required for accelerating the progress towards the achievement of NPA targets

According to the evidence, AJ&K is lagging behind the targets of NPA. However, these targets are still achievable if the following steps are taken on emergency basis.

a) Establishment of Coordination Cell
b) Strengthening coordination through quarterly meetings  
c) Public-Private Partnership  
d) Allocation of required financial resources for NPA and their timely releases  
e) Strengthening of EMIS  
f) Rationalization of available resources  
g) Establishing a proper mechanism for monitoring the progress of implementation of the plan  
h) Capacity building of Education Managers in Educational Planning and Management  
i) Involvement of community and donor organizations through motivational campaign  
j) Provision of incentives to poor students in order to retain them in system. Special budget should be allocated for this purpose.

Strategy wise details of implementation of National Plan of Action

Strategy a: Enrolment of new students in existing schools (under-utilized/closed schools)

According to NPA, a total number of 77,973 new children will be enrolled in primary stage of education under this strategy during 2013-16. This means 70% of new children will be enrolled in the existing schools by fully utilizing capacity of functional schools and opening of closed schools. Of these, 50% will be enrolled in public schools (40% in formal and 10% in non-formal schools) and 10% in Deeni Madaris and other schools. Remaining 10% will be absorbed by the private sector of education.

According to the Plan, 25,184 out-of-school children should have been enrolled in the system in 2013-14, but the facts are different. According to 2013-14 data, only 7,911 children were enrolled under this strategy – only 31% of set target could be achieved in this year. Table 1 shows the sector wise breakdown of 25,184 children to be enrolled under ‘strategy a’ of the plan.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sector</th>
<th>No. of Children</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Public sector formal schools @40%</td>
<td>14,391</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public sector Non-formal and feeder schools @10%</td>
<td>3,598</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Private Sector Schools @10%</td>
<td>3,598</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deeni Madaris &amp; Others @10%</td>
<td>3,598</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total Children</strong></td>
<td><strong>25,184</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

It was envisaged that the existing formal public schools will entertain 14,391 out-of-school children as shown in table 2, however the performance is worst, once again the public sector has failed to attract the children. Only 2,502 children were enrolled during 2013-14 – 17% target children are enrolled by public sector. In non-formal and feeder schools 950 new students are enrolled while the target was 3,598 – 26% target is achieved. On the other hand private sector achieved 82% of the set targets i.e., 2,947 of 3,598 children are enrolled in private sector. To keep Deeni Madaris intact with education system, it was envisaged that 3,598 out-of-school children will be enrolled in Deeni Madaris under this strategy; however
2,036 children are enrolled during 2013-14. Overall 33% of set targets are achieved under ‘strategy a’ of the plan. The sector wise comparison of targets and achievement under the strategy are given in the below Table:

Table A.3 : Targets and Achievement of OOSC children to be enrolled under Strategy a in AJ&K in existing schools

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sector (70% of new enrolment)</th>
<th>Target of OOSC Children to be enrolled during 2013-14</th>
<th>Actual Achievements: OOSC enrolled (2013-14)</th>
<th>Actual Achievements: OOSC enrolled (%) (2013-14)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Public sector formal schools @40%</td>
<td>14,391</td>
<td>2,502</td>
<td>17%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public sector Non-formal and feeder schools @10%</td>
<td>3,598</td>
<td>950</td>
<td>26%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Private Sector Schools @10%</td>
<td>3,598</td>
<td>2,947</td>
<td>82%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deeni Madaris &amp; Others @10%</td>
<td>3,598</td>
<td>2,036</td>
<td>57%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total Children</strong></td>
<td><strong>25,184</strong></td>
<td><strong>8,435</strong></td>
<td><strong>33%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

AJ&K still has a long way to go to achieve the targets set in the NPA. During the meeting with the education managers, policy makers and education planners, the following recommendations were made in order to achieve the targets envisioned under the major strategy a of the Plan.

- For effective implementation of the Plan a Coordination Cell should be established with the representation of all concerned departments, including Finance and Planning departments.
- Strengthening coordination through quarterly meetings
- Public Private Partnership (PPP) should be established with clear agreement on shared objectives for delivery of public infrastructure.
- The government should provide additional financial and human resources as committed in the NPA.
- Capacity building of Education Managers, Education Planners and Policy Makers for better understanding of the NPA and effective implementation of the Plan.
- For the provision of timely and reliable data for educational planning and management; the EMIS Cells should be strengthened on state as well as district levels.
- Human and other resources should be rationalized in the educational institutions for full and effective utilization of available resources

Considering the current progress towards strategy a of the plan the targets for the remaining two years of the plan should be revised by equally dividing the shortfall of current year into next two years.

Table A.4 : Revised Targets of AJ&K for Strategy a for 2014-15 and 2015-16

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Actual Achievements during 2013-14</th>
<th>2014-15</th>
<th>2015-16</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Formal Public Schools</td>
<td>2,502</td>
<td>18,362</td>
<td>23,692</td>
<td>44,556</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Way Forward

During the Annual Progress Review Meeting regarding Implementation of NPA, the following recommendations were made in order to achieve 100% targets of this strategy:

- Need additional financial resources
- Capacity building of teaching and non-teaching staff
- Strengthening of EMIS
- Rationalization of available resources

**Strategy b: Enrolment of new students in formal schools through provision of an additional classroom**

This strategy of the Plan is based on the provision of an additional classroom with a teacher in the existing public institutions. Under this strategy, AJ&K had committed to provide one additional classroom in 120 existing public schools to accommodate 3,598 new children. However, only 38 public schools were provided an additional classroom to accommodate 1,066 out-of-school children in the primary level of education.

Due to lack of communication among the concerned departments the targets were not achieved for the year 2013-14. Another key challenge faced was the lack of financial resources and under-utilization of existing funds. Different concept papers and proposals were prepared in order to get funds from donor organizations to construct additional classrooms in the existing schools.

During the annual progress review meeting with education managers of AJ&K it was found out that additional space is available in many schools to construct a classroom. If proper funding is made available on time the targets can be achieved. The following Table presents summary of targets and achievements during 2013-14 under Strategy b.

| Public sector Non-Formal & Feeder Schools | 950  | 4,417 | 5,772  | 11,139 |
| Private Schools                          | 2,947 | 3,430 | 4,762  | 11,139 |
| Deeni Madaris                            | 2036  | 3496  | 5,607  | 11,139 |
| **Total**                                | **8,435** | **29,705** | **39,833** | **77,973** |

**Table A.5 : Targets and Achievement of AJ&K with respect to Strategy b during 2013-14**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Target 2013-14</th>
<th>Achievements 2013-14</th>
<th>% of Achievements</th>
<th>Shortfall in Number</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Children to be enrolled</td>
<td>3,598</td>
<td>1,066</td>
<td>30%</td>
<td>2,532</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No of new Classrooms to be</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>32%</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>provided in existing formal</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>public schools</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In order to achieve target of construction of 371 additional classrooms to accommodate 11,139 children till the year 2015-16, need assessment survey should be carried out to identify
the schools where both additional space in the existing schools and out-of-school children in the surrounding are available.

Since targets set for the year 2013-14 could not be achieved fully as envisaged in the NPA, therefore, the targets for the next two years must be revised according to the following table:

**Table A.6 : Revised Targets of AJ&K for Strategy b during 2014-15 and 2015-16**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Achievements During 2013-14</th>
<th>2014-15</th>
<th>2015-16</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total children</td>
<td>1,066</td>
<td>4,371</td>
<td>5,702</td>
<td>11,139</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of formal schools to be provided with additional room, teacher and missing facilities</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>144</td>
<td>189</td>
<td>371</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Way Forward**

During the Annual Progress Review Meeting regarding Implementation of NPA, the following recommendations were put forth in order to achieve 100% targets of this strategy:

- The available resources are not enough and public education sector needs additional financial resources
- Need based survey may be conducted in order to construct new classrooms in the existing schools

**Strategy c: Enrolment of children in new schools (20% of all new enrolments)**

It is the most expensive strategy of the Plan under which 20% of total out-of-school children will be enrolled by constructing new formal and/or non-formal/feeder schools. Under this strategy, the Plan envisaged to enroll 7,196 out-of-school children into 240 new non-formal and feeder schools. The Plan does not provide provision of opening new formal schools, because opening of new formal school is more costly. The distribution of opening of new schools under different sectors in 2013-14 is reflected in following table:

**Table A.7 : Targets of AJ&K for Strategy c for 2013-14 in the NPA**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sector</th>
<th>Number of new schools to be opened</th>
<th>Children to be enrolled in new school</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Formal primary school</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Non-formal primary schools</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>3,598</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Feed schools (grade I-III)</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>3,598</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>240</td>
<td>7,196</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

According to 2012-13 statistics, no new non-formal primary school was opened in AJK, while it had committed that 120 new non-formal schools will be opened. However, 45 new Feeder Schools were opened as compared to target of 120. These 45 new Feeder Schools have enrolled 1,800 children who were out-of-school. Against the total target of 7,196 for 2013-14, only 2,324 out-of-school children could be enrolled facilitated under this strategy. This
means 32% of the total target was achieved. The following Table presents details of achievements and shortfall under Strategy c.

Table A.8 : Target and Achievement of AJ&K with respect to Strategy c during 2013-14

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Target 2013-14</th>
<th>Achievements 2013-14</th>
<th>% of Achievements</th>
<th>Shortfall in Number</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Children to be enrolled</strong></td>
<td>7,196</td>
<td>1,800</td>
<td>25%</td>
<td>5,396</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>No of new NFE and Feeder Schools to be opened</strong></td>
<td>240</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>19%</td>
<td>195</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

During annual progress review meeting with education managers of AJK, it was found out that a need assessment study has been completed for opening of new feeder schools, which will provide the guidance while opening of new feeder schools.

All the participants of the meeting were of the view that the targets visualized in the NPA under this strategy are still achievable if the government provides financial resources as given in the NPA well on time. It was also pointed out that there does not exist proper mechanism for coordination among the concerned departments for the implementation of the under discussed strategy.

In the light of current status, the targets for the next two years of the plan should be revised by equally dividing the 2013-14 deficits and adding into next two years according to the details given in the following Table:

Table A.9 : Revised Targets of AJ&K for Strategy c during 2014-15 and 2015-16

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Achievement of 2013-14</th>
<th>2014-15</th>
<th>2015-16</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Children to be enrolled in new Non-Formal schools</strong></td>
<td>--</td>
<td>4904</td>
<td>6235</td>
<td>11,139</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Number of new Non-Formal schools to be opened</strong></td>
<td>--</td>
<td>163</td>
<td>208</td>
<td>371</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Children to be enrolled in new Feeder schools</strong></td>
<td>1,800</td>
<td>4000</td>
<td>5335</td>
<td>11,139</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Number of new Feeder schools to be opened</strong></td>
<td>45</td>
<td>140</td>
<td>186</td>
<td>371</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Way Forward

During the Annual Progress Review Meeting regarding Implementation of NPA the following actions were recommended in order to achieve 100% targets of this strategy:

- Proper financial resources may be provided in order to establish new schools
- Awareness campaign may be launched in order to motivate the community in favor of school education of their children
- Proper coordination mechanism among relevant organizations and departments may be put in place.
Strategy d: Targeted Incentives for access and retention for children from disadvantaged groups (15% of all enrolments)

It is stated in the AJK chapter of NPA under strategy d “of all primary enrolments (old and new), 15% of the students will be provided incentives for access and retention in primary schools. In AJK, 232,097 children will be targeted and provided incentives (equivalent to Rs. 3,000 per child) at a cost of Rs. 696 million in three years” (page 193)

For the year 2013-14, NPA envisaged to provide incentives to 70,712 children in the AJ&K with the budget of Rs. 212 million. During annual progress review meeting, it was found out that no action has been taken to implement this strategy even after passing of two years. The main reason attributed to this shortfall under this strategy is non-availability of financial resources and lack of communication mechanism among the concerned departments. It was also identified that rather than providing additional incentives to the student, the Government of AJK has failed to provide free and compulsory education to the children in the State.

AJ&K has limited resources of its own. Federal Government is responsible to providing additional financial resources as per requirements. Paucity of financial resources can be one of the major reasons for lack of achievements under this important strategy.

Way Forward

During the Annual Progress Review Meeting regarding Implementation of NPA, the following recommendations were suggested in order to achieve 100% targets of this strategy:

- Adequate financial resources may be provided to public sector of education
- A criteria may be adopted for selection of needy students

Conclusion and Recommendations

Evidence reviewed in this part of the report demonstrates progress towards four innovative strategies adopted in NPA 2013-16. It is clear from the progress reviewed that AJ&K has not achieved the targets envisaged in NPA for the year 2013-14. The main reason identified is lack of financial resources for the implementation of four strategies of the Plan. Another reason is lack or non-existence of coordination and communication mechanisms within the education departments and among the other concerned departments including Finance and Planning Departments.

Although an enrolment campaign is launched every year to enroll new children, however to make this campaign successful a need assessment survey should also be conducted. Need assessment survey should identify the exact areas where schools have the capacity to enroll more students and there is enough population of 5-9 age group in the surrounding areas who are not coming to school.

It is also evident that we will only be able to achieve the goal of quality education for all through pro-equity programs and bridging the gaps in education to reach the vulnerable and excluded children. Simulation for Equity in Education (SEE) is a tool or model developed by
UNICEF and the World Bank to help countries identify cost-effective strategies for reaching out children who are excluded from or underserved by education systems. The Education Department of AJK can use this model for efficient and effective utilization of available resources to cater to the learning needs of out of school children, particularly the children from disadvantaged groups.

The EMIS Cell should be strengthened by providing all the required human, financial, and material resources (Man, Money and Machinery) to cater to all the data needs for educational planning and policy making. The district EMIS Cells should also be made functional by providing at-least two staff members and one computer in each district. The EMIS Cell should not only maintain the educational statistics but also finance related data. The decisions regarding opening of new schools, construction of classrooms, provision of physical facilities, and hiring of new teachers should be supported by the EMIS database.

Education Sector Plan for AJK may be developed to clearly identify the goals, objectives, targets, and policies to address the issues of access, quality, equity and governance.

By developing ECCE programmes the functioning of primary schools can be improved through more timely entry of young children into the school system and less grade repetition, thus allowing additional enrolment.
**Gilgit-Baltistan**

Gilgit-Baltistan (GB) is an important federal area located in northern parts of the country. It covers an area of 72,971 square kilometer. Gilgit-Baltistan has total 0.21 million population of 5-9 age group children, of these about 0.67 million were out-of-school in 2013-14.

In the National Plan of Action to Accelerate Education-Related MDGs (NPA), the G.B had committed to reach 79% Net Enrolment Rate by the year 2015-16. This chapter will offer and analyze information about the progress of the G.B towards the achievement of NPA targets.

**School Participation**

Total enrolment of age group 5-9 children in primary education increased from 139,843 in 2012-13 to 141,216 in 2013-14, an overall increase of about 1% only during one year. This increase is not sufficient as compared to the new addition in the population of same age group in G.B, as population has increased by 2.5% in the same year. Therefore, a decrease of 1 percent in points has been observed in NER. The highest relative increase in primary enrolment occurred in district Ghanche where enrolment increased from 5,941 in 2012-13 to 6,559 in 2013-14, that is an increase of about 10 percent in points during one year. On the other hand, the overall enrolment in district Skardu decreased slightly by 0.1%, i.e., from 21,988 in 2012-13 to 21,973 in 2013-14. The enrolment in all the other districts has increased.

**Figure G.1: Comparison of Enrolment Rates in Gilgit-Baltistan at Primary Level**

![Bar chart showing comparison of GER and NER](chart.png)

**How close is Gilgit-Baltistan to NPA Targets?**

Although the enrolment in the region is increasing but not at sufficient pace to cater to the learning needs of all school aged population. The growth rate of population of age-group 5-9 in the region is about 2.5%; however the enrolment has increased by only one percent. The numbers of out-of-school children have increased from 63,393 in 2012-13 to 67,223 in 2013-14. While some progress has been made over the last two years, in the line of National Plan of Action (NPA), in bringing more children into the schools, the pace remains too slow to achieve NPA targets during 2013-14. The gap between targets and achievements is only 2 percent in points – in other words 4,158 more out-of-school children should have been enrolled in the schools. By keeping the same pace of 1% decrease in out-of-school children per year, it will not be possible to achieve the set targets of 79% by the year 2015. In order to
achieve the targets by 2015-16, 2,079 more children in addition to the set targets, should be enrolled in 2014-15 and 2015-16. Figure 2 shows the targets envisaged in the NPA versus the actual achievements based on the data. Marvelous progress can be seen during 2012-13, the first year of the plan. With the special efforts, more than the target out-of-school children were enrolled in the schools. However, due to lack of retention capacity of the system and poverty of parents, substantial numbers of the students left the schools.

**Figure G.2: Year and Gender wise Targets and Achievements of G.B**

Completion of primary level education (i.e. Grade 5) by all children enrolled in Grade 1 remains a major challenge. Survival Rate to grade V is low and grade repetition is higher. The Survival Rate to Grade V has slightly improved from 76% in 2012-13 to 86% in 2013-14. The drop-out rate has slightly declined from 24% to 14%. Gender wise comparison of Survival Rate to Grade V for the years 2012-13 and 2013-14 is shown in the Figure 3. Survival Rate is an indirect indicator of quality of education in schools. Hence, current progress shows that the quality of learning in the education system of GB is in the right direction. Nonetheless, still more efforts are required in order to expand access and improve quality of education in G.B.

**Figure G.3: Gender and Year wise Survival Rate to V in G.B (2012-13 TO 2013-14)**

The enrolment in Basic Education Community Schools (BECS) has decreased drastically from 135,084 in 2012-13 to 56,548 in 2013-14 – 58% fall in one year. The enrolment in NCHD
schools has slightly increased from 1,750 to 1,825. The BECS and NCHD schools are running under the umbrella of Federal Government. There is a need to accord priority to the non-formal education system in the region in order to achieve the targets.

During the year, 7 new primary schools were opened in the region, 4 shelter-less schools were provided new buildings and three more classrooms were given to the existing schools to make the public sector more accessible.

The targets envisaged in the NPA for 2012-13 and 2013-14 versus actual achievements during same years can be seen in the following table. It can be clearly noticed that the gender gap has increased during 2013-14. The NER of boys remained constant in 2012-13 and 2013-14 i.e. 69%. On the other hand, NER of girls has decreased from 69% in 2012-13 to 66% in 2013-14. The progress made during 2012-13 could not be maintained during 2013-14. More girls were enrolled in 2012-13 as compared to 2013-14.

### Table G.1 : Targets of NPA and Achievements by G.B for the years 2012-13 and 2013-14

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>NER</th>
<th>OOSC</th>
<th>Shortfall or Achievements</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>NPA</td>
<td>Actual</td>
<td>NPA</td>
<td>Actual</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012-13</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>68%</td>
<td>69%</td>
<td>33,175</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>62%</td>
<td>69%</td>
<td>37,425</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>65%</td>
<td>69%</td>
<td>70,600</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013-14</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>72%</td>
<td>69%</td>
<td>29,706</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>67%</td>
<td>66%</td>
<td>33,359</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>70%</td>
<td>68%</td>
<td>63,065</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**How Gilgit-Baltistan Has Taken-up the NPA?**

During annual progress review meeting on implementation of National Plan of Action to Accelerate Education-Related MDGs with education managers and policy makers of the department of education, GB and other stakeholders, it was stated that in the follow up of NPA the following initiatives have been taken during 2012-13 and 2013-14:

- Constructed additional classrooms in some areas
- Teacher trainings conducted on need basis
- New teachers hired
- Provided furniture and teaching learning materials to schools
- Campaigns launched to enroll the out of school children
- Offered incentives to the needy students
- Strengthened EMIS in G.B to collect and update data
- Provided financial assistance to the needy and poor students
- Ensured availability of financial human resources to implement NPA in the G.B.
Key Challenges

The Department of Education faced the following key challenges during the implementation of NPA.

- Shortage of teachers, classrooms, and furniture
- Lack of awareness among the community about significance of education for their children
- Political influence in posting, transfer and appointments of teachers and other education staff
- Geographical, seasonal, social and budgetary constraints
- Lack of basic facilities
- Accessibility to a wider range of communities and areas of operations
- Lack of effective monitoring and evaluation that hampered to get true picture of ground realities
- Poverty as a hindering factor for low enrolment
- Distribution of funds not considering the emerging needs of schools
- Lack of access to education

Steps required for accelerating the progress towards the achievement of NPA targets

According to the evidence, G.B is lagging behind the targets of NPA. However, these targets are still achievable if the following steps are taken on emergency basis, as recommended during the annual progress review meeting.

- By providing additional classrooms, teachers, missing facilities and strong partnership with the local community.
- Merit based recruitment as a strategy for quality improvement that will ultimately lead to enhance students enrolment in the schools
- Improvement in the monitoring and evaluation mechanism to ensure development, approval and implementation of School Development Plans and work on the set targets in each school
- Motivating communities and raising awareness to strengthen the schools
- Create conducive learning environment in schools by focusing both hard and soft components of school environment
- Ensure effective utilization of available resources (e.g. funds)
- Enrollment campaigns by announcing incentives to new comers and allocating targets to the government staff.

Strategy wise details of implementation of National Plan of Action

**Strategy a: Enrolment of new students in existing schools (under-utilized/closed schools) (70% of new enrolment)**

According to the NPA, under the strategy of enrolling new students in the existing schools, a total number of 27,951 new students will be enrolled in primary classes in G.B during 2013-16. Of these, 40% will be enrolled in public formal and 10% in public non formal schools and
5% in Deeni Madaris and other schools. Private schools are estimated to absorb another 15% students

For the year 2013-14, 8,917 out-of-school children were planned to be enrolled in existing schools under ‘strategy a’ of the plan. The sector wise distribution of 8,917 children is shown in following table:

Table G.2: Number of OOSC children to be enrolled in existing schools
(30% of new enrolment)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sector</th>
<th>No. of Children</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Public sector formal schools @40%</td>
<td>5,095</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public sector Non-formal and feeder schools @10%</td>
<td>1,274</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Private Sector Schools @15%</td>
<td>1,911</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deeni Madaris &amp; Others @5%</td>
<td>637</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total Children</strong></td>
<td><strong>8,917</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Of 5,095 out-of-school children to be enrolled in existing public formal schools only 2,470 children were enrolled during the year 2013-14 – 52% of NPA target is achieved. The enrolment in public sector Non-formal and Feeder schools has decreased drastically from 136,834 during 2012-13 to only 58,373 in 2013-14. This means 57% reduction instead of envisaged increase of 10%. Against the target of 1,911 children to be enrolled in private schools only 708 children were enrolled, only 37% of target was achieved. Deeni Madaris and other public formal schools (APS, OPF etc.) are also playing a significant role in reducing out-of-school children in G.B. Enrolment in Deeni Madaris increased from 15,522 during 2012-13 to 15,857 by 2013-14 – net addition was 335 only against the target of 637. Overall, 7,440 new students were enrolled in the existing institutions working under different education sectors in GB – 83% of targets set under this strategy has been achieved. The following Table presents information on targets and achievements with respect to Strategy a.

Table G.3: Targets and Achievement of OOSC children to be enrolled under Strategy a in Gilgit-Baltistan in existing schools

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sector</th>
<th>Target of OOS Children to be enrolled during 2013-14</th>
<th>Actual Achievements: OOS Children enrolled (2013-14)</th>
<th>Actual Achievements of OOSC Target in % during 2013-14</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Public sector formal schools @40%</td>
<td>5,095</td>
<td>2,470</td>
<td>48%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public sector Non-formal and Feeder schools @10%</td>
<td>1,274</td>
<td>934</td>
<td>73%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Private Sector Schools @10%</td>
<td>1,911</td>
<td>1,208</td>
<td>63%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deeni Madaris &amp; Others @10%</td>
<td>637</td>
<td>2,828</td>
<td>444%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total Children</strong></td>
<td><strong>8,917</strong></td>
<td><strong>7,440</strong></td>
<td><strong>83%</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The public sector, private sector and Deeni Madaris are contributing to some extent in reducing out-of-school children in the region; however, there is a need to enhance their
capacity to engross more out-of-school children into the education system. The non-formal education sector is one of the most important components of modern education system which serves as a tool to supplement knowledge and makes the system more accessible and cost effective. However, in G.B the non-formal education system is not performing as envisioned in the NPA. The government should pay special attention to this area for making the system more accessible.

Considering the current progress towards strategy a of the plan the targets for the remaining two years of the plan should be revised by equally dividing the shortfall of current year and adding into next two years.

Table G.4: Revised targets of OOSC for the years 2014-15 and 2015-16 for G.B

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>2014-15</th>
<th>2015-16</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Formal Public Schools</td>
<td>6,634</td>
<td>6,868</td>
<td>13,502</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-Formal Public and Feeder Schools</td>
<td>40,967</td>
<td>41,028</td>
<td>81,993</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Private Schools</td>
<td>2,597</td>
<td>2,685</td>
<td>5,282</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deeni Madaris</td>
<td>665</td>
<td>694</td>
<td>1,360</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>50,863</td>
<td>51,273</td>
<td>102,136</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Way Forward

During the Annual Progress Review Meeting regarding Implementation of NPA, the following recommendations were proposed in order to achieve 100% targets of this strategy:

- Trainings/workshops for teachers and PTAs to sensitize them to work on out of school children
- Targets should be assigned to the head teachers, mobilizing them to play their role to motivate communities/teachers and to enroll out of school children in their schools.
- Political figures and well known community representatives should be involved to practically contribute for bringing out of school children in to the schools.
- Increase human and financial resources for public sector education
- M & E Cell be established at Directorate level as well as district level
- Inclusive education should be introduced to enroll and provide equal opportunities to disabled children and children from disadvantaged groups.
- Extensive efforts for stronger involvement of local communities in the management of schools and overcoming the issue of out of school children.

Strategy b: Enrolment of new students in formal schools through provision of an additional classroom (in 10% of existing schools)

This strategy of the Plan is based on the provision of an additional classroom with a teacher in existing public institutions. Under this strategy, G.B had committed to provide one additional classroom in 51 existing public schools to accommodate 1,274 new children during school year 2013-14. However, it has been observed from the data that only three new classrooms were provided to accommodate only 90 out-of-school children. The following Table presents information on Targets, Achievements, and Shortfalls.
Table G.5 : Targets and Achievement of Strategy b in G.B during 2013-14:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>components</th>
<th>Target for 2013-14</th>
<th>Actual Achievements During 2013-14</th>
<th>Shortfalls Number and % of Achievement</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Number of New Class Rooms to be constructed in formal schools</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New OOS Children to be enrolled</td>
<td>1,274</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>1,184</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

This low progress and huge shortfall is due to lack of financial resources for construction of new classrooms. Another reason is the difficult terrain of G.B; the construction is not as easy in these hilly areas as in other parts of the country. However, a proposal for construction of new classrooms has been submitted. The need based survey for providing additional classrooms is also underway.

Since targets set for the year 2013-14 could not be achieved as envisaged in NPA, therefore the targets for next two years must be revised according to the following table:


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Achievements 2013-14</th>
<th>Target for 2014-15</th>
<th>Target for 2015-16</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total children to be enrolled</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>1,930</td>
<td>1,988</td>
<td>3,993</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of formal schools to be provided additional classroom, teacher and missing facilities</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>160</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Way Forward

During the Annual Progress Review Meeting regarding Implementation of NPA, the following recommendations were presented in order to achieve 100% targets of this strategy:

- Community participation in management of schools to be strengthened.
- Public private partnership to be promoted.
- Evening shift should be launched in existing schools
- Timely approval and release of budget.
- Reroofing of existing school buildings (constructing first and second floors) where there is space issue
- Generating funds through donors, NGOs, Members of G.B Councils etc
- Continuous monitoring

Strategy c: Enrolment of children in new schools (20% of all new enrolments)

This is the most expensive strategy of the Plan under which 20% of total out-of-school children are to be enrolled by constructing new formal and/or non-formal/feeder schools. Under this strategy, the Plan envisaged to enroll 1,274 out-of-school children in 42 new non-formal schools and 1,274 in 42 new feeder schools during 2013-14. The distribution of opening of new schools under different sectors in 2013-14 is reflected in following table:
Table G.7: Targets of Additional Enrollment in New Schools in G.B (2013-14)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sector</th>
<th>Number of new schools to be opened</th>
<th>Children to be enrolled in new school</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Formal primary school</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-formal primary schools</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>1,274</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Feed schools (grade I-III)</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>1,274</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>2,548</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

According to 2013-14 statistics, 7 new formal primary schools were opened in G.B, and 1,050 new students were enrolled in these 7 institutions. However, no new Non-formal and Feeder schools were opened in the region. This means, there was a shortfall of 35 new schools and non-enrolment of 1064 out of school children. In the NPA implementation progress review meeting, it was stated that new Non-formal institutions will be opened through Public-Private Partnership and with the help of community to accommodate about 3,500 out-of-school children, especially girls. Some locations have also been identified to open new schools. A campaign was also launched to motivate community to help in opening new schools and send their children in these schools.

In the light of current status the targets for the next two years of the plan should be revised by equally dividing the 2013-14 deficits and adding the shortfall into next two years according to the details given in the following Table:

Table G.8: Revised Targets of G.B for Strategy c

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>2014-15</th>
<th>2015-16</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Children to be enrolled in new formal schools</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of new formal schools to be opened</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Children to be enrolled in new Non-Formal schools</td>
<td>1,967</td>
<td>2,026</td>
<td>3,993</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of new Non-Formal schools to be opened</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>132</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Children to be enrolled in new Feeder schools</td>
<td>1,967</td>
<td>2,026</td>
<td>3,993</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of new Feeder schools to be opened</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>132</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Way Forward

During the Annual Progress Review Meeting regarding Implementation of NPA the following recommendations were put forth in order to achieve 100% targets of this strategy:

- Need to support public private partnership
- Replication of home schools in other districts and regions as per need
- Community participation needs to be enhanced.

Strategy d: Targeted Incentives for access and retention for children from disadvantaged groups (15% of all enrolments)

It is stated in the G.B chapter of NPA under strategy d that “of all primary enrolments (old and new), 15% of the students will be provided incentives for access and retention in primary
schools. In GB, 89,366 children will be targeted and provided incentives (equivalent to Rs. 3,000 per child) at a cost of Rs. 16.9billion” (page 90)

Under this strategy, 27,258 students were to be provided incentives equivalent to the value of Rs. 82 million during school year 2013-14. Currently, the Government of G. B is providing free textbooks to students and no fees are charged. However, stationary and transport costs continue to be borne by the parents. The strategy is not fully implemented in the G.B due to lack of financial resources.

With the support of local and international donor organizations; school uniform, learning material, school bags and financial support are being provided to the students of some areas. The government is also providing financial support to needy students through Benazir Income Support Program (BISP) and Bait-ul-Maal scheme.

The education planners and decision makers proposed the following interventions to retain the students in the system:

- Enhance community participation
- Create strong linkage with donor agencies, community and philanthropists at the local and G.B level.
- Support is given to the needy students and funds are distributed according to the genuine needs of schools.
- Improving quality of teaching and learning in schools

**Way Forward**

During the Annual Progress Review Meeting regarding Implementation of NPA, the following recommendations were made in order to achieve 100% targets of this strategy:

- Introduce school lunch, free books and stationary, free uniforms and scholarship/stipends schemes to attract the poor segment of OOSC in to the schools
- ECD classes can be started in primary schools.
- Identifying needy students and ensuring support mechanism to retain them in the schools
- Ensuring conducive learning environment in schools where children feel comfortable in their learning
- Schools based fund raising mechanism to help out needy students and transparent selection of students for financial assistance.

**Conclusion and Recommendations**

Evidence reviewed in this part of the report demonstrates progress towards four innovative strategies adopted in the NPA 2013-16. It is clear from the progress reviewed that G.B has not achieved the targets envisaged in the NPA for the year 2013-14. A significant increase in the enrolment rate has been observed during 2012-13, but due to lack of sustainability in the system the enrolment rate has decreased by 1 percent in points during 2013-14.
The weakest area identified during the progress review process was Non-formal education in the G.B. The Government of GB should pay more attention on Non-formal education to cater to the learning needs of the out of school children in the society.

The main reason identified during the process was lack of financial resources for the implementation of four strategies of the Plan. Another reason is lack or non-existence of coordination and communication mechanisms within the Education Department and among the other concerned departments including Finance and Planning Departments.

Although an enrolment campaign was launched to enroll new children, however, to make this campaign successful a need assessment survey should have been conducted. These need assessment surveys should identify the exact areas where schools have the capacity to enroll more students and there is enough population of 5-9 age group children in the area who are not going to school.

It is also apparent that we will only be able to achieve the goal of quality education for all through pro-equity programs and bridging the gaps in education to reach out vulnerable and excluded children, and it will be possible only if we identify that group.

The EMIS Cell should be strengthened by providing all the required human, financial and material resources (Man, Money and Machinery) to cater to all the data needs for educational planning and policy making. The district EMIS Cells should also be made functional by providing at-least two staff members and one computer in each district. The EMIS should not only maintain the educational statistics but also finance and population related data. The decisions regarding opening of new schools, construction of classrooms, provision of physical facilities, and hiring of new teachers should be supported by the EMIS database. The data related to all educational institutions working in the province (public, private, Deeni Madaris, Non-formal etc.) should be maintained under one umbrella i.e. EMIS.

In the line of other provinces and regions, G.B should also develop its Education Sector Plan to identify the key problems and issues and propose interventions.

By developing ECCE programmes, the functioning of primary schools can be improved through more timely entry of younger children into the school system and less grade repetition, thus allowing additional enrolment.
**Federally Administered Tribal Areas (FATA)**

FATA is tribal areas of Pakistan, administrated by the Federal Government. The total area of the region is 27,220 Square Kilometer. The region has total 0.55 million population of 5 to 9 years age group children, of these about 0.14 million were out-of-school during 2013-14.

In the National Plan of Action to Accelerate Education-Related MDGs (NPA), the FATA region had committed to achieve 65% Net Enrolment Rate by the year 2015-16. This chapter will present and analyze information relating to the progress of the region towards the achievement of NPA targets.

**School Participation**

Total enrolment in formal primary education has increased from 374,994 in 2012-13 to 379,937 in 2013-14, an overall increase of 1.32% in one year. This increase is essentially due to some special efforts made by the FATA Directorate of Education. A significant increase of about 24% has been observed in the enrolment of non-formal institutions of Basic Education Community Schools.

**Figure F.1: Year wise Comparison of Enrolment Rates in FATA**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>GER</th>
<th>NER</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2012-13</td>
<td>79%</td>
<td>63%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013-14</td>
<td>92%</td>
<td>74%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**How close is FATA to Targets of NPA?**

The number of out-of-school children has fallen in FATA, having declined from 563,213 (50% of 5-9 age-group of population) in 2012-13 to 536,338 (46% of 5-9 age-group of population) in 2013-14. In the NPA, FATA committed to increase one percent of NER in each year of NPA period – 62% NER in 2012-13 to 65% NER in 2015-16. However; the target set for year 2013-14 has been achieved. A significant increase of 11 percent in points – 63% in 2012-13 to 74% in 2013-14 – has been observed in one year. If same pace is maintained in the next two years of NPA, FATA will be very close to achieving Universal Primary Education (UPE). However, it is looking difficult to maintain the same pace due to armed conflict and military operation being carried out in different agencies of FATA. As a result of this thousands of people have left their homes and are presently living in the camps. Although schooling facility is provided to these Internally Displaced Persons (IDPs) but it may be difficult for female students to continue their
education under current circumstances. Figure 2 shows the targets envisaged in NPA compared with actual achievements based on data.

**Figure F.2: Year and Gender wise Targets and Achievements of FATA**

![Bar chart showing gender and year wise targets and achievements](chart)

Although the FATA Directorate of Education has been successful in reducing out-of-school children significantly, however, completion of primary level education (i.e. Grade 5) remains a major challenge. Survival Rate to Grade V is low and grade repetition is higher. Survival Rate to Grade V has decreased from 46% in 2012-13 to 40% in 2013-14 – that means the quality of education has deteriorated. On the other hand, the drop-out rate increased from 54% to 60%, which means more children are dropping out from the system. Gender wise comparison of Survival Rate to Grade V for the years 2012-13 and 2013-14 is shown in Figure 3. Survival Rate provides reliable clues about the learning environment and quality of education in schools. Hence, negative trends of decline in Survival Rate and increase in dropout rate shows that extensive efforts are still required for improving and maintaining quality of education the schools located in FATA.

**Figure F. 5 Gender and Year wise Survival Rate to V in FATA**

![Bar chart showing gender and year wise survival rate](chart)

The enrolment in Basic Education Community Schools (BECS) has increased from 46,586 in 2012-13 to 57,669 in 2013-14 – an increase by 24% in one year.
The overall numbers of primary schools have decreased from 4,791 in 2012-13 to 4,563 in 2013-14. The number of shelter-less schools has also increased.

The total number of classrooms in primary schools also decreased from 8,502 to 7,496 during 2013-14 – a decrease by 12%.

The numbers of out-of-school children were 144,469 in 2013-14, of these 10,644 are boys and 133,825 are girls. The following Table shows gender and year wise out-of-school children as comparison of targets envisioned in NPA and actual achievements.

**Table F.1 : Targets and Achievements of FATA in terms of NER and OOSC (2012-13 and 2013-14)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>NER NPA</th>
<th>Actual NER</th>
<th>Out of School Children NPA</th>
<th>Actual</th>
<th>Shortfall or Achievements</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>NPA</td>
<td>Actual</td>
<td>NPA</td>
<td>Actual</td>
<td>NER</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012-13</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>83%</td>
<td>84%</td>
<td>47,462</td>
<td>44,323</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>39%</td>
<td>42%</td>
<td>156,969</td>
<td>149,770</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>62%</td>
<td>63%</td>
<td>204,431</td>
<td>194,094</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013-14</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>84%</td>
<td>96%</td>
<td>44,596</td>
<td>10,644</td>
<td>12%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>40%</td>
<td>49%</td>
<td>159,012</td>
<td>133,825</td>
<td>9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>63%</td>
<td>74%</td>
<td>203,607</td>
<td>144,469</td>
<td>11%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*How FATA Has Taken-up NPA?*

During the annual progress review meeting on implementation of National Plan of Action to Accelerate Education-Related MDGs with education managers and policy makers of the FATA Directorate of Education, it was brought out that in the follow up of NPA the following initiatives have been taken during 2012-13 and 2013-14:

- Revisiting and Revision of Policy
- Rationalization of Budgetary Pyramid 60-40(Female-Male)
- Strengthening of Public-Private Partnership
- Introduction of Non-Formal Education
- Quality Improvement Initiatives (Teacher Training and support)
- Strengthening of existing Education Institutions
- Conversion to English Medium of Instruction
- Introduction of English Textbooks for various subjects
- Enrollment campaigns
- Incentives & scholarships
- Free text books to Students
- Award of scholarships for promotion of girls’ education.
- Provision of basic facilities and removal of deficiencies in schools

*Key Challenges*

The Directorate of Education faced the following key challenges during the implementation of NPA.
- Budgetary constraints
- Rapid transfers or postings in education sector
- Construction of damaged schools
- Insufficient human resources
- Law & order situation or security threats
- Poverty of parents
- Weak professional competency of teachers
- Political interference
- Paucity of funds & their ineffective utilization
- Social/Cultural constraints

Steps required for accelerating progress towards the achievement of NPA targets

The targets of NPA up to the year 2015-16 have already been achieved by FATA in 2013-14. Nonetheless, with a view to achieving the UPE by 2015, the education managers of FATA recommended the following actions during annual progress review meeting:

- An effective coordination mechanism among relevant departments should be instituted
- Additional funds should be allocated and released on time

Strategy wise details of implementation of National Plan of Action

Within the Acceleration of Education-Related MDGs Plan, a total number of 46,088 new students will be enrolled in primary classes in FATA, under four possible mutually exclusive strategies. In this section, we will discuss the progress made under these four strategies.

Strategy a: Enrolment of new students in existing schools (under-utilized/closed schools)

According to NPA total 42,387 out-of-school children will be enrolled in primary education during 2013-16 under this strategy. Of these, 13,635 children were planned to be enrolled during the year 2013-14. The sector wise distribution of 13,635 children to be enrolled is shown in following table:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sector</th>
<th>No. of Children</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Public sector formal schools @72%</td>
<td>9,823</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public sector Non-formal and feeder schools @0%</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Private Sector Schools @26%</td>
<td>3,519</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deeni Madaris &amp; Others @2%</td>
<td>293</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total Children</strong></td>
<td><strong>13,635</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Of 9,823 out-of-school children to be enrolled during 2013-14, only 7,577 children were enrolled in the existing public sector formal schools – 77% of NPA target is achieved. According to the plan, FATA was not interested to mobilize Non-formal sector to enroll out-

---

4 NPA to Accelerate Education-Related MDGs 2013-16
of-school children. However, the enrolment of Basic Education Community Schools (BECS), running under Federal Government, has increased significantly. An increase of about 24% has been registered in BECS. This means that 11,083 out-of-school children are enrolled during 2013-14. This increase in the enrolment plays a significant role to achieve NPA targets. In the private sector of education, the enrolment has declined from 75,526 in 2012-13 to 72,892 in 2013-14 – decrease of about 3.5% in a year. The private sector is not interested to invest in FATA due to security concerns. The enrolment in Deeni Madaris and community schools managed by the local community has also increased significantly. Overall, 73,800 new students were enrolled in existing institutions.

Way Forward

During the Annual Progress Review Meeting regarding Implementation of NPA, the following recommendations were made in order to achieve 100% targets of this strategy:

- Establishment of Implementation and Monitoring Unit
- Implementation of Education Sector Plan (ESP) Strategies
- Introduction of Non-Formal Education in FATA
- Involvement of local community and strengthening of Taleemi Islahi Jirga (TIJ)

**Strategy b: Enrolment of new students in formal schools through provision of an additional classroom**

This strategy of the Plan is based on the provision of an additional classroom with a teacher in existing public institutions. However, the Directorate of Education of FATA came with different point of view in the NPA. Rather than providing new classrooms and a teacher to bring more out-of-school children into the system, Directorate of Education committed to provide missing facilities to the existing schools and to start some new innovative strategies for improving the quality of education. It is envisaged in the NPA that 3,852 existing schools will be provided missing facilities to improve quality of education. Of these, 1,284 institutions will be covered during 2013-14. However, no such action has been taken during last two years to improve the quality of education.

Way Forward

During the Annual Progress Review Meeting regarding Implementation of NPA, the following recommendations were made in order to achieve 100% targets of this strategy:

- Implementation of strategies envisaged in the FATA Education Sector Plan (ESP)
- Involvement of donors
- Revision of criteria for establishment of new schools (New schools Establishment Criteria) i.e. Construction of Five Room Schools
- Establishment, training and mobilization of Taleemi Islahi Jirgas (TIJs)
- Awareness campaigns in the community
- Timely release of funds
• Reconstruction / rehabilitation of damaged schools and provision of missing facilities.

**Strategy c: Enrolment of children in new schools (20% of all new enrolments)**

It is the most expensive strategy of the Plan in which out-of-school children will be enrolled by constructing new formal schools. Under this strategy, the Plan envisioned to enroll 3,701 out-of-school children in 526 new formal schools during 2013-16. Of these, 1,026 children were to be enrolled by constructing 171 new primary schools during 2013-14. The distribution of opening of new schools under different sectors in 2013-14 is reflected in following table:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sector</th>
<th>Number of new schools to be opened</th>
<th>Children to be enrolled in new school</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Formal primary school</td>
<td>171</td>
<td>1,026</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-formal primary schools</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Feed schools (grade I-III)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>171</td>
<td>1,026</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

However, practically, the situation turned out to be different. The number of primary schools declined, while the number of Feeder Schools and Deeni Madaris increased significantly during 2012-13 to 2013-14. During 2013-14, a total of 51 new feeder schools were established by the NCHD in FATA, and 5 new Deeni Madaris were established. 3,303 new students have been enrolled in Feeder Schools while a significant increase of 1,150 has been observed in the enrolment of Deeni Madaris. Total 5,166 new students have been enrolled under this strategy.

**Way Forward**

During the Annual Progress Review Meeting regarding Implementation of NPA, the following recommendations were proposed in order to achieve 100% targets of this strategy:

• Involvement of Donors
• Revisit school establishment criteria
• Establish schools in areas where there are no schools
• Introduction of non-formal education
• Use of GIS for instituting transparent and scientific basis for establishment of new schools
• Involvement of community through formation of Taleemi Islahi Jirgas(TIJs)
• Rehabilitation of damaged schools
• Simplification of procedure for approval of SNE. (Statement of New Expenditure)
• Carrying out enrolment campaigns.
• Creating awareness in the parents about importance of education for welfare of their children.
Strategy d: Targeted Incentives for access and retention for children from disadvantaged groups (15% of all enrolments)

It is stated in FATA chapter of NPA under strategy d “of all primary enrolments (old and new), 15% of the students will be provided incentives for access and retention in primary schools. In FATA, 200,917 children will be targeted and provided incentives (equivalent to Rs. 3,000 per child) at a cost of Rs. 1.1billion” (page 71)

Under this strategy; 64,047 students were to be provided incentives equivalent to the total value of Rs. 192 million during school year 2013-14. Currently, the Directorate of Education, FATA, is providing free textbooks to students and no fees are charged. However, stationary and transport costs continue to be borne by the parents.

Special awards are being given to female students for the promotion of girl’s education. Scholarships are also being provided to female students for their retention in the system. Different donor organizations e.g. World Food Programme, are also providing incentives to female students. However, the strategy is not fully implemented in the region due to lack of financial resources.

Way Forward

During the Annual Progress Review Meeting regarding Implementation of NPA, the following recommendations were made in order to achieve 100% targets of this strategy:

- Devolution of power to the local levels on the pattern of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KP) province
- Development of FATA Education Assessment System (FEAS)
- Establishment of independent pre-service and in service teacher training
- Use ICT results to create more transparency of decision making relating to education policy
- Better coordination & communication among different tiers of education sector
- Conducive environment in the schools and abolition of corporal punishment (Maar Nahee Piyar)
- Independent Monitoring Unit (IMU) on the pattern of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa
- Provision of basic facilities to all schools
- Enrolment campaigns to expand access and decrease the dropout ratio.
- Incentives to students

Conclusion and Recommendations

Although a huge increase in NER at primary level has been observed during 2013-14 but this increase is not aligned with NPA. The targets set for public and private sectors are not achieved accordingly. Although 7,577 new children were enrolled in the existing public schools, but the target of 9,823 could not be achieved and there was a shortfall of 2,246. The enrolment in private sector has decreased by about 3.5%. Private sector could not make inroads in the education system in FATA due to security threats and poverty of the local population.
The two important sectors ignored in NPA were Non-formal and Deeni Madaris. These two sectors eventually contributed a substantial increase in the enrolment.

Female teachers have been instrumental for promotion of girls’ enrolment in conservative societies. The community schools are also cost effective as compared with building new formal schools.

The main reason identified during the process was the lack of financial resources for the implementation of four strategies of the Plan. Another reason is lack or non-existence of coordination and communication mechanisms within the Directorate of Education and among the other concerned departments including Finance and Planning.

It is also evident that we will only be able to achieve the goal of quality education for all through pro-equity programs and bridging the gaps in education to reach vulnerable and excluded children, and it is only possible if we identify that group.

FATA Education Sector Plan is under development process. Hopefully, it will identify the key issues in education sector of FATA and will suggest some new innovative strategies.

By developing ECCE programmes the functioning of primary schools can be improved through more timely entry of young children into the school system and less grade repetition, thus allowing additional enrolment.
Islamabad Capital Territory (ICT)

Islamabad is the federal capital of Pakistan. Islamabad Capital Territory (ICT) consists of urban and rural areas surrounding the city. ICT is a Federal territory. It covers an area of 1165 Square Kilometer. It is estimated that ICT has total 0.15 million population of 5-9 age group children, of these about 0.04 million were out-of-school during 2013-14. Federal Directorate of Education is responsible for planning and managing public sector schools and colleges in ICT.

In the National Plan of Action to Accelerate Education-Related MDGs (NPA), ICT (Federal Directorate of Education – FDE) had committed to reach at 98% Net Enrolment Rate (NER) by the year 2015-16. Apparently, it seems difficult for the ICT to achieve these targets. This chapter will present and analyze information about the progress of ICT towards the achievement of targets envisaged in the NPA.

School Participation

Total enrolment of 5-9 age group students in primary education in ICT increased from 105,468 in 2012-13 to 111,734 in 2013-14, an overall increase of about 6 percent in points in one year. This increase is essentially due to special efforts made by the Federal Directorate of Education. A significant increase of about 8% has been observed in the enrolment of private institutions.

Figure ICT.1: Comparison of Enrolment Rates in Islamabad Capital Territory (ICT)

How close is ICT to NPA Targets?

The number of out-of-school children has fallen in the ICT, dropped from 42,160 (39% of 5-9 age-group of population) in 2012-13 to 39,194 (36% of 5-9 age-group of population) by 2013-14. While progress has been made over the last two years, in the line of National Plan of Action (NPA), in bringing more children into the schools, the pace remained too slow to achieve NPA targets during 2013-14. The gap between targets and achievements is 6 percent in points – in other words 9,037 more out-of-school children should have been in schools. If past trend continues, the Net Enrolment Ratio (NER) will be about 77% by 2014-15, and 80% in 2015-16. By maintaining the same pace it will not possible to achieve the set targets of 98% by the year 2015. Figure 2 shows the targets envisaged in the NPA compared with the actual achievements based on data.
Completion of primary level education (up to Grade V) by all children enrolled in Grade 1 remains a major challenge, in the country, however, Survival Rate to Grade V in the ICT is satisfactory. The Survival Rate to Grade V has increased significantly from 82% in 2012-13 to 99% in 2013-14. The drop-out rate has also decreased substantially from 18% to 1% during the year. Gender wise comparison of Survival Rate to Grade V for the years 2012-13 and 2013-14 is depicted in Figure 3. Survival Rate from Grade 1 to 5 provides useful information on quality of education in schools and efficiency of the education system in an area. Current trend of Survival Rate shows that the quality of education in the ICT is far better than other provinces and areas. However still more efforts are required by the Federal Directorate of Education in order to further increase quality of education in public sector schools of ICT.

The enrolment in Basic Education Community Schools (BECS) has decreased substantially from 12,672 in 2012-13 to 10,614 in 2013-14 – a decline of 16% in one year. There is a need to adopt the approach and strategy of Non-formal education in the region with a view to reach out of school children and to achieve the target.
During the year, no new primary schools were opened in the region; however, 61 new classrooms were constructed in the existing schools to expand access in the public sector.

The targets envisaged in the NPA for 2012-13 and 2013-14 compared with actual achievements during same years can be seen in the following Table. It can be observed that the gender gap has increased during 2013-14. The NER of boys increased from 67% in 2012-13 to 71% in 2013-14, while NER of girls has increased only one percent in points, from 76% to 77%. This shows that the gender parity index is decreasing. In other words, growth in the enrollment of boys over the year was higher as compared to the girls.

### Table ICT. 1: Targets of NPA and Achievements of ICT for the years 2012-13 and 2013-14

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>NER NPA</th>
<th>NER Actual</th>
<th>OOSC NPA</th>
<th>OOSC Actual</th>
<th>Missing Targets of OOSC</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2012-13</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>70%</td>
<td>67%</td>
<td>23,286</td>
<td>25,426</td>
<td>2,140</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>74%</td>
<td>76%</td>
<td>18,100</td>
<td>16,733</td>
<td>+1,367</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013-14</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>78%</td>
<td>71%</td>
<td>17,494</td>
<td>22,695</td>
<td>5,201</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>82%</td>
<td>77%</td>
<td>12,762</td>
<td>16,599</td>
<td>3,837</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**How ICT Has Taken-up the NPA?**

During annual progress review meeting on implementation of National Plan of Action to Accelerate Education-Related MDGs with education managers and policy makers of the Federal Directorate of Education, ICT, and other stakeholders, it was stated that in the follow up of NPA the following initiatives have been taken during 2012-13 and 2013-14:

- Enrollment Campaign in 2013
- Periodic Teacher Trainings
- Survey of Out of School Children (OOSC) in ICT during 2014
- New Admission Policy, with important feature of No admission Refusal
- Promulgation of Free and Compulsory Education Act 2012

**Key Challenges**

Federal Directorate of Education of ICT faced following key challenges during the implementation of NPA.

- Non availability of funds and other resources
- Shortage of Science Teachers
- Poor condition of Schools infrastructure and physical facilities
- Ineffective communication/coordination between stakeholders

**Steps required for accelerating progress towards the achievement of NPA targets**

According to the data, ICT is still lagging behind the set targets of NPA. But these targets are still achievable if the following steps are taken on emergency basis, as recommended during annual progress review meeting.
• Creation of conducive learning environment in schools through development of infrastructure and provision of missing facilities.
• Instituting effective communication/coordination mechanism between different tiers of FDE, relevant Ministries, and stakeholders
• Focusing on expanding access and improving quality of Early Childhood Education (ECE) in government schools through introduction of activity based learning to improve enrollment and retention
• Rationalization of resources according to the needs
• Provision of transport and financial benefits to teachers and students in hard areas

Strategy wise details of implementation of National Plan of Action

Strategy a: Enrolment of new students in existing schools (under-utilized/closed schools) (50% to 60% of new enrolment)

According to the NPA, under the strategy of enrolling new students in existing schools, a total number of 26,335 new students were to be enrolled in primary classes in ICT during 2013-16. Of these, 89% were to be enrolled in public formal schools. Private schools were estimated to absorb rest of the 11% of out of school children. It was planned that no new children will be enrolled in the exiting Non-formal schools due to space constraints.

For the year 2013-14, 8,717 out-of-school children were planned to be enrolled in the existing schools under ‘strategy a’ of the plan. The sector wise distribution of 8,717 children is shown in following table:

Table ICT.2: Number of OOSC children to be enrolled in existing schools in ICT under Strategy a(30% of new enrolment)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sector</th>
<th>No. of Children</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Public sector formal schools</td>
<td>7,264</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public sector Non-formal and feeder schools</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Private Sector Schools</td>
<td>1,453</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deeni Madaris &amp; Others</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total Children</strong></td>
<td><strong>8,717</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Of 7,264 out-of-school children to be enrolled in existing public formal schools, only 1,776 children were enrolled during the year 2013-14 – public sector managed to achieve only 24% of the set target. The enrolment in public sector Non-formal schools has decreased substantially from 2012-13 to 2013-14. However, there was no plan to enroll new students in the Non-formal institutions due to space constraints. Private schools managed to enroll 2,840 new students which is almost double of the set targets. Other public formal schools (APS, OPF etc.) are also playing a significant role in reducing out-of-school children in the ICT. Overall, 5,492 new students were enrolled in the existing institutions working under different sub sectors of education in ICT –76% of targets set under this strategy has been achieved. The public sector, private sector and Deeni Madaris are contributing to some extent in reducing out-of-school children in ICT; however, there is a need to enhance their capacity to enroll
more out-of-school children into the Non-formal system of education. The Non-formal education sector is one of the most important strategies of modern era education system which serves as an effective tool to reach out disadvantaged groups and makes the learning opportunities more accessible and cost effective. Nevertheless, in ICT the non-formal education system is not performing as per requirements. The government should pay special attention to this approach for expanding educational opportunities to the children who cannot attend formal schools due to different reasons.

Considering the current progress towards strategy a of the plan, the targets for the remaining two years of the plan should be revised by equally dividing the shortfall of current year into next two years.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>2014-15</th>
<th>2015-16</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Formal Public Schools</td>
<td>11,676</td>
<td>9,984</td>
<td>21,658</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-Formal Public and Feeder Schools</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Private Schools</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deeni Madaris</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>11,676</td>
<td>9,984</td>
<td>21,658</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Way Forward**

During the Annual Progress Review Meeting regarding Implementation of NPA, the following actions were recommended in order to achieve 100% targets of this strategy:

- Rationalization & Placing of Teachers according to the needs
- Provision of transport to staff and students
- Special incentives as hard area allowance to staff and stipend to the students

**Strategy b: Enrolment of new students in formal schools through provision of an additional classroom (in 15% of existing schools)**

This strategy of the Plan is based on the provision of an additional classroom with a teacher in existing public institutions. Under this strategy, ICT had committed to provide one additional classroom in 89 existing public schools to accommodate 2,679 new out of school children during 2013-16. All these classrooms are to be constructed for the year 2014-15. There was no plan for provision of additional classrooms during 2013-14. It has been observed from the data that 61 new classrooms were constructed in the existing schools. These classrooms will be ready for use during 2014-15.

**Way Forward**

During the Annual Progress Review Meeting regarding Implementation of NPA, the following recommendations were put forth in order to achieve 100% targets of this strategy:

- Coordination between all stakeholders should be enhanced
A stronger mechanism for Monitoring and Evaluation should be put in place.

Strategy c: Enrolment of children in new schools (35-40% of all new enrolments)

It is the most expensive strategy of the Plan under which 35-40% of total out-of-school children will be enrolled by establishing new Non-formal and Feeder schools in the region. Under this strategy, the Plan envisaged to enroll 2,906 out-of-school children in 97 new Non-formal schools, and 2,906 in 97 new Feeder schools during 2013-14. The distribution of opening of new NFE schools in 2013-14 is reflected in following table:

**Table ICT.4  Targets of Strategy c for ICT (2013-14)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sector</th>
<th>Number of new schools to be opened</th>
<th>Children to be enrolled in new school</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Formal primary school</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-formal primary schools</td>
<td>97</td>
<td>2,906</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Feed schools (grade I-III)</td>
<td>97</td>
<td>2,906</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>194</td>
<td>5,812</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Evidence shows that no new Non-formal and Feeder schools were opened in the region. Instead, both number of and enrolment in Basic Education Community Schools (BECS) in ICT have declined. During progress review meeting regarding implementation of NPA, it was pointed out that the Federal Directorate of Education took the following steps to engage community and mobilize other resources for the implementation of this strategy:

- SMCs were supported financially to achieve the targets
- Engagement of staff on temporary basis
- Special enrollment campaign

However; the following challenges were faced by the ICT for the implementation of this strategy:

- Non-availability of adequate budget
- Non-availability of regular staff
- Lack of coordination among different tiers of FDE, relevant Ministries and stakeholders

In the light of current status, the targets for the next two years of the plan should be revised by equally dividing the 2013-14 shortfall and adding into next two years according as per details given in the following Table:

**Table ICT.5 : Revised Targets of Strategy c for ICT**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>2014-15</th>
<th>2015-16</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Children to be enrolled in new formal schools</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of new formal schools to be opened</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Children to be enrolled in new Non-Formal schools</td>
<td>5,025</td>
<td>4,349</td>
<td>9,374</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of new Non-Formal schools to be opened</td>
<td>167</td>
<td>146</td>
<td>313</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Children to be enrolled in new Feeder schools</td>
<td>5,025</td>
<td>4,349</td>
<td>9,374</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of new Feeder schools to be opened</td>
<td>167</td>
<td>146</td>
<td>313</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Way Forward

During the Annual Progress Review Meeting regarding Implementation of NPA, the following recommendations were made in order to achieve 100% targets of this strategy:

- Budget should be provided for furniture, posts etc.
- Improving coordination and close liaison between Deeni Madaris, FDE, and Private Schools etc

Strategy d: Targeted Incentives for access and retention for children from disadvantaged groups (15% of all enrolments)

It is stated in the ICT chapter of NPA under strategy d “of all primary enrolments (old and new), 15% of the students will be provided incentives for access and retention in primary schools. In ICT, 77,347 children will be targeted and provided incentives (equivalent to Rs. 3,000 per child) at a cost of Rs. 232million” (Page 112)

Under this strategy, Rs. 68 million were planned to be distributed among 22,645 needy students during school year 2013-14. Currently, the Federal Directorate of Education is providing free textbooks to students and no fees are charged. However uniform and stationary costs continue to be borne by the parents. Where feasible, the free transport facility has been provided to the students, mostly in urban areas. The strategy is not fully implemented in the region due to lack of financial resources.

Way Forward

During the Annual Progress Review Meeting regarding Implementation of NPA, the following actions were proposed in order to achieve 100% targets of this strategy:

- Educational Insurance for girls
- Vocational Scholarships
- Free provision of uniform and stationary
- Incentives/Awards to maximum number of schools showing higher retention of students
- Polite behaviour of teaching staff
- Voluntary contribution of Head teachers

Conclusion and Recommendations

Evidence reviewed in this part of the report demonstrates progress towards four innovative strategies adopted in the NPA 2013-16. It is clear from the progress reviewed that ICT has not achieved the targets envisaged in the NPA for the year 2013-14. A nominal increase of 3% in enrolment rate has been observed during 2013-14 but this is not enough to meet the targets.
The weakest area identified during the progress review process was the Non-formal education in the ICT. The Federal Directorate of Education of ICT should pay more attention on Non-formal education to cater to the learning needs of over 40,000 out of school children of age 5-9 living in Islamabad Capital Territory.

The main reason for the shortfall identified during the process was lack of financial resources for the implementation of four strategies of the Plan. Another reason is lack or non-existence of coordination and communication mechanisms within the Federal Directorate of Education and among the other concerned departments and Ministries, including Finance and Planning.

Although an enrolment campaign was launched to enroll new children, however, to make this campaign successful a need assessment survey should be conducted. These need assessment surveys should identify the exact areas where schools have the capacity to enroll more students and there is enough population of 5-9 age group children in the area who are not going to school.

It is also evident that we will only be able to achieve the goal of quality education for all through pro-equity programs and bridging the gaps in education to reach vulnerable and excluded children and it is only possible if we identify that group.

The EMIS Cell should be strengthened by providing all the required human, financial, and material resources (Man, Money and Machinery) to cater to all the data needs for educational planning and policy making. The EMIS should not only maintain the educational statistics but also finance and population related data. The decisions regarding opening of new schools, construction of classrooms, provision of physical facilities, hiring of new teachers should be supported by EMIS database. The data related to all educational institutions working in the ICT (public, private, Deeni Madaris, Non-formal etc.) should be maintained under one umbrella i.e. EMIS.

By developing ECCE programmes, the functioning of primary schools can be improved through more timely entry of younger children into school system and less grade repetition, thus allowing additional enrolment.